Environmental Activism on Campus
Fall 2015

Projects developed and implemented by students in POLS 255 Global Political Ecology in Fall 2015

Instructor: Pablo Toral
Table of contents.

1-Implementing a Food Recovery Network at Beloit College,
   Sarah Mueller, Andreina Patilliet, Fionn Shields.................................................................3
2-Switching Beloit College’s Laundry Facilities to Greener Washers and Dryers,
   Jeremy Jessin, Wilson Neal, Nissa Parker..................................................................................32
3-Bringing TerraCycle to Bon Appetit Catering,
   Dylan Hackler, Rose Richard....................................................................................................43
4-Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness: Revolving Loan Mechanism,
   Rosa Ennison, Meg Kowta, Shengyuan Lu, Samantha Schonberger, Natalie Steen,
   Aliza Tresser..............................................................................................................................58
5-Case Studies Outlining the Context of Current Development Projects in Guatemala
   Benjamin Scheel, Gabriel Quetell, Fabiola Candela Hernandez, Riku Takahashi........88
6-Using Green Deicers on Campus: The Cheese Brine Project,
   Max DeMay, Eva Fellows, Cook Stover, Jackson Stucker......................................................162
Environmental Activism Project Report

Implementing a Food Recovery Network at Beloit College

Sarah Mueller, Andreina Patilliet, and Fionn Shields
POLS 255 Global Political Ecology: Fall 2015
Table of Contents

The Problem ........................................... Page 3
Goals ..................................................... Page 4
Strategies- Four Elements of Approach .......... Page 4
Challenges ............................................. Page 5
Accomplishments ..................................... Page 7
Future Advice ......................................... Page 8
Conclusion ............................................. Page 8
Bibliography ........................................... Page 9
Appendix ................................................ Page 10
Introduction

Currently Beloit College and Bon Appetit do not take part in repurposing food leftovers from the Commons dining hall or catered events. Food leftovers are scraps, or trays of food that were intended for human consumption, but are uneaten. Food leftovers are frequently thrown away after dinner is finished or an event concludes. The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has published a Food Recovery Hierarchy (Appendix A) which indicates which methods are preferred to manage food leftovers and eliminate waste. The hierarchy values feeding hungry people above sending food leftovers to the landfill. We believe it is important that Beloit College and Bon Appetit jointly tackle the problem of excessive food leftovers by sending leftovers to the local food pantry Caritas, and we therefore dedicated our project to reconnecting Beloit College and Caritas through creating the framework for an on campus organization to take over and lead the Food Recovery Network at Beloit College for years to come. Sustainable development is defined as “the development that meets the needs of present generations without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs”\(^1\), for the purpose of this project sustainability is defined as the continuing efforts of food recovery and related projects through this semester and into future semesters.

The Problem

Original Problem - The Sustainability Office along with the Liberal Arts in Practice Center identified a large amount of waste originating from catered events. For example, at a department staff lunch catered by Bon Appetit, it was recorded that approximately $300 of food was thrown away after the event.\(^2\) Therefore, these offices tasked us with designing and implementing a program for food recovery from catered events.

New Problem - After learning that our original goal was illegal if carried out, as described in the challenges section, we learned that at the Commons dining hall there is a substantial amount of food waste as well. It is estimated that food waste is the largest component to our solid waste, contributing approximately 12% to Beloit College’s overall waste.\(^3\) Even with the addition of a pulper and dehydrator we still waste food that could be repurposed for families who are food insecure. Therefore, the new problem our activism project was focused on was reducing the amount of food leftovers, food that despite still being edible was not going to be eaten by students from the Beloit College Commons dining hall, being thrown out by the college.

---

\(^1\) Beloit College Sustainability Plan, 4.
\(^2\) Carol Wickersham, Caritas. September, 15, 2015.
\(^3\) Dana Gunders, “Wasted: How America Is Losing up to 40% of Its Food from Farm to Fork to Landfill.” 2012.
Goals

Original Goal - The Sustainability Office at Beloit College noticed a large amount of food waste from catered events on campus. The office proposed the idea to us to set up a Food Recovery Network between catered events, ranging from faculty and staff lunches to homecoming and graduation, that would package and deliver the food leftovers to Caritas, a local food pantry. Food leftovers are scraps, or trays of food that were intended for human consumption, but instead are thrown away because there was not enough student demand for the specific meal and there is no alternative place to serve the food. Our team set out to complete this project, however, legal hurdles arose, which halted our progress. We could not challenge the legal precedence and had to re-envision our project.

New Goal - We learned that at Beloit there is no club or organization that currently spearheads the Food Recovery Network and therefore we set out to create an institutionally sustainable Food Recovery Network run by an existing organization. Institutionally sustainable means that the responsibility for this project would not fall on one or two individuals, rather a long standing institution would bear the burden ensuring that the Food Recovery Network would survive long after we leave Beloit College.

Strategies

Four Elements of Approach

Politics - In order to create an alliances that would help us meet the goals of our project and garner support from our key actors and campus, we first had to effectively research and understand each organization involved. We began by contacting the staff in charged of Sustainability Office, the staff of Beloit College Bon Appetite, the staff of Caritas, and The Food Recovery Network staff. As the project developed and the initial goal changed, we also contacted Interfraternity Panhellenic Counsel (IFPC). As a result of researching each key actor and finding ways to work with all the key actors as well as with the laws and framework already in place, we were able to localize the problem and address it with the compliance from all parties.

Economics - Without any previous concrete data on the cost of packaging and storing leftover food we set out to determine the cost of our proposed plan, and to calculate the benefits, if any, of our proposed plan. We reached out to the staff at Beloit’s Bon Appetit and did research on the cost of packaging and storing food. We also reached out the enrichment center for information on fund resources to provide IFPC for transportation. A clear understanding of the economic aspect of our proposed plan gives us strong grounds for the success of our plan. Half way through the project, after our meeting with the midwest Bon Appetit fellow, we were given the first concrete set of data (Appendix E), which gave us a foundation to work from.

---

4 Carol Wickersham, Caritas. September, 15, 2015.
Science - The Food Recovery Hierarchy (appendix A) defines which actions should be taken with food waste created in the Food Supply Chain. In this hierarchy, feeding the hungry is preferred over sending food waste to the landfill. Even with the new implementation of the use of the pulper and dehydrator to reduce leftover food waste, Beloit College was not complying with the EPA hierarchy. This means that Beloit College students and administration were not taking appropriate actions to help ameliorate the harmful effects that food waste can have on the environment such as; i) waste of scares energy resources that go into producing food, and ii) contribution to landfill greenhouse gas emissions. Therefore, finding an alternative use to food leftover decreases the burden of Beloit College campus on the environment. This idea was one of the arguments for the implementation of our proposal. We reached out to the Midwest Bon Appetit fellow to help us address the science behind food waste, as Bon Apetite is also very concerned about reducing their carbon footprint and their effects on the environment.

Morality - Sending leftover food to a local food shelf, helps prevent food insecurity in the Beloit community, which puts our project on the moral high ground when compared to the current action of throwing out the leftovers. The moral high ground stems from the social injustice that is created when we throw away food because we have too much, when others within our community cannot afford 3 meals each day. Establishing a connection between the dining hall and Caritas through the help of IFPC would insure that our project would continue semester after semester and not stop after a couple semester as it had been done in the past. By insuring a continuation of this project, we can build a strong relationship between the campus and the Beloit community. Making sure the campus community is aware of the negative implications of food waste both from a scientific and moral way is something we aim to address with the help of the Food Recovery Network Midwest fellow.

Challenges

Legal Challenges - As mentioned in the goals section, our original goal was to work with the food leftovers solely from catered events on campus. However, we spoke with Bon Appetit and we were told that because food at catered events is left unrefrigerated for extended periods of time, they cannot donate the food to Caritas due to liability issues. Bon Appetit is legally bound to certain procedures and because of the idea of supremacy and we were not in a position to challenge this law. The idea of supremacy states that decisions made from the top of the pyramid will dictate over all other levels beneath.5 Because the food donation laws are at the national level, Bon Appetit at the Beloit location must abide by those guidelines.

Changing Customs - We also learned that Bon Appetit as a company is not responsible for the amount of food leftovers at catered events. Catered events are contracted by the school or other outside organizations and Bon Appetit must deliver the amount of food ordered. At certain events, the coordinators purposely order extra food to make the table look full whether you are the first or last person to eat. In a situation such as this one, it is the event coordinators who are responsible for the food leftovers. Our

team wanted to focus on targeting these individuals with marketing campaigns and pledges to order less food, however, we understood the significant power of de facto law. De facto refers to the customs that a certain community abides by; although the event coordinators could order less food, the custom is to order more than necessary and because this is the way it has always been done, it will be extremely difficult to change their minds. Because we were aware of time constraints, we decided that the cultural laws at Beloit College were simply too large of a hurdle to tackle in 3 months.

Many Key Actors - This project dealt with many different actors: Bon Appetit at Beloit College, National Bon Appetit, Beloit College (Sustainability office), Food Recovery Network, and Caritas. Each of these organizations has its own structures of governance. As O’Neill points out, governance is the decision making process taken by each actor. We were working with five different actors and each had a different governance structure; we had to change how we approach the topics depending on which actor we were talking with because each had a different opinion and strategy to combatting food waste and repurposing the food to Caritas. We combatted this challenge by using the idea of political convergence. Political convergence means that actors will be more successful at combating problems if there is issue linkage between politically salient topics. In the case of Food Recovery there is large overlap between the issues: lessening food waste decreases Beloit College’s carbon footprint (something the college has shown significant interest in the Sustainability Plan), Bon Appetit would receive an image boost and it is economically beneficial to send food to Caritas, and Caritas wants to relieve food insecurity which is done through more food donations. Given the three different but overlapping goals, there is a high degree of political convergence and we used this to our advantage to get all the actors working on the same page.

