Square and Round: 
Negotiating “Idealism” in (East Asian) Cultural History

History 310
Spring 2006
Tuesdays 7:00-11:00

Robert André LaFleur
MI 111
363-2144
lafleur@beloit.edu

Office Hours
Tuesday 3:00-4:00
Thursday 5:00-7:00
...or by appointment.

Required Books
Bateson, Gregory. Naven.
Beakley, Brian. The Philosophy of Mind.
Cavell, Stanley. Must We Mean What We Say?
Chalmers, David, The Conscious Mind
Dennett, Daniel. Consciousness Explained.
Eco, Umberto. Kant and the Platypus.
Feld, Steven. Sound and Sentiment.
Kant, Immanuel. Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View
Lévi-Strauss, Claude. The Savage Mind.
Lienhardt, Godfrey. Divinity and Experience.
Moore, Henrietta. Anthropology in Theory.
Rosaldo, Michelle. Knowledge and Passion.
Ryle, Gilbert. The Concept of Mind.
Searle, John. The Rediscovery of Mind.

Hacker, Diana. A Pocket Style Manual. (Required in all history courses)

Three lines

A common conception among Chinese thinkers is that heaven is round and earth is square, and that the merging of the two creates a sense of wholeness in the universe. In this seminar, we will discuss the multi-faceted ways in which historians and anthropologists engage seemingly opposed concepts such as “ideal” and “real,” and many related categories. These concepts often lie unexamined in scholarly works, and can create enormous interpretive challenges for readers. For example, historical primers have traditionally encouraged students to “separate the wheat from the chaff” in their source materials, yet such seemingly sound advice is fraught with difficulties that affect arguments about historical action, intention, causation, and significance. We will focus, in particular, on a number of key historical texts that have been used by Chinese, Japanese, and Western interpreters as theoretical foundations for their own historical writing. By examining the manner in which historians have used their own primary sources, we will learn a great deal about historical methodology and the philosophy of history, and develop new paradigms for negotiating the complex terrain of the “ideal” and “real.”
This seminar is intended to introduce key philosophical concepts through the weekly readings and discussions, so that students have the conceptual tools to analyze a work of historiography or ethnography on their own. Each student will choose one such work (topical papers are possible, but they should be discussed with the professor before embarking upon them) and spend the term analyzing it in detail. Students are strongly encouraged to choose a works that they have already studied, so that they can begin analyzing them immediately, rather than spending time getting to know the authors’ arguments. Students will write a seminar paper at the end of the term which contains their analyses of the works they have chosen. The term will end with formal presentations in early May.

**Evaluation**

- Logs and Discussion Notes: 15%
- Thought Papers: 25%
- Seminar Paper: 60%

*Class attendance and participation is expected. More than one absence will significantly affect your grade. Late assignments will be penalized.*

_All coursework is due on May 12, 2006._

**History 310**

**Round and Square**

**Spring 2006**

**Week I** (January 17)

Searle, *Mind: An Introduction*

- Introduction
- A Dozen Problems in the Philosophy of Mind
- The Turn to Materialism
- Arguments Against Materialism
- Consciousness Part I: Consciousness and the Mind-Body Problem
- Consciousness Part II: The Structure of Consciousness and Neurobiology
- Intentionality
- Mental Causation
- Free Will
- The Unconscious and The Explanation of Behavior
- Perception
- The Self
- Epilogue: Philosophy and the Scientific World-View

**Week II** (January 24)

Beakley, *The Philosophy of Mind*

*Part I — The Mind/Body Problem*

- Thomas Hobbes, *Of Sense*
- René Descartes, From *Meditations* II and VI and from *Reply to Objections* II
- George Berkeley, From *The Principles of Human Knowledge*
- John Stuart Mill, Of the Laws of Mind
- Gilbert Ryle, Descartes’ Myth
- U.T. Place, *Is Consciousness a Brain Process?*
- Saul Kripke, From “Identity and Necessity”
- Noam Chomsky, From *Language and the Problem of Knowledge*
- Hilary Putnam, The Nature of Mental States
- Patricia Churchland, Reductionism and Antireductionism in Functionalist Theories of Mind
Ned Block, Troubles with Functionalism
Hilary Putnam, Philosophy and Our Mental Life

Cavell, *Must We Mean What We Say?*
Preface to the Updated Edition of *Must We Mean What We Say?*
Foreword: An Audience for Philosophy
*Must We Mean What We Say?*
The Availability of Wittgenstein’s Later Philosophy
Aesthetic Problems of Modern Philosophy
Austin at Criticism
Ending the Waiting Game: A Reading of Beckett’s *Endgame*
Kierkegaard’s *On Authority and Revelation*
Music Discomposed
A Matter of Meaning It
Knowing and Acknowledging
The Avoidance of Love: A Reading of *King Lear*