Situational Challenges - Each individual actor’s schedule posed its own issues, however, we ran into a major challenge at the end of our project. We intended to do a trial run, so that we could catch any loose ends before handing the task over to IFPC, however, our contact at Caritas had a family emergency arise before we were able to schedule a time and will be out of the office until after the semester ends. This was a very unfortunate situation, however, we dealt with it by putting all of our energy into creating a document that IFPC could follow starting next semester (Appendix B).

---

Accomplishments

Illegality of Food Donation - The first accomplishment came the first week we were given the project when we found out that catered food that has been sitting out for more than two hours can not be donated because of liability reasons. We were also told that trays of cheese, fruits, and other food items that we wrapped and unopened during catering events on campus were already being re-purposed.

Implementation of Proposal to IFPC - Getting the IFPC board to not only consider but also implement our proposal was a great step for our project as it solved the main reason why the connection between Beloit’s dining hall and Caritas was lost after a couple semester. Having the IFPC board take this project as part of their philanthropic events insures that IFPC will be a concrete key point between the college and Caritas. We provided them with a framework to follow in coming semesters to successfully implement food recoveries to Caritas (Appendix B). This was a success because we were able to link the issues of food recovery and volunteer hours. These two ideas may seem really separate at face value, however, through issue linkage we were able to create a sustainable infrastructure to take on our project.

Campus Awareness of the Food Recovery Network and Bon Appetite Position - Through contacting and meeting with the Midwest Bon Appetit coordinator and exchanging emails with the Midwest Food Recovery Network coordinator, we were able combat the lack of awareness on campus about the Food Recovery Network. After our meeting and exchange of emails there were poster put up in the commons dining hall informing students about the Food Recovery Networks and actions that Bon Apetite is taking to minimize food waste. In future semesters there will be stronger effort to make the campus aware of the program, as there was no time this semester for us to tackle that side of the project. After meeting with the Midwest Bon Appetit coordinator, Bon Apetite and the Sustainability Office created a paid position called "Sustainability Change Agents" (Appendix C) for not only the collecting, packaging, and storing of leftover food to be taken to Caritas, but also for a numerous of other sustainable projects around campus. This integration of Food Recovery into a paid position shows that we accomplished political convergence of food waste as a campus. Bon Appetit and Beloit College both see food waste as a serious issue and have aligned their values into one paid position. This could be extremely beneficial as it will streamline communication between both actors and allow for increased efficiency.

Connected with the National Food Recovery Network - We were in contact the national coordinator for the Food Recovery Network, throughout the semester and were able to exchange ideas with, get information from, and create an advertising campaign with during the course of this project (Appendix D). We were able to take her ideas from other Food Recovery sites across the nation and adapt them to Beloit College and what would work best given our unique culture. This connection allowed for the idea of subsidiarity to take place, where we were able to adapt our decision making at an extremely local level, which allowed us to take into account our regional differences and implement projects and advertising that would be successful on Beloit College’s campus.

Future Advice
Develop Chain of Communication with Beloit College and Bon Appetit - The biggest issue that we had at the beginning of the project was figuring out who to talk to. There was no clear person to talk to at the college or within Bon Appetit to talk to about the leftovers. For the future success of this project, having someone in the college or within Bon Appetit who is aware of the leftovers and can coordinate the trips to Caritas would be a huge help. Not having any concrete data from previous food recovery runs was also a great hurdle, as we have no foundation to start from.

Trial Run - Prior to finalizing our proposal to IFPC, our group had planned on doing a trial of bringing the leftovers from Commons to Caritas. However, we were unable to due to our contact at Caritas having to take a leave due to personal matters. If we had been able to do this trial, we would have been able to have a better idea of how the project worked, so our final proposal would have been stronger. We would recommend that if another group did this project in the future that they do a trial donation run.

Bring Awareness to Campus - The major thing that the group would have done differently if we redid this project would be to raise awareness on campus. By hosting a talk and bringing a Food Recovery Network staff to campus to talk to bring awareness to campus we would have increased the visibility of the project as well as increasing the support for the project. For another group doing this project in the future, gaining increased visibility on campus would be really helpful.

Conclusion

Over the course of three months, we were able to devise and implement a plan to address our revised problem, which was overall a success. We were able to align the key actors values to create a framework for food recovery into the future, and found a willing organization (IFPC) to spearhead the recoveries for now on. We also saw raised awareness on campus as shown through the new Sustainability Change Agent position that will deal primarily with food recovery. Despite the challenges that were thrown our way, we believe food recovery is something that Beloit College students and staff should be invested in as it not only helps the environment, but also the community around us. There is still more work to be done, however, we are confident that with the new paying jobs for this type of work and the invested students through IFPC that this work will continue to be done and we have created a strong framework for the future.
Bibliography


Appendices

A. EPA Food Recovery Hierarchy
B. **Proposal to IFPC**

Food Recovery at Beloit College  
Spearheaded by IFPC

1. **Obtain, or recover from previous leadership:**
   - Reusable or disposable containers (depending on what Caritas and Bon Appetit can process) to store and transport recovered food
   - Scale to weigh the recovered food
   - Thermometer to take the temperature of recovered food

2. **Contact Bon Apetit and Caritas to set up times for food recovery**
   - Donna Ambrose: director of Caritas food shelf, [email](mailto:dma@att.net)
   - Ken Hnilo manager at Bon Appetit, [email](mailto:ken.hnilo@cafebonappetit.com), but it is best to go directly into Commons to set up the best times for students to come package food.
   - Sustainability Office: Food Change Agents, [email](mailto:chapmanl@beloit.edu)

**Sample Emails:**

Dear Donna,
My name is, [insert name], and I am contacting you on behalf of the Interfraternal Panhellenic Counsel at Beloit College. We run the Food Recovery Network here at Beloit and in the past we have brought the recovered food to Caritas. As we begin our semester we are contacting you to see what times would work best for you for food to be brought to Caritas. We are hoping to make two trips each week, and we are currently thinking that [give three/four days and times that could work]. Which, if any, of these days and times work for you? We can be flexible, but we wanted to give you an idea of what would work for us.
Thank you and we look forward to working with you,
[insert name]

Send this email/Go talk with Ken after times have been discussed with Caritas

Dear Ken,
My name is, [insert name], and I am contacting you on behalf of the Interfraternal Panhellenic Counsel at Beloit College. We have taken charge of the Food Recovery Network, and are looking to set up times to come and get the food from Commons. We will be making two trips each week and have spoken with Caritas about what times would work best for them. Currently, we were thinking of [insert days and times discussed with Caritas]. Would these days and times work for you? Please let us know.
Thank you
[insert name]
Dear Lindsay,
My name is, [insert name], and I am contacting you on behalf of the Interfraternal Panhellenic Counsel at Beloit College. We have taken charge of the Food Recovery Network, and are looking for the contact information of the Sustainability Change Agents for Food at Beloit so we can coordinate food pickup and delivery with Caritas. If you wouldn’t mind letting us know so we can begin our food recoveries as soon as possible.
Thanks,
[insert name]

3. Assign two Greek houses per month to be the volunteers and one FRN point person per Greek house, with the primary responsibility of ensuring at least 3 student volunteers per recovery
   · Distribute assignments one month prior to each recovery (ie, a greek house in charge of a recovery to occur on May 1st must be notified by at least April 1st)
   · For the fall semester, recoveries starting in September, and for spring recoveries starting in February.

4. Update the volunteer spreadsheet to reflect the correct days and times for sign up.
   · See excel spreadsheet, entitled IFPC Food Recovery Network

5. Check weekly that the food recovery is taking place and stay in touch with Ken and Donna to make sure no changes need to occur.

6. Track weights from each recovery and follow Food Recovery guidelines for submitting weights from each recovery
C. Job description for new position

SUSTAINABILITY CHANGE AGENTS

What are Change Agents? Click here for full job description

Teams: Energy  Waste  Food  Communications

What are Sustainability Change Agents?

In an effort to expand opportunities for meaningful student involvement in sustainability efforts on campus, the Sustainability Office has created the Sustainability Change Agent program. Change Agents are students who are passionate about sustainability and eager to research and implement programs, campaigns, and technologies to heighten Beloit College Sustainability. Teams of 2-5 Change Agents will work closely together and be led by a student Change Leader in specific topic areas. Change Leaders meet together weekly with the Sustainability Coordinator and Sustainability Hall Director to review progress and share ideas.

We are hiring for Spring 2016! Please read the below job descriptions for Change Agent positions and if interested in becoming an Agent, please fill out the application form.

Apply Here to be an agent in Spring 2016!

We are also looking for a student sustainability change leader, for the food group.

Food Change Leader Job Description  Apply to be a Sustainability Change Leader

Food:

Research, promote, and implement food sourcing, food waste, and food choice endeavors in close coordination with Bon Appetit staff.

Projects include, but are not limited to:

- Regular food waste tracking, soil amendment amounts tracking
- Regular food donation tracking and to which community organizations
- Food waste reduction competitions
- Facilitating Bon Appetit sponsored events such as movie screenings, food tastings, etc.
- Informing students about commitments to efforts like “Green Monday” “meatless Monday, and others.”
D. Possible Postering Campaign

Food Recovery Network (FRN) is a non-profit organization whose mission is to unite students at colleges and universities to fight food waste and hunger by recovering food from their campuses and surrounding communities that would otherwise go to waste and donating it to people in need.

See how easy it is!

- Feed hungry people while addressing food waste and improving sustainability on your campus. In the United States, 1 in 7 households suffers from food insecurity while 40% of our food is wasted.
- Work with a representative from the FRN National Office every step of the way, from your first info session to celebrating your 50th recovery and beyond!

Gain Leadership Experience!

- Improve your communication and public speaking skills.
- Work with industry professionals, from dining hall and restaurant administrators to non-profit managers.
- Get the campus organizing experience that many future endeavors and employers require.
- Gain management skills by recruiting, training, managing and organizing volunteers.

Make National Connections and Participate in Conferences!