**Week III** (January 31)
Beakley, *The Philosophy of Mind*
  **Part II—Mental Causation**
  Plato, From *The Phaedo*
  René Descartes, From *Passions of the Soul*
  Nicolas Malenbranche, From “The Union of Soul and Body”
  Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz, The Nature and Communication of Substances
  Immanuel Kant, The Third Antinomy
  Thomas Henry Huxley, On the Hypothesis That Animals Are Automata
  Donald Davidson, Mental Events
  Jerry Fodor, Making Mind Matter More

Ryle, *The Concept of Mind*
  Introduction: Re-Introducing *The Concept of Mind*
  Introduction
  Descartes’ Myth
  Knowing How and Knowing That
  The Will
  Emotion
  Dispositions and Occurrences
  Self-Knowledge
  Sensation and Observation
  Imagination
  The Intellect
  Psychology

300-word “book choice” for final projects due Wednesday, February 3rd at 5:00 p.m.

**Week IV** (February 7)
Beakley, *The Philosophy of Mind*
  **Part III—Mental Imagery**
  Thomas Aquinas, That the Soul Never Thinks without an Image
  Thomas Hobbes, Of Imagination
  René Descartes, From *Meditation VI* and from *Objection IV and Reply*
  David Hume, Of the Ideas of the Memory and Imagination
  William James, Imagination
  Oswald Külpe, The Modern Psychology of Thinking
  John Watson, Image in Behavior
  Gilbert Ryle, “The Theory of Special Status Pictures” and “Imagining”
  Daniel Dennett, The Nature of Images and the Introspective Trap
  Roger Shepard and Jacqueline Metzler, Mental Rotation of Three-Dimensional Objects
  Stephen Kosslyn, Scanning Visual Mental Images: The First Phase of the Debate
Langer, *Mind: An Essay on Human Feeling*

1 — Problems and Principles
   Feeling
   Idols of the Laboratory
   Prescientific Knowledge

II — The Import of Art
   The Projection of Feeling in Art
   The Artist’s Idea
   A Chapter on Abstraction
   On Living Form in Art and Nature

III — Natura Naturans
   The Act Concept and Its Principal Derivatives
   On Individuation and Involvement
   The Evolution of Acts
   The Growth of Acts

IV — The Great Shift
   On Repertoire and Instinct
   Animal Acts and Ambients
   On Animal Values
   Interpretations
   The Specialization of Man
   Symbols and the Evolution of Mind
   Symbols and the Human World

V — The Moral Structure
   The Spirit-World
   The Dream of Power
   Dream’s Ending: The Tragic Vision
   The Ethnic Balance
   The Breaking

VI — Mathematics and the Reign of Science
   Foreword
   The Open Ambient

*Week V* (February 14)

Beakley, *The Philosophy of Mind*

Part IV — Associationism/Connectionism
   Thomas Hobbes, Of the Consequence or Train of Imaginations
   John Locke, Of the Association of Ideas
   David Hume, Of the Connection or Association of Ideas
   John Stuart Mill, The Principal Investigations of Psychology Characterized
   William James, The Elementary Laws of Association
   James L. McClelland, et al, The Appeal of Parallel Distributing Processing
   Jerry A. Fodor and Zenon W. Pylyshyn, Connectionism and Cognitive Architecture…
   Paul Smolensky, The Constituent Structure of Connectionist Mental States…
   Seymour Papert, On AI or Many?

Dennett, *Consciousness Explained*
   Prelude: How Are Hallucinations Possible?

Part One — Problems and Methods
   Explaining Consciousness
   A Visit to the Phenomenological Garden
   A Method for Phenomenology

Part Two — An Empirical Theory of the Mind
   Multiple Drafts Versus the Cartesian Theater
   Time and Experience
   The Evolution of Consciousness
   How Words Do Things With Us
The Architecture of the Human Mind

Part Three—The Philosophical Problems of Consciousness

Show and Tell
Dismantling the Witness Protection Program
Qualia Disqualified
The Reality of Selves
Consciousness Imagined

Week VI (February 21)

Beakley, The Philosophy of Mind

Part V—Innate Ideas

Plato, From The Meno
René Descartes, From “Comments on a Certain Broadsheet”
John Locke, No Innate Principles in the Mind
Jean Piaget, The Psychogenesis of Knowledge and Its Epistemological Significance
Jerry Fodor, How There Could Be a Private Language and What It Must Be Like
Noam Chomsky, On Cognitive Structures and Their Development: A Reply to Piaget
Hilary Putnam, What is Innate and Why: Comments on the Debate
Noam Chomsky, Discussion of Putnam’s Comments
Jerry A. Fodor, Reply to Putnam