- Join the large social network of other FRN leaders from across the country.
- Attend one regional and one national conference each year, and take advantage of student and industry professional networking opportunities as well as leadership education and professional development opportunities.

Grow Future Career Possibilities!

- Gain access to exciting career opportunities through the experience and contacts you make locally and nationally!
- Your experience will make you a great candidate for the internship and career opportunities the FRN national office may offer in the future!

Interested? Fill out an application at foodrecoverynetwork.org to get started!
FIGHTING WASTE, FEEDING PEOPLE

50 MILLION AMERICANS ARE FOOD INSECURE WHILE 40% OF OUR FOOD IS WASTED
HELP RECOVER FOOD FROM OUR COMMUNITY AND DONATE IT TO HUNGRY AMERICANS

GET INVOLVED TODAY!

COME TO AN INFORMATIONAL MEETING:

QUESTIONS?! CONTACT:
Colleges Throw Away Extra Food Amounting To An Estimated 22 Million Pounds Every Year.

Get Involved With Food Recovery Network!

40% of Food Goes To Waste While 1 in 6 Americans Are Hungry Every Day.

What Is The Item Filling Up America’s Landfills?

Get Involved With Food Recovery Network!

#1 FOOD WASTE
## E. Old Food Recovery Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Timestamp</th>
<th>Today’s Date</th>
<th>Time Start - Finish</th>
<th>Where was the food donated from?</th>
<th>Where was the food donated to?</th>
<th>Volunteers Attending</th>
<th>Type of foods recovering</th>
<th>Total recovered (lbs)</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9/25/2014 11:02:45</td>
<td>09-12-2014</td>
<td>12:30 - 15:30</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Supervisor and Transportation Alex Cheong - Food Packing Nadia Hecker O’Brien - Food Packing Laura Savage - Food Packing</td>
<td>Ears of corn, tapioca, pork loin, black bean soup, turkey</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>This was for the week of September 8 - September 13, our first week of recovery. It was challenging on the first day to figure out the procedure, as everyone was equally confused, but it ended up working out well and we are all happy with the amount of food donated in the first week.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/8/2014 11:57:24</td>
<td>10-03-2014</td>
<td>07:30 - 08:15</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Coordinator Alex Cheong - Food Packing Lauren Heagerty - Food Packing</td>
<td>Potato Mushroom Curry Chicken Paprikash Turkey Beans and Rice</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>We worked with a new staff member from Commons and had to explain the process to her, which took a while, but it worked out without any major problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/8/2014 12:00:00</td>
<td>10-06-2014</td>
<td>07:30 - 08:10</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Coordinator Alex Cheong - Food Pack</td>
<td>Mashed Potatoes Chicken Chikpea Pork Stew Mexican Spiced Beef</td>
<td>71</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/9/2014 12:01:11</td>
<td>10-01-2014</td>
<td>07:30 - 08:30</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Coordinator Alex Cheong - Food Pack</td>
<td>Brazilian Stew Miel Chicken</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/9/2014 12:04:01</td>
<td>09-24-2014</td>
<td>07:30 - 08:30</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Coordinator Alex Cheong - Food Pack</td>
<td>Blackbean Stew Tlapia Vietnamese Stew Turkey</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/25/2014 15:32:39</td>
<td>17-10-2014</td>
<td>07:30 - 08:00</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Volunteer Coordinator Alex, Jiang - Volunteer Katia Coln - Volunteer Robin - Commons Staff</td>
<td>Curry Squash Soup Vegetable Chili Bratwurst</td>
<td>70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/25/2014 15:53:56</td>
<td>31-10-2014</td>
<td>07:15 - 07:45</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>Caritas</td>
<td>Alex Boyd - Volunteer Coordinator Alex, Jiang - Volunteer</td>
<td>Tuna Casserole Bread Beef Chili</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
F. Calendar

September 13th
-Caritas Activism Project was first introduced

September 15th
-Emailed Carol Wickersham, Trina Capelli, Lindsay Chapman, and Bon Appetit to set up meetings to discuss the prospects of our project.

September 16th
-Received word from Carol and Trina that little is known about food recovery and catering at Beloit. Groups first meeting.

September 18th
-Scheduled meeting with Lindsay Chapman to discuss project opportunities.

September 21th
-Meet with Lindsay Chapman to discuss Food Recovery Network (FRN) options. Received some information on recovery efforts in the past. Met with Ken and Scott from Bon Appetit. We learned that it is illegal to donate food from catered events. However, the connection between Caritas and Commons has fallen apart and food recovery can occur from the dining hall.

September 21st
-IFPC president, Frances Klavervamp, contacted regarding IFPC becoming the coordinator of volunteers for FRN at Beloit. BUG coordinator, Lena Wright contacted to explore possible composting options.

September 22nd
-Reevaluated scope of project and decided to shift focus to reestablishing an institutionally sustainable food recovery network between Commons and Caritas.

September 22nd
-Contacted by Hannah Cather, a representative from FRN, and Amanda Wareham, the Midwest fellow for Bon Appetit, regarding our project and request for meetings to discuss how FRN can be most successful at Beloit College. Meeting dates scheduled.

September 23rd
-Group meeting to talk face to face about the progress of the project.
September 22-28th
-Four aspects of the activism diamond assessed, and action plan decided on for completion of project by Thanksgiving.

September 29th
- Group meeting to talk about current date, timeline continues with meetings and deadlines we want to meet for our project.

September 30th
- Tentative meeting with Hannah Cather to discuss FRN at Beloit; awaiting response.

September 30th
- Meeting scheduled with IFPC at 8:00pm to discuss viability of IFPC becoming the coordinator between Commons and Caritas.

October 1st
- Contact Donna Ambrose, director of Caritas, to talk about logistics and protocol of consistent food delivery from Beloit College.

October 1-6th
- Creation of templates and how to guide for IFPC to carry out FRN from Commons to Caritas to present at next IFPC meeting on October 7th.

October 7th
- At our weekly group meeting, discuss what we learned from the case studies explored in our research papers and see if our plan needs tweaking to be successful.

October 5-9th
- Have a meeting with Donna Ambrose, tour Caritas and see participate in one food recovery run from Commons to Caritas to see time commitment and other logistical hurdles.

October 10-18th
- Fall Break. No group members will be present on campus over fall break, however, email correspondence will be continued.

October 19th
- Group meeting to discuss project thus far and re-evaluate the goals and progress. We will discuss a plan to finish project by November 24th. New timeline will be created at this point when we can better assess what actions will need to take place in the last 3 weeks of the project.
October 21st
- Group meeting

November 4th
- Meet with Amanda Wareham to discuss Food Recovery with Bon Apetite and to ask questions about Bon Appetit's efforts and goals towards working with the Food Recovery Network.

November 9th
- Hannah and Amanda emailed our groups with further information and data about Food Recovery Network and Bon Appetit.

November 16th
- Positions for food sustainability at Bon Appetit were created and open to the public.
G. Emails

From: Andreina to Carol, Sep 15, 2015
Hello,
My name is Andreina Patilliet and a few classmates and I are working on an activism project for Pablo Toral’s Ecology class which involves Caritas. We were wondering if you had any data from previous interactions between the college’s dining hall and Caritas that could help us establish an action plan to focus on food recovery between Caritas and Beloit College’s catered events. Also any information that would help us understand the connection between Beloit College and Caritas would be helpful. Please let me know if it would be easier to set up a meeting time to discuss the project. Thank you very much for your help,
Andreina Patilliet

From: Carol to Andreina, Sep 15, 2015
Dear Andreina,
I am not sure how much data we have. Lindsay may have more information about that. I would suggest that you talk to Trina Capelli who working at Caritas as a part of the Duffy Community Partnerships course. I’m copying her on this so you can set up a time to talk about possibilities. This would be an enormously welcome project in the community. Caritas could really use the food and a lot of it goes to waste at catered events. For instance, I was at a dinner last night where it was estimated that $300 worth of leftovers were going to be thrown out. So please start with Trina and if after that you want to talk with me, I'm happy to do so.
Best,
Carol

From: Sarah to Lindsay, Sep 18, 2015
Lindsay,
We would love to meet with you at 12:30 on Monday, does that work for you? Thanks
Sarah and Andreina

From: Lindsay to Sarah, Sep 18, 2015
yep that will work. My office is on the 2nd floor of LAPC. Have a great weekend!
Lindsay

From: Lindsay to Sarah and Andreina, Sep 18, 2015
Hello Andreina and Sarah,
I'm sorry I missed you yesterday when you stopped by my office--I was at an off-campus lecture all day yesterday. What is your schedule like next week? Let's try and meet for 30 minutes and I can talk with you and your teammates about more of the background of the Food Recovery Network and Caritas's involvement. Trina you are welcome to come as well and you might be able to fill in some gaps having spoken with Donna Ambrose at Caritas.
Let's shoot for either Monday or Tuesday so you guys can get rolling with this project.
I'm free:
Monday (9/21): 10-4 pm
Tuesday (9/22): 11 am-4 pm

Best,
Lindsay

From: Amanda to Lindsay, Sarah, and Andreina, Sep 22, 2015
Hi all,
I wanted to check in and see if the Food Recovery Chapter at Beloit was still active. The folks at FRN haven't heard from student leaders yet this year, and I'd also love to have a conversation with any FRN students when I visit in November!
Thanks so much,
Amanda

From: Lindsay to Amanda, Sarah, and Andreina, Sep 22, 2015
Hi Amanda,
Your email is very timely! We are currently revisiting the Food Recovery Network structure for Beloit College. There is a group of students with whom I spoke to just yesterday wanting to pursue this partnership, but trying to figure out the best ways to make it happen. I'm copying them here, Andreina Patilliet and Sarah Mueller are the group leaders within one class, and Trina Capelli is a third student who is working at Caritas this semester--Caritas is our food pantry where we send the leftover food from campus. Please feel free to reach out to them directly.
best regards,
Lindsay

From: Hannah to Sarah and Andreina, Sep 22, 2015
Hi Sarah and Andreina,
I'm thrilled to be in touch with you two! Do you think we could chat sometime early next week so that we can all be on the same page? I'm curious to hear about what you all are working on, and FRN has a lot of resources to share.
it'd be great to talk to both of you, but if only one of you has free time Monday or Tuesday, that should be okay too.
Hope to hear from you soon

From: Amanda to Sarah and Andreina, Sep 22, 2015
Hi all,
My name is Amanda Wareham, and I'm the Midwest Fellow for Bon Appetit Management Company. I wanted to reach out to you, Sarah and Andreina, and connect you with Sara Gassman and Hannah Cather at Food Recovery Network. FRN has a wonderful support system set up to help you on your FRN journey! I can certainly attest to this after founding a chapter of FRN at Macalester in Minnesota.
I will also be visiting Beloit during the week of November 2nd, and I would love to meet with your chapter!
Thanks so much-- I look forward to hearing about FRN at Beloit!
From: Sarah to Lindsay, Sep 26, 2015
Hi Lindsay,
I was just wondering if you had the model information on the pulper and dehydrator that Beloit uses. I have asked Ken but have not heard back and this is time sensitive for my class.
Thank you

From: Amanda to Sarah and Andreina, Sep 28, 2015
Hi Sarah and Andreina,
That’s such a worthy project! I wish I could provide you with some data, but unfortunately we don’t have that information tracked. However, we do have a student guide to “weighing the waste” in the pipeline, set to be finished in October. This basically entails doing a student-driven waste audit in your café. I will certainly forward it to you as soon as I can!
It seems like you might have a bit of a catch-22 here, because doing Food Recovery will highlight the waste in your café, but it seems like you need data to justify the chapter for your project. You could also contact someone at Food Recovery Network to see if they have some meta-data from some of their other schools on the average amount recovered. As a broad example, I would refer to the NRDC’s report on Food Waste in the US to support your proposal.
I hope this helps! Let’s make a plan to meet in November to discuss the project in person. I can personally vouch for the power of Food Recovery at Macalester and I think you can create a great argument for heading a chapter
Thanks,
Amanda

From: Sarah to Hannah, Sept 28, 2015
Hannah,
I am terribly sorry for not contacting you sooner. There were a few emails going back and forth about FRN at Beloit, and I thought I had responded. We would love to set up a time to chat about FRN at Beloit. I know you mentioned this Monday or Tuesday. I know that Andreina and I could talk between 12-1 tomorrow or after 4pm. Do either of these times work for you?
Again, apologies for the slow response,

From: Hannah to Sarah, Sep 28, 2015
Don’t you worry about it! I’m just glad that you exist to talk to. This is a link to my calendar, so you all can snag a time that works. I have availability tomorrow afternoon after 4, but I wanted to give you the power to pick which time slot.

From: Amanda to Lindsay and Sarah, Sep 28, 2015
Hi Lindsay and Sarah,
I’m looking into the question on catered food now, and I’ll back to you as soon as I can. Sarah, is your FRN chapter focused only on catered food? Most of the food moves through the main café and should provide a good amount of recoverable food. At
Macalester, we recovered just food from our kitchen and recovered over 1,000 lbs in the first month of recoveries! The Bill Emerson Good Samaritan Food Donation Act protects most donations, but I will check in on the issue of catered food. Please reach out if I can be helpful in any other way. I will get back to you as soon as I can.

Thanks,

From: Lindsay to Sarah and Amanda, Sep 28, 2015
hi Amanda,
I'm hoping you can clarify something for me about a Bon Appetit policy on food donations. Has Bon Appetit changed their policy on donating items that have been out on a buffet line? One of the larger opportunities that we've run into here at Beloit is that we have a lot of food leftover at catered events. These are normally buffet-style, but I was hoping that the Food Recovery Network could mobilize students to save this food from the trash by packaging it up right after the event is finished and deliver it to our walk in freezer behind Commons until it can be transported to Caritas. Alyse had mentioned that Bon Appetit's rule about this was in the process of being changed, but I wanted to see where that effort was left off.
In a 2014 FRN guide (attached), prepared by Bon Appetit with the FRN it states that buffet items are not acceptable, but I recently found the following PDF which seems to say that these items can be donated, but it's up the donor.
any information you can provide will be extremely helpful.
best regards,

From: Sarah to Lindsay, Sep 28, 2015
Thank you! this is super helpful.
We are still working on the food recovery network, however, we learned that donating food from catered events is not legally achievable due to liability issues and laws prohibiting food that has been sitting out from being taken anywhere. So we are focusing on creating a well established connection between Commons and Caritas through IFPC.
I needed the info on the pulper and dehydrator for a cost benefit analysis for Pablo's class

From: Lindsay to Sarah, Sep 28, 2015
Hi Sarah,
We have a MP4 Somat Mini pulper installed in the dish room.
This is fed by a Somat B5 disposer (industrial grade insink errator)
The food waste that comes out of the pulper is transported downstairs into the DH-100w Somat Compostable Waste Dehydrator
hope this helps. I thought you guys were working on the Food Recovery Network?

From: Hannah to Sarah and Andreina, Sep 28, 2015
Hi Sarah Mueller and Andreina Patillet,
Your FRN Check-In with Hannah Cather at 04:00 pm (Central Time - US & Canada) on September 29 is scheduled.
Choose a time for me to give you a call between September 29th and October 15th

From: Hannah to Sarah, Sep 29, 2015
Sarah, it was so great to chat with you this afternoon! I’m pumped you guys are on board with FRN. Figuring out the logistics should be fun.
Since you’re new to the organization (and didn’t go through the chapter-starting process) here’s a link to the chapter toolkit. It’s got a lot of things you’d probably find useful!
Also, here’s the link to past food recovery information. That should give you a sense of what the last FRN organizer was able to accomplish.
Keep me posted about your meeting tomorrow and anything else that comes up. And of course, don’t hesitate to email me any questions!

From: Hannah to Sarah, Sep 29, 2015
Sarah,
I just realized I don’t have your phone number on record. If you could give me a call at (omitted), that would be great.
Thanks,

From: Hannah to Sarah, Sep 30, 2015
Hi Sarah,
Here’s a folder we have for chapters that are looking to institutionalize FRN at their schools. Also, is there anyone in your dining department that works with sustainability efforts? They might be a good person to have on board!

From: Hannah to Sarah, Oct 5, 2015
Hi Sarah and Andreina -
That's fantastic news! Glad to hear you have a group of students interested in working with you all. Your plan sounds good, too. I have a few things to suggest.
1) Make sure that "fill out the food tracking form" is on your list of instructions. That's so, so, so important for us at FRN to know how much food you/they are able to recover.
2) Think about how much food safety training your volunteers might need. Will Bon Appetit be packaging all of the food and the students just have to carry the bags to the car/to Caritas? We want to make sure everyone is on the same page with our standards. If you need me to send the food safety documents, I can definitely do that.
I think trying to create a framework for IFPC and outline exactly what everyone's expectations/responsibilities are would be a good idea. How often will you recover? Who's responsible if the volunteers don't show up? Things like that.
Great job and keep me posted!
From: Sarah to Hannah, Oct 5, 2015
Hannah,
I just wanted to give you an update from when we talked last week. We did give our presentation to the IFPC (a collection of all greek organizations on campus) and they were really receptive! So now we are working to give them a framework so that it is super easy for new people who take over IFPC to get in touch with Caritas food shelf and Bon Appetit to coordinate the best times to transfer food. We are thinking it would be a 1 page document giving all the contact information, and instructions on how to pick up and deliver food. Then we are going to create a template that the group can use to have volunteers sign up for times to take the food.
What are your thoughts on this? Any other pieces of the puzzle you think we are missing?
Best

From: Lindsay to Amanda, Oct 15, 2015
Hi Amanda,
I'm wondering if you found the answer to the catered food donation question from Bon Appetit? I was approached by a faculty member yesterday who wanted to donate the leftovers from a Family Discovery Night to our local food pantry, Caritas, and was willing to get volunteers together to package the food after the event. She mentioned that she had spoken with Ken Hnilo, who gave her the go-ahead. So from my end, I wanted to see if Bon Appetit has given discretion to its individual sites to donate leftover food from catered events then or if Bon Appetit has actually just said they are behind donating catered leftover food. Any clarification you can provide would be timely and helpful.
best regards,

From: Amanda to Lindsay, Oct 16, 2015
Hi Lindsay,
Thanks so much for the reminder. I'm sorry I've been slow to respond, I've been travelling recently.
From my understanding, Food Recovery outside of a certified kitchen isn’t always possible. The teams at Bon Appetit are serious about recovering food, and we do so whenever we can. But because food at catered events is often out of refrigeration for an unspecified amount of time (FRN requires food can only be outside of the range of below 40 or over 140 F for 2 hours max), isn’t kept under glass shields as it would be in the dining hall, etc. recoveries can be more difficult.
The main takeaway is that it’s possible—but I don’t think there’s an overarching go-ahead that can be given.
Any unused food from catering can be donated. I’m going to CC Ken here as well. Ken, can you provide clarification on food recoveries from catered events?
Thanks!

From: Sarah to Amanda, Oct 22, 2015
Hi Amanda,
We would love to meet up. On November 4th, Andreina and I can meet between 10-11am, 12:30-2pm, or after 4:30pm. Please let us know what time will work best for you. Also, definitely let us know when the meeting with Ken and Michael will be and we will try to make it. Thanks and we look forward to meeting you!

From: Sarah to Lindsay, Oct 31, 2015
Lindsay,
I was wondering if you could send me the email address for Donna Ambrose. I think I copied it down wrong when we spoke because my computer says it is an invalid address.
Much appreciated,

From: Lindsay to Sarah, Nov 1, 2015
Hi Sarah,
This is the only email I have for her. If it's inaccurate, call Caritas and ask to speak to Donna and get her email address.
    caritas phone: (omitted)

From: Sarah to Donna, Nov 1, 2015
Donna,
My name is Sarah Mueller and I received your contact information from Lindsay Chapman, the sustainability coordinator at Beloit College, as she knew that we have previously done a food recovery network with Caritas. I also volunteered at the empty bowl event last weekend!
I am contacting you as I am part of a group who is setting up a Food Recovery Network at Beloit College, that will hopefully be more sustainable than what was done in the past. We are working with IFPC, the interfraternal panhellenic counsel, to take on the food recovery and we are planning to do food recoveries twice a week.
I am emailing you to see if Caritas would like to set up something with Beloit College in terms of food recovery. Please let me know what you have done in the past and what would work best for our organization. We can be super flexible with Caritas' needs. Also, if you would like to set up a meeting to chat about what this would look like, let us know.
Thank you for your time,
Sarah Mueller

From: Donna to Sarah, Nov 2, 2015
Hi Sarah,
I would love to set up a meeting to discuss this with you. We would LOVE to collaborate with you on this important project. I'm out of the office today, but I will check my calendar in the morning and send you dates/times that work best for me.
Thanks again for volunteering at Empty Bowl!
Donna

From: Sarah to Andreina and Amanda, Nov 2, 2015
Hey Amanda,
We would still love to meet with you, please let us know what times would work best.
-Sarah M.

**From: Amanda to Ken, Sarah, Michael, Andreina, Lindsay, Nov 3, 2015**

Hi all,
Let’s meet to discuss recoveries at Beloit! I think it would be best to meet by the main café, but I’m not familiar with campus! I’ll send everyone an update on location once I hear back from you! Feel free to suggest a meeting place to the whole group.
Thanks,
Amanda

**From: Ken to Amanda, Nov 3, 2015**

Amanda,
Presidents' lounge would be great. It's part of commons and where we hold a lot of meetings.

**From: Amanda to Sarah, Nov 3, 2015**

Definitely! Would you want to meet over lunch in the commons?
See you soon!
Amanda

**From: Sarah to Amanda, Nov 3, 2015**

We can meet at 12:30-1 on Wednesday, would that work?
--Sarah

**From: Amanda to Sarah, Nov 3, 2015**

Oh, I'm sorry. I meant to say that I'll be free before 4:30 on Wednesday! I won't be available Thursday. Would tomorrow work for you?

**From: Sarah to Amanda, Nov 3, 2015**

Thursday might work better. Can we do 1 pm on Thursday?

**From: Amanda to Sarah, Nov 3, 2015**

Does the meeting time I sent (3:30 tomorrow) work for you? If not (or even if so), I'm free to meet anytime before 4:30 on Thursday

**From: Amanda to Sarah, Nov 4, 2015**

Hi Sarah,
Would you still like to meet at 12:30? Let me know if the main café works for you as a meeting place.
Thanks!
Amanda

**From: Sarah to Amanda, Nov 4, 2015**

Yes, we are still looking forward to meeting you. Does commons still work for you? the main dining hall on campus?
-Sarah
From: Amanda to Sarah, Nov, 2015
Let's meet outside of the café so we can find each other!

From: Sarah to Donna, Nov 19, 2015
Hi Donna,
I was wondering if you had an idea of what your schedule looks like in the coming weeks and if we could set up a time to meet! I know that Thanksgiving must be a busy time for you, so let me know what works. Thanks

From: Donna to Sarah, Nov 23, 2015
Good Morning Sarah,
I apologize for the delay in getting back to you. I've been out of the office dealing with a family emergency and will return on Nov. 30th. You may have heard the news on campus, my nephew, Tyler Hubb '15, passed away last week as the result of a motorcycle accident. I'm looking forward to working with you and will schedule a date as soon as I return.
Thanks for understanding and have a wonderful Holiday week-end!
Donna
Switching Beloit College’s Laundry Facilities to Greener Washers and Dryers
Final Report for POLS 255
Nissa Parker, Wilson Neal, Jeremy Jessin
12/8/15
Key Problem and Goals

Beloit College has proven to be environmentally sustainable by supporting multiple programs such as terracycling, platinum LEED certified science center, food waste reductions, and many others. The first step in solving this environmental crisis is to understand what the crisis is and why it is a problem. One fundamental component contributing to environmental degradation is the accumulation of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere. “On average, the state of Wisconsin produces 1.713 lbs of carbon dioxide per kilowatt hour because of its heavy use of coal as an energy source.9 From July 2012 to June 2013, the washing machines alone on the Beloit College campus used 19,274.4 kwH of energy according to data provided by Beloit College Residential Life. If Wisconsin produces 1.713 lbs of carbon per kwH, this means Beloit College was responsible for emitting 33,017 lbs of carbon from July 2012 to June 2013.” (Holy Diamond Subsection: science) The current system of washing machines is called “top load washers.” These washers are outdated and wasteful. The same company (Maytag) has new washers systems called “front load washers.” These washers save ten gallons of water per load, which replacing the previous 30 gallons a load to 20 gallons would make the price drop from $3,788 to $2,484.10 Old dryer vents restricted by just 25% can increase Co2 emissions by 850 lbs annually for each dryer. These new vents and more advanced machines diminish the time the dryers need to run, thus decreasing the amount of energy consumed by one machine. And lastly top load washers also require 300% more detergent than modern front load machines.11 (Holy Diamond Subsection: Economics)

Our goal for this project was to originally replace all of the old and wasteful washing and drying machines with newer, more sustainable machines. After being faced with the issue that the current contract with Beloit’s washing machine is in its 2nd year with 3 more to go our goal changed. Our revised goal was to provide John Winkelman with a consulting report that would be asking for newer machines once the contract is over.

Challenges and Accomplishments

Our group had a number of challenges throughout this project. Organization was the root of most of our challenges. Without strong organization, it was difficult to make steady progress. From the get-go it became clear that our differing schedules would make it hard to meet in person regularly, so we opted to do the majority of our work and discussion over google docs, E-mail, and facebook group chat. Although we were able to accomplish our goals this way, the lack of consistent face-to-face meetings served as a self-handicap of sorts, which made progress slow

---

9 US Environmental Protection Agency eGRID2006 Version 2.1, April 2007
at times. Ultimately though, we accomplished a few significant goals, and by doing so, built a
time-based platform from which the administration can enact the changes we proposed.

Our first accomplishment as a group was being able to meet with John Winkleman, an
extraordinarily busy individual, to discuss our proposal and receive constructive criticism and
guidance on how to proceed effectively. At the first meeting we discussed the feasibility of our
project. We learned that in order to accomplish our goal of replacing the washer and dryer
machines with more energy efficient machines, we needed access to the contract that Beloit
College has with CoinAppliance, the company that provides washing and drying services to
campus. This, we learned from John, was where the feasibility of the project goal was
questionable, because 1) negotiating with companies as a small private liberal-art college poses
its own challenges, and 2) there are still two more years remaining in the school’s contract with
CoinAppliance. Neither of those two reasons means that changing the school’s laundry system is
impossible.

Advice for the Future

● Stay in touch with John Winkleman and Residential Life throughout the span of your
project so as to ensure political agreement with Beloit College
● Start calling CoinAppliance as soon as possible so that you can begin negotiating a
strategy early with them
● Ensure all members of the project are aware of responsibilities and deadlines, out of
respect to one another and timeliness
● Communicate concisely and specifically and have clear goals for each meeting
● Expect to involve more actors within the school and with the outside company than you
initially expect
● In the immediate next step, revise the consulting report document provided to John
Winkleman with him and schedule a time for you to speak with a representative from
CoinAppliance

Conclusions

Although we encountered many challenges throughout our project, such as organization
with group members and outside actors and dealing with a long-term contract, our group
managed to present the idea of getting new, green washing machines and have Residential Life
change the contract that Beloit College has with CoinAppliances. We were not able to achieve
the final goal of having an established plan to replace the washing machines in the dorms, but we
did create the framework for Residential Life in partnership with Sustainability to both commit
to having CoinAppliance provide our laundry services and to our moral responsibility of
combating climate change and pollution.

Our project encountered some similar situations that lawmakers juggled when writing
environmental legislature, and our suggestions for the future are similar to those suggestions
made by the EPA after the Clean Air Act (1970) was enacted: facilitate direct communication among all actors and commit to integrating the interests of actors into the final strategy.\textsuperscript{12} Outlining the project in relation to the holy diamond is essential in understanding the steps you need to take in order to complete the project. Facilitate cooperation of interests among all actors, ensure the project is economically wise for the financial interests of Beloit College, remind actors of moral obligations, and make sure the proper technology for future washers and dryers is being used to maximize energy savings. In a broad sense, using these points to guide your actions throughout the project will assist you in successfully completing the project. The political aspect of the holy diamond was a challenge for our group, as we could not organize negotiations and meetings easily.

Our group has created the framework for an alternative contract that Beloit College Residential Life can use when the current contract with CoinAppliance expires. This is a significant accomplishment in and of itself. It means that when the contract does end in two years, the administration will be one step ahead when negotiating with CoinAppliance, because the framework for the alternative contract clearly defines the

- problems of the current laundry system
- solutions to said problems
- ways in which said solutions will be carried out
- overarching goals of the proposed changes

**Holy Diamond**

Science

Beloit College is powered by Alliant Energy, a coal-burning company that, while incorporating renewable sources of energy into its grid, predominantly burns fossil fuels as its source of energy. Coal is a compound composed almost entirely of carbon and when burned, produces carbon dioxide. Carbon dioxide is what is considered a greenhouse gas and is a major contributor to global climate change.

On average, the state of Wisconsin produces 1.713 lbs of carbon dioxide per kilowatt hour because of its heavy use of coal as an energy source. From July 2012 to June 2013, the washing machines alone on the Beloit College campus used 19,274.4 kWh of energy according to data provided by Beloit College Residential Life. If Wisconsin produces 1.713 lbs of carbon per kWh, this means Beloit College was responsible for emitting 33,017 lbs of carbon from July 2012 to June 2013 (Figure 1). Mitigating these emissions by a small percentage will be an essential step in making Beloit a more sustainable campus, and will contribute to lowering Wisconsin’s carbon emissions at a whole. We are not going to solve the climate crisis by changing our washing machines--but climate change is a cumulative problem that has affected and been affected by billions of people. If these billions take incremental steps toward energy efficiency.

Politics

The Residential Life Office (Reslife) currently has a contract with Coin Appliances who own and maintain the Maytag commercial washing machines and dryers on campus. The particular model of washing machines on campus are top-load, as opposed to front-load which use 60% less water. If Reslife can purchase or rent upgraded top-load washing machines, Beloit College could save a significant amount of water. Newer, updated washing machines and dryers would also provide the students with cleaner clothes. Since Coin Appliances already sells front-load washing machines, there is an opportunity to simply upgrade with the contract Beloit College currently has. The Physical Plant Department (Physplant) pays the water and electricity that powers the washing machines and dryers. If Reslife can invest in the washing machines and dryers, Physplant would save money on water and electricity. Another liberal arts college, similar in size to Beloit saved around 755,638 gallons of water over 5 years after upgrading to front-load washers. Beloit College can make a significant commitment to becoming more sustainable while saving money and bringing its students an updated service.

Economics

The college is currently operating with Maytag Washers and Dryers in which the “mat12pddaw” model is a very prominent one on campus. These machines are around 10 years old and consume a colossal amount more compared to modern washers and dryers. Just in the year of 2012-2013 Beloit did 21,416 washing loads and 42,832 drying loads. The reason for twice the amount of dry loads is partially linked to the inability of the dryers to dry on the first time. Beloit used 653,188 of gallons of water in the washers. That comes out to a total of $3,788 a year on water and sewer bills cost and $851 of energy bills. The dryers use 7.8 kw in half an hour which comes out to a total of $6,645 in energy bills. In conclusion, Beloit spends $11,285 on washing and drying machines consumption per year.

The current system of washing machines is called “top load washers.” These washers are outdated and wasteful. The same company (Maytag) has new washers systems called “front load washers.” These washers save ten gallons of water per load, which replacing the previous 30 gallons a load to 20 gallons would make the price drop from $3,788 to $2,484. Old dryer vents restricted by just 25% can increase Co2 emissions by 850 lbs annually for each dryer. These new vents and more advanced machines diminish the time the dryers need to run, thus decreasing the amount of energy consumed by one machine. And lastly top load washers also require 300% more detergent than modern front load machines. While these machines are much more sustainable they do come at a price. These washers come as low as $400 a machine. If bought on an industrial scale, beloit is most likely to have a contract with the Maytag Industry. While the price of the new machines is more expensive, the benefits of upgrading, financially and environmentally outweigh the current costs of keeping old machines.

Morality
In this day in age, it is rather difficult to argue against the morality of environmentally sustainable practices, however, there is one strong counter-argument to sustainability: that no matter what humans do in the next 20 years to counter climate change, the largest negative impacts (large scale droughts, increase in hurricane & tsunami frequency and strength, hotter summers and colder winters, etc) will still occur. In other words, resistance is somewhat futile. The primary flaw in this counter-argument is that in regards to the future, no one really knows for sure what will happen. No one knows what technology or innovation might come about in the next few years that could revolutionize sustainability. The fact that we can’t know what will happen tomorrow in the world of climate change and sustainable practices renders the counter-argument indefensible.

This leads me to the defensibility of our project’s morality, as it is based in the larger environmental movement’s moral and ethical underpinnings. There are numerous schools of thought that can be used to justify the morality of environmental practices. One such argument is states that all non-human life has as equal of a right to living as human beings do. Another argument states that humans need to think about the long-term survivability of their species, and therefore should make attempts to live sustainably. There are numerous other arguments for the morality of environmentalism, however these two arguments are the dominant ones in the contemporary environmental movement.
Appendix A: Sources

“Average household electricity use around the world” Shrink That Footprint, accessed October 4, 2015, http://shrinkthatfootprint.com/average-household-electricity-consumption


Appendix B: Meetings/Correspondences

Email correspondences with John Winkleman:

Hi John,

I am currently in Pablo Toro's Global Political Ecology class and he has assigned an on-campus sustainability project. The assignment is to begin implementing a project that will improve the sustainability of Beloit by reducing the amount of resources consumed by the college campus. My group, consisting of Nissa Parker and Wilson Nais, has decided to replace the washing machines. After analyzing the 2012-2013 water and electricity bills of the washers and dryers, we concluded that switching to newer, more sustainable machines would be beneficial not only to the environment but financially as well. We would like to set up a meeting with you in order to present our ideas, discuss a plan, and gain feedback.

As far as our availability, we would all be able to meet on a Tuesday or Thursday afternoon. Unfortunately, this project is for a class so we have a fairly tight timeline, so we would greatly appreciate it if we could meet at the earliest possible time.

Thank you, and we greatly appreciate you taking time out of your schedule for us.

Sincerely,
Jeremy Jessin

Jeremy,

I have some time around 4 on Thursday afternoon if that works. I'll forward this to Elise so she can also look for a time.

As you may know, we contract out the washer/dryer service... we do not own the machines. The co provides eco friendly machines as this time.

Happy to talk about this idea.

John

Hi John,

I wanted to follow up about our meeting a couple of weeks ago. In order to make progress with our washer and dryer project, we do need to examine the school's contract with Coin Appliance. Would it be possible for you to send us the contract? If you can only send parts, would you please send these parts to us? We will be contacting Coin Appliance in order to find out if they have flexibility in their services. Depending on how these go, we will be in contact about scheduling another meeting with you.

Thanks so much for your help,
Nissa Parker

Nissa,

thanks for the note. I have the contracts. They are five year contracts that started in 13...

I am happy to go over them with you... they are really simple, one page, lots of basics... but happy to share.

Elise can find a good time for this..

John,

Attached is the document we discussed in our last meeting. Apologies for getting it to you so late. The document outlines the problems we are addressing and the solutions we are proposing. Even though the semester is over, I am happy to stay in contact with you to ensure that the project is successful. Though I cannot speak for my other group members, I can commit to staying involved with replacing the washers and dryers.

Thank you for your time and help,
Nissa Parker

Nissa,

Thank you for sending along your summary.
Appendix C: Document Outlining Suggestions for Residential Life

Report for Residential Life on Sustainable Washing Machines
Nissa Parker, Wilson Neal, Jeremy Jessin
December 8, 2015
Highlighting the Problem

The first step in solving this environmental crisis is to understand what the crisis is and why it is a problem. One fundamental component contributing to environmental degradation is the accumulation of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere. Greenhouse gases are compounds that absorb thermal radiation (heat) and are most commonly found in the atmosphere in the form of carbon dioxide (CO$_2$) and methane (CH$_4$).[1] Carbon dioxide is released during combustion reactions, like when we burn coal for fuel.[2] According to the National Resources Defense Council (NRDC), coal-burning power plants are the largest source of carbon emissions in the United States, releasing 2.5 billion tons of carbon into the atmosphere every year.[3] Such carbon emissions are what is causing the phenomenon called global warming, leading to a shift in global climate patterns. So, why is this a problem? Although we refer to global warming as an environmental problem (one that is disrupting natural ecosystems), this global climate change is causing humanitarian crises in the form of natural disasters like large hurricanes as well as drought, which leads to food supply shortages and famine.[4] As the carbon dioxide concentrations in the atmosphere increase, atmospheric temperature will continue to increase and cause these abnormal climate patterns. Accordingly, we can conclude that altering our practices to lessen the amount of coal and the other fossil fuels (oil, natural gas, etc.) that we burn for energy will lessen the immediate impact of global warming.

One massive component of total energy usage can be attributed to household energy consumption. 30% of the total energy used in the United States goes toward powering our homes, and most of this energy, perhaps unsurprisingly, is primarily generated by the burning of coal.[5] While this figure does include lighting, consider the number of appliances in a home that are left on for extended periods of time such as refrigerators, air conditioners, fans, and clothes dryers. If an appliance rated to 1,000 watts is left on for one hour, this means that your home has consumed one kilowatt hour (kWh) of electricity. Estimates of the average American household usage of electricity range from approximately 900 to 1,000 kWh per month.[6] The average American household also uses 2-3 times more electricity than a European home, and 20 times more than that of a Nigerian home.[7]


41
The Solution

There are a number of areas where Beloit College could lessen its impact on the environment. One of these areas is the laundry machine systems available to students living on-campus. The current systems (primarily “mat12pddaw”) are over 10 years old. For example, in 2012-2013 Beloit College used 653,188 gallons of water in the washers. This translates to $3,788 for water and sewer bills, and $851 of energy bills. The dryers use 7.8 kw in half an hour which comes out to a total of $6,645 in energy bills. In sum, Beloit College spends $11,285 on washing and drying machines per year.

It’s also worth pointing out the school’s energy provider, Alliant Energy, is reliant on fossil fuels for energy production. Replacing the current washing and drying machines with newer more efficient machines will ultimately reduce Beloit College’s participation in Alliant Energy’s environmentally destructive energy grid, as well as reduce its energy bill. Both are excellent reasons to move forward with this project.

CoinAppliance is the company that provides Beloit College with the laundry machine systems. According to their website, CoinAppliance offers the most energy efficient washers and dryers available today. This means that in order to get the new washers installed on campus, Beloit College needs to negotiate its contract with CoinAppliance so that when the current contract ends in two years, the process of replacement can begin.

The company that makes the current “top load” washer model now makes a “front load” washer. This new model saves ten gallons compared to the current model at Beloit College, which would mean a price drop in the water/sewer bill to $2,484. Also, the current washers require 300 percent more detergent than the new models. New dryers available today diminish the time needed to dry, thus decreasing the amount of energy consumed by one machine.

While replacing the current laundry system with an up-to-date system would be much more ecologically friendly, they are quite expensive. Washers start at $400 per machine. If bought on the scale needed for campus, Beloit College will likely have to contract with Maytag Industry. In conclusion, while the prices of new machines are likely more expensive in the immediate short-term, the long-term benefits of upgrading are both environmental and financial, and outweigh the costs of maintaining the current machines.
Bringing TerraCycle to Bon Appetit Catering

By Rose Richard and Dylan Hackler
Problem:

Bon Appetit caters two Beloit College events that serve boxed lunches containing individually packaged chip bags made of mixed plastics and aluminum coating. These materials make the bags hard to recycle and with the absence of any system in place, they are thrown in the garbage and eventually end up in landfills. Once in a landfill, they can take many years to breakdown and can also pose a choking hazard to animals. Currently, Beloit College is a participant in the TerraCycling program, which recycles chip bags into profitable items that can be returned into the market rather than sent to landfills. The main problem with the current program on campus is that the bins are not being used enough to have the chip bag waste sent out in part because there is a lack of campus awareness of this program. Furthermore, these bins are not in a location to collect the estimated 5,000 chip bags used during the annual Homecoming tailgating picnic in October and Graduation in May.

Goals:

According to Anthony Giddens, sustainable development is a method “to meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.” One solution to chip bag waste lies in banning them on campus such as the policy used in the sports center, however we decided to build off of a campus project that would meet the current needs of students to dispose of their used chip bags while in the process transforming them into a much less environmentally harmful product.

- The first goal was to get TerraCycle bins to give to the catering staff in hopes that they would take them to and from the catering events. These bins were essentially to be the permanent ‘infrastructure,’--such as the already existing recycle and garbage bins--that would collect chip bags to be recycled rather than disposed of. After conversations with Lindsay Chapman, Beloit College’s Sustainability Chair, and LeeAnn Ryan, who is the office manager of campus Facilities, the revised goal was to get six TerraCycle bins that would be incorporated into the existing waste removal procedures.

- The second goal was to make this set of bins available for any other campus events that may include individual-sized, plastic chip bags. As a part of this project, we wanted to collect enough chip bags for the first shipment to be sent out to TerraCycle.

- The third goal of this project was to raise TerraCycling awareness on campus and then further institutionalize methods to promote campus awareness of the TerraCycling program once Dylan and I have left.

---

15 Ibid.
Strategies:

- **Suggesting a simple, inexpensive solution:** Since Beloit College has to pay for the waste it sends away, we did a *cost-benefit analysis* that showed the one time purchase of six new, permanent TerraCycle boxes would be more cost effective in the long run than paying for the constant removal of chip bags as trash (figure 3). TerraCycle will also take the chip bags for free as long as they are given 14 pounds or more. TerraCycle can then make a profit off the products they create from the unwanted chip bags they have reused. Beloit College will now save money on waste disposal while reducing the environmental harm of chip bags. This created on a small scale a situation similar to what Anthony Giddens refers to as “*ecological modernization*,” which occurs when environmentally progressive policies positively affect the economy and political interests.\(^{16}\)

- **Interpersonal connections:** Since Rose works for Bon Appetit as a caterer, and Dylan is active in student government, we used our connections on campus and our knowledge outside of class to get the best political position for accomplishing our goals. Where we did not have preexisting connections, we worked to build new ones with critical people so that we could better complete our project. The key people we worked with were those who had roles in campus decision making processes and included:

  - **Lindsey Chapman,** the sustainability coordinator, who is focused on making Beloit College a more sustainable institution and who had set up the preexisting, smaller TerraCycle program. By consulting with her, we built our project off the work she had already begun.
  
  - **LeeAnn Ryan,** the Facilities Office Manager, was in charge of overseeing where Facilities would keep the TerraCycle bins and the placement of new ones, as well as ensuring that Facilities staff knew when and how they were supposed to set up and return the boxes. LeeAnn, as a manager, had the political clout to direct other campus employees that we as students do not have.
  
  - **JoAnn King,** the manager for Bon Appetit’s catering program, was given a signed document detailing the newly created TerraCycle procedure that presented a union between the Sustainability office and the Facilities department (see figures 1 and 2), and outlined Bon Appetit’s role in promoting the program.
  
  - **Lucca Castucci,** the COO (Club Oversight Organization) Director, under whose authority the institutionalization of TerraCycle as something used by clubs for events could be established.

- **Utilizing Existing Institutions:** Rather than trying to force the creation of a new routine around TerraCycle use, we focused on incorporating TerraCycle boxes into the

---

\(^{16}\) Anthony Giddens, *Politics of Climate Change*, 72.
preexisting routines of Facilities, Bon Appetit catering, and club event scheduling to ease the institutionalization of TerraCycle practices.

- We worked with people from several different departments on campus to make responsibilities of each contributor simple and clear, and to spread awareness and campus involvement in the project.

- The groups we worked with have defined values-- accessible in their mission statements-- that document a willingness and commitment to promoting sustainable projects on campus.\(^{17}\)\(^{18}\)

- Signed documents were also created that outlined the procedures for each main contact person so that the plan will be in writing for future generations (Figures 1 and 2). This is a form of soft law that outlines each contributor’s responsibilities and will provide a unified overview of the project. This was inspired by documents we learned about in class such the 1987 Brundtland Report created by the World Commission on Environment and Development which outlined a set of principles from which action could be taken to promote “Sustainable Development”.\(^{19}\)

- Just like a climate conference unites leaders to bring information back to its citizens, we went to the Club Oversight Organization (COO) in order to spread awareness among club leaders in hopes that they will to spread information to smaller interest groups on campus.

**Challenges:**

**Gaining Accurate Information Across Departments:** Since we worked with a lot of different departments there were instances when conflicting information led to further confusion. For example, when pursuing our goal of getting a TerraCycle icon installed on a school website, we were first told that the idea was do-able but discovered at the last minute that the website was created and run by an outside company.

**Website Icon:** We attempted to get an icon with the TerraCycle logo on the website by working with the IT department in order to further institutionalize the TerraCycle program into Beloit’s online waste management procedures. This would allow students to be exposed to TerraCycle every time they made a work request, and make getting boxes easier and accessible to the whole campus. This would also have been a way to easily track student use of the boxes. However, because this website has been outsourced to a third party, we were unable to negotiate this in time. Furthermore, we were told by LeeAnn that a simpler method was already in place.

\(^{17}\) Beloit College Three-Year Sustainability Plan, December 2014.  
\(^{18}\) Bon Appetit Executive Summary  
\(^{19}\) Giddens, 60.
Accomplishments:

● Six grey TerraCycling bins were purchased with funds from Beloit Sustainability. We then labeled and decorated these bins and they are currently being stored in the Physical Plant building.

● Lindsay and LeeAnn came up with an arrangement to have two of the bins sit outside the main office for Physical Plant until they are to be set out at the two major catered events in October and May, or when they are requested by a student or faculty event planner.

In terms of raising awareness for the TerraCycle program:

● Dylan gave a speech to COO and a written overview (figure 4) of what TerraCycling consists of and how COO members (as well as any student or faculty event planner) can request a box will be added into the new Student Government Handbook and COO representative training procedure to be completed next Fall. This will ensure that all new students who are leaders in clubs and organizations will know what TerraCycle is and how to access the bins.

● Additional Funds from Turtle Tank have been acquired to purchase TerraCycling Bins for the six Greek Houses and six special interest houses. This will put TerraCycle boxes directly into the homes of many students on campus.

● Gained Legal rights for the usage of the TerraCycle logo that can now be used legally on bins, websites, and documents for future TerraCycle projects (that may create a bin request website or purchase more bins.) We did this in order to make sure our usage of the TerraCycle labels on the new bins were in accordance with current trademark legislation.

Conclusions and Advice for the Future:

In total, we worked with Beloit Sustainability, Physical Plant (Facilities and Maintenance), Bon Appetit, Information Technology (IT), and Beloit Student Congress Club and Organization Oversight Assembly (COO). We also reached out to a John Kaufman, the TerraCycle Company and Beloit staff in the Sports Center. We accomplished our goals and learned a great deal about the different departments on campus and the challenge of coordinating among them, and the process of environmental activism.

Future projects focused on expanding the TerraCycle program at Beloit should work to create a website so that requests can be monitored by Lindsay to gauge student use of the bins, put bins in student lounges, make sure bins are clearly and most obviously labeled that only emptied chip bags should go in grey bins, and to branch out to the other recycling brigades offered through TerraCycle such as batteries, electronics, and writing utensils. We suggest giving another speech to COO which was a good way to raise awareness among student leadership on campus. In order to make planning as coherent as possible, all actions and ideas should be run by LeeAnn Ryan first and Lindsay Chapman as well.
Appendix:

Figure 1: This is the signed document outlining the procedure for setting up and removing TerraCycle bins from the two catered events. This also includes information about how students and faculty can request these bins for their events.
To the Facilities department:

I would like to thank you for working to reduce waste in landfills by devoting time and effort to Beloit Sustainability's TerraCycle program.

The procedure for incorporating TerraCycle into catered events is as follows:

For catered events, Facilities will store six grey, labeled TerraCycle bins in the Physical Plant building. These boxes will then be placed by a facilities employee at catered events, which use individually packaged chip bags, including graduation, held annually in May, and the Alumni weekend's Homecoming tailgating lunch, held annually in September at Strong Stadium.

The six grey TerraCycle bins will be put next to the blue bins for normal recycling and black bins for garbage. After the events, Facilities will collect the bins and return them to Physical Plant.

When garbage cans and recycling bins are requested for events through the school website as well as by student event planners, TerraCycle bins will also be available for club events that involve chip bags. The club event bins will be brought to the events with recycling and garbage bins and will be returned to Physical Plant with those garbage and recycling bins.

LeeAnn Ryan 12/1/15
Facilities Office Manager

Lindsay Chapman 12/1/15
Beloit College Sustainability Chair
To the Bon Appetit management staff:

I would like to thank you for helping to reduce waste in landfills by devoting time and effort to Beloit Sustainability’s TerraCycle program.

The procedure for incorporating TerraCycle into events catered by Bon Appetit is as follows:

For catered events, Facilities will store six grey, labeled TerraCycle bins in the Physical Plant building. These boxes will then be placed by a facilities employee at catered events, which use individually packaged chip bags, including graduation, held annually in May, and the Alumni weekend’s Homecoming tailgating lunch, held annually in September at Strong Stadium.

Bon Appetit’s catering staff will be responsible for notifying the recipients of boxed lunches that their box and chip bags are recyclable. A sign with background information on TerraCycle and recycling instructions for guests will be provided.

The six grey TerraCycle bins will be located next to the blue bins for normal recycling and black bins for garbage. After the events, Facilities will collect the bins and return them to Physical Plant.

Thank you,
Rose Richard ’17
Student Coordinator

LeeAnn Ryan, 4/7/15
Facilities Office Manager

Lindsay Chapman, 10/7/15
Beloit College Sustainability Chair
Figure 3: This chart was created by LeeAnn Ryan to outline the amount that Beloit College spends monthly on trash removal. The cost for the compactor mostly consists of food waste while other is where the cost of chip bags would be. This information is from August-October of 2015.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AUGUST</th>
<th></th>
<th>SEPTEMBER</th>
<th></th>
<th>OCTOBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Compactor</td>
<td>$2,482.63</td>
<td>Compactor</td>
<td>$2,462.60</td>
<td>Compactor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>$2,099.64</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>$1,729.02</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>$4,582.27</td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>$4,191.62</td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Figure 4: This is a copy of the information on TerraCycle to be included in the Student Government Handbook that will be published next Fall by students Lucca Castrucci and Izak Harvey-Wolf.

What is TerraCycle?

Beloit College is taking the initiative in energy efficient waste reduction by using TerraCycle. You’ve probably heard the saying, “one man’s trash is another man’s treasure,” In this case, your trash can become a new, unique product just by throwing your chip bags into one of Beloit’s many grey TerraCycle bins.

TerraCycle is a company that is rethinking the definition of waste, and in the process reducing the amount of “garbage” in landfills. It takes hard to recycle materials such as chip bags, used electronics, old batteries, used writing utensils, and baby food packages and turns them into bags, furniture, and other useful products.20

By reusing the materials that chip bags are made of --polypropylene, polyethylene, and aluminum-- new products can be made. This reduces hard to break down plastics in landfills and reduces the energy that would be used for transporting this waste to landfills.21 Once a new product is made from the chip bags, that product can be kept or sent back to TerraCycle.

Used chip bags can become a new tote bag, purse, lampshade, pencil case, or a cutting board.22 Although there are no other collection companies at this time that focus on things such as chip bags. Hopefully, others will emerge.

For Beloit College community members to request a TerraCycle bin:

1. Log on to the Beloit College Portal.
2. Go to the SchoolDude work request page.
3. In the additional information section, request a TerraCycle box along with any recycling bins.

Additional information for COO Representatives:

Boxes will be grey bins with black lids, labeled, and will be delivered to the event and taken away with other garbage and recycling by Facilities. Thank you for your participation!

---

Limited Trademark License Agreement

TerraCycle, Inc. ("TC") Beloit College Sustainability, ("Licensee") have determined to enter into this Limited Trademark License Agreement dated as of Monday, November 9, 2015 (the "Agreement") for good and valuable consideration the sufficiency of which is hereby acknowledged. The “Term” of this Agreement shall be from November 9, 2015 for twelve months.

1. TC hereby grants Licensee a royalty-free, non-exclusive license to use the TERRACYCLE, and TerraCycle Logo, registered trademarks (the “Marks”) in the United States only during the Term of this Agreement and subject to any restrictions set forth below.

2. Use of the Marks and any press releases or other publicity regarding the use of the Marks is subject to written approval (which may be via email) of TC. If TC does not issue/ a written approval of the use of the Marks, then TC’s approval shall be deemed not given.

3. Both parties to this Agreement shall indemnify the other against any damages arising out of the approved use of the Marks.

Approved and agreed,

___________________________  ________________________
Name: Lindsay Chapman        Name: Lauren Taylor
Title: Beloit College Sustainability Chair  Title: Director, U.S. Public Relations
Emails between group members and Lindsay Chapman, LeeAnn Ryan, Sarah Meadus (IT), Isobel Collier (turtle tank), and Lauren Taylor (TerraCycle):

**September 20th**

(To Lindsay, Pablo, Ken [from Bon Appetit], Scott Bierman, and former group members)

Hey guys,

So I helped cater an event last night and I realized that the area to focus on in terms of waste in commons is definitely to encourage the use of and promote terracycling because there were hundreds of empty chip bags at the catered event that were thrown in the trash because people didn’t know they could be reused. Once I started putting them in a separate box, they saw that they were recyclable, and without even thinking about it, they would go along with it and put their chip bag in the box. This wasn’t the case for every person but a surprising amount of people took the time to put it in the separate box, all we need to do is find a way to get boxes and display a chip bag in them. Also, some label that the boxes are for chip bags, which could be something people are easily trained to mention as people get their boxes or information could be written on a flashy poster.

I spoke with Scott Bierman, the president, and he would like to hear more about this plan and other ways to reduce waste in catering. I also spoke to Scott, a manager from Commons, who thought the sustainable art project (giant mug sculpture ect.) would be great and they would be on board with helping it work.

~Rose Richard (my number is [redacted]; let me know when (if) we’re meeting tonight after 9 or tomorrow night if that’s more convenient.

**September 23rd**

Hi Lindsey,

I sent out a more detailed email earlier about an idea I have for incorporating Terra-cycling boxes into catered events. I don't know if you think this is a do-able plan, but I would like to talk to you about it in person if you have anytime for an appointment tomorrow or Friday. If you think this is something that may work, let me know what times you have available. I have a plan and one person from the Caritas group is interested in teaming up with me. I really would like to do this project and I feel that I can make it work.

Thanks,

Rose Richard

**September 24th**

Hi Rose,

yes I saw that email and I think it’s an interesting idea. I am free all morning tomorrow (Friday), from 8am-12pm. Let me know when you can stop by, my office is on the 2nd floor of the LAPC building. One question you might think about before we meet is the ability for this initiative to continue once you leave?

best,

(Lindsay Chapman)

Hey Lindsay,

I’ll stop by around 9:30. My goal is for the additional boxes to be incorporated into the procedure for setting up at the catered events. See you tomorrow!

**September 25th**

Hi Rose,

it was great meeting you this morning. Let me know if you want terracycle bins at the President’s house and if any need to be purchased for the bigger catering events such as homecoming and graduation. I also like the mug idea for Java Joint and think it would benefit Bon Appetit and sustainability.

best,
September 26th

Hey Dylan,
So I've spoken to Lindsay and she loves the project idea, the only problem is how we will be able to measure success since the two major events either happened or will happen at graduation. Because of this, I'm still going to be helping my group, but I'm going to look into other testable events. I thought I'd let you know asap so you can still work with your group. If you want to help me with the terracycling project, I still need to talk to housekeeping and get a list of minor campus events.

Thanks,
Rose Richard

September 27th

Hi Jean,
I am a junior working on a class sustainability project and one of the ideas I have involves adding several extra recycling bins to catered events. Is there a time I can meet with you in person to introduce myself and get your advice on a couple of questions? I was told to contact you by Lindsay Chapman because housekeeping is in charge of removing the trash and recycling cans.

Thanks,
Rose Richard

September 30th

Hi Ari and Lindsay,

I'm writing up my action plan for the terracycling project, but for the sake of having exact information, how much does it cost to send (10 lbs) of chip bags to the terracycling company?

Thanks,
Rose Richard

October 1st

(from Lindsay to Rose)

It's free. terracycle pays for all of the shipping costs. Besides the upfront cost of the bins, the program is free (if you aren't counting the cost of time to collect, weigh, and send).
I misspoke when I said 10 lbs. The package has to be over 14 lbs before we can send it in. Currently we have about 4 lbs., mostly from Java Joint and the Mail Center.

Hey Lindsay,

How much do the boxes cost? Also, I spoke with LeeAnn Ryan in housekeeping and they would like about 6 boxes to put out at catered events.

Thanks,
Rose Richard

October 2nd

Hi Rose,

they are $13.00 each, sold in packs of two. I will order the 6 today, they'll be in mid-week next week. I'll let you know when they come in and I'll leave the signage up to you. It actually takes a bit of time to tape the signs on so they will last. When they come in, let me know which brigades you want (terracycle.com) and I can print off the signage here in LAPC.

best,
(Lindsay Chapman)

October 25th

Hi LeeAnn,
This is just a follow-up from when we last spoke, but have you talked to Lindsay Chapman about where the terracycle waste will be stored? I'm going to stop in to label the boxes sometime tomorrow and I would like to bring in a printed document that outlines the procedure. This is not only for the sake of my class assignment, but so the project can continue once I'm gone.
Thank you,
Rose Richard

**October 26th**

(To Rose)
I have not talked with Lindsay yet. She was in a hurry and unable to discuss it last week when she was in the office. I will contact her first thing this morning when she arrives. and let you know as soon as I can.

*LeeAnn Ryan*
*Office Manager*

**November 9th**

Hey Lindsay,

I called TerraCycle to ask permission to use their logo on school dude. They said yes, you just need to sign this document which will allow Beloit to have a (free) limited usage license.

Thanks,
Rose Richard

Dear Lauren,

per Rose Lee's email about using the Terracycle logo on Beloit College's maintenance request page (SchoolDude), I officially acknowledge the agreement and am providing this email response as my digital signature.

Will I need to send another email next November to reinstate the terms of the limited trademark license agreement?

best regards,

Lindsay Chapman

**November 11th**

(to Scott Murphy from Information Technology (IT))!

Hi Scott,
I met with you a couple days ago about my activism project involving TerraCycle boxes.

After getting Lindsay Chapman, the