Searle, The Rediscovery of Mind

What’s Wrong With the Philosophy of Mind
The Recent History of Materialism: The Same Mistake Over and Over
Breaking the Hold: Silicon Brains, Conscious Robots, and Other Minds
Consciousness and its Place in Nature
Reduction of the Irreducibility of Consciousness
The Structure of Consciousness: An Introduction
The Unconscious and its Relation to Consciousness
Consciousness, Intentionality, and the Background
The Critique of Cognitive Reason
The Proper Study

Week VII (February 28)

Goodman, Fact, Fiction, and Forecast

The Problem of Counterfactual Conditionals
The Passing of the Possible
The New Riddle of Induction
Prospects for a Theory of Projection

Chalmers, The Conscious Mind

I—Foundations

Two Concepts of Mind
Supervenience and Explanation

II—The Irreducibility of Consciousness

Can Consciousness Be Reductively Explained?
Naturalistic Dualism
The Paradox of Phenomenological Judgment
The Coherence Between Consciousness and Cognition

III—Toward a Theory of Consciousness

Absent Qualia, Fading Qualia, Dancing Qualia
Consciousness and Information: Some Speculations

IV—Applications

Strong Artificial Intelligence
The Interpretation of Quantum Mechanics

“Brainstorming” assignment due Friday, March 3rd at 5:00 p.m.
**Week VIII (March 7) — Spring Break**

**Recommended Reading — Eco, Kant and the Platypus**

- Chapter One  On Being
- Chapter Two  Kant, Peirce, and the Platypus
- Chapter Three  Cognitive Types and Nuclear Content
- Chapter Four  The Platypus Between Dictionary and Encyclopedia
- Chapter Five  Notes on Referring as Contract
- Chapter Six  Iconism and Hypoicon

**Week IX (March 16) — Note: Thursday Meeting**

**Moore, Anthropology in Theory**

*Section I — Culture and Behavior*
- Franz Boas, The Aims of Anthropological Research
- A.L. Kroeber, The Concept of Culture in Science
- Gregory Bateson, Problems and Methods of Approach
- Emile Durkheim, Rules for the Explanation of Social Facts

*Section II — Society and Social Patterns*
- Franz Boas, The Limitations of the Comparative Method of Anthropology
- Edward Sapir, Anthropology and Sociology
- Ruth Benedict, The Individual and the Pattern of Culture

*Section III — Function and Environment*
- Bronislaw Malinowski, The Group and the Individual in Functional Analysis
- Julian Steward, The Concept and Method of Cultural Ecology
- Leslie A. White, Energy and the Evolution of Culture

**Kant, Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View**

*Part One — Anthropological Didactic*
- First Book: On the Cognitive Faculty
- Second Book: On the Feeling of Pleasure and Displeasure
- Third Book: On the Faculty of Desire

*Part Two — Anthropological Characterizations*
- The Character of the Person
- The Character of the Sexes
- The Character of Nations
- On the Character of Races
- On the Character of the Species

1,000-word proposal and bibliography due Sunday March 19th at 5:00 p.m.

**Week X (March 21)**

**Moore, Anthropology in Theory**

*Section IV — Structure and System*
- A.R. Radcliffe-Brown, On Social Structure
- E.R. Leach, Introduction to Political Systems of Highland Burma
- Claude Lévi-Strauss, Social Structure

*Section V — Methods and Objects*
- J.H.M. Beattie, Understanding and Explanation in Social Anthropology
- Ladislav Holy and Milan Stuchlíček, Anthropological Data and Social Reality
- Pierre Bourdieu, Objectification Objectified

*Section VI — Biology and Ontogeny*
- Tim Ingold, Becoming Persons: Consciousness and Sociality in Human Evolution
- Kathleen Gibson, Cusoms and Cultures in Animals and Humans: Neurobiological...
- Christina Toren, Introduction to Mind, Materiality, and History
- A.F. Robertson, The Development of Meaning: Ontogeny and Culture

**Bateson, Naven**

- Methods of Presentation
- The Naven Ceremonies
- The Concepts of Structure and Function

---

6
The Cultural Premises Relevant to the Wau-laua Ceremony
Sorcery and Vengeance
Structural Analysis of the Wau-laua Relationship
The Sociology of Naven
Problems and Methods of Approach
The Ethos of Iatmul Culture: The Men
The Ethos of Iatmul Culture: The Women
Attitudes Toward Death
The Preferred Types
The Ethological Contrast, Competition and Schismogenesis
The Expression of Ethos in Naven
The Eidos of Iatmul Culture
Epilogue 1936
Epilogue 1958

Week XI (March 28)

Moore, Anthropology in Theory
Section VII—Meanings as Objects of Study
Clifford Geertz, Thick Description: Toward and Interpretive Theory of Culture
Alal Asad, Anthropology and the Analysis of Ideology
Roger M. Keesing, Anthropology as an Interpretive Quest

Section VIII—Languages and Method
Claude Lévi-Strauss, Structural Analysis in Linguistics and in Anthropology
Malcom Crick, Ordinary Language and Human Action
Maurice Bloch, Language, Anthropology, and Cognitive Science

Section IX—Thinking and Believing
Rodney Needham, Introduction to Belief, Language, and Experience
Stephen A. Tyler, The Antinomies
Dan Sperber, Anthropology and Psychology: Towards and Epidemiology of Representations

Lienhardt, Divinity and Experience
Part One—Division in the World
Divine Unity and Multiplicity: Clan Activities
Divinity and Experience
Part Two—The Myth of the Spear-Masters
The Control of Experience: Invocation and Prayer
The Control of Experience: Symbolic Action
Burial Alive

Week XII (April 4)

Moore, Anthropology in Theory
Section X—Bodies of Knowledge
Michael Jackson, Knowledge of the Body
Emily Martin, The End of the Body?
Michel Foucault, The Body of the Condemned

Section XI—Coherence and Contingency
Max Weber, Puritanism and the Spirit of Capitalism
Eric Wolf, Introduction to Europe and the People Without History
Jean Comaroff and John Comaroff, Introduction to Of Revelation and Revolution
Donald Donham, Epochal Structures I: Reconstructing Historical Materialism
Pierre Bourdieu, Structures and Habitus
Michel Foucault, Two Lectures

Lévi-Strauss, The Savage Mind
Preface
The Science of the Concrete
The Logic of Totemic Classification
Systems of Transformations
Totem and Caste
Week XIII (April 11)

Moore, Anthropology in Theory
  Section XII—Universalisms and Domain Terms
    Michael Lambeck, Body and Mind in Mind, Body and Mind in Body…
    Sherry B. Ortner, So Is Female to Male as Nature is to Culture?
    Henrietta L. Moore, Global Anxieties: Concept-Metaphors and Pre-theoretical…
  Section XIII—Perspectives and their Logics
    Robert Thornton, The Rhetoric of Ethnographic Holism
    Lila Abu-Lughod, Writing Against Culture
    Marilyn Strathern, Cutting the Network
  Section XIV—Objectivity, Morality, and Truth
    Max Weber, The “Objectivity” of Knowledge in Social Science and Social Policy
    Nancy Scheper-Hughes, The Primacy of the Ethical: Propositions for a Militant…
    Roy D’Andrade, Moral Models in Anthropology
    Melford Spiro, Postmodernist Anthropology, Subjectivity, and Science…

Riesman, Freedom in Fulani Social Life
  The Tawaangal of the Jelgobe
    Climate and Technology
    The Social Organization of Jelgoji
    Fulani Social Structure
    Life in the Wuro: Categories of People and Tasks
    Authority Relations in the Wuro
    Religion
    Pulaaku and Semeende: Fulaniness and Shame
  Life as Lived
    Jelgobe Attitudes toward Life
    Keeping Society Going
    Relations Between People
    How to Resist Others
    Wuro and Ladde: The Village and the Bush

Week XIV (April 18)

Moore, Anthropology in Theory
  Section XV—The Anthropology of Western Modes of Thought
    Oyèrónké Oyeùmí, The Invention of Women
    Vivek Dhareshwar, Valorizing the Present: Orientalism, Postcoloniality…
    Eduardo Viveiros de Castro, Cosmological Deixis and Amerindian Perspectivism
  Section XIV—(Re)defining Objects of Inquiry
    Jean E. Jackson, Culture, Genuine and Spurious: The Politics of Indianness…
    Marc Augé, The Near and the Elsewhere
    Bruno Latour, Relativism

Rosaldo, Knowledge and Passion
  The Ilongots
  Knowledge, passion, and the heart
  Knowledge, identity, and order in an egalitarian world
  Horticulture, hunting, and the ‘height’ of men’s hearts
  Headhunting: a tale of “fathers,” “brothers,” and “sons”
  Negotiating anger: oratory and the knowledge of adults
  Conclusion: Self and social life
Week XV (April 25)
Moore, Anthropology in Theory

Section XVII—Imagining Methodologies and Meta-things
Akhil Gupta and James Ferguson, Beyond "Culture": Space, Indentity…
George E. Marcuse, What is at Stake—and is not—in the Idea and Practice…
Arjun Appadurai, Grassroots Globalization and The Research Imagination

Feld, Sound and Sentiment
Introduction
The Boy Who Became a Muni Bird
To You They are Birds, to Me They Are Voices in the Forest
Weeping That Moves Women to Song
The Poetics of Loss and Abandonment
Song That Moves Men to Tears
In the Form of a Bird: Kaluli Aesthetics

3,000-word “lead” due Friday April 28th at 5:00 p.m.

Final Papers Due by 5:00 p.m. on Friday, May 12th at 5:00 p.m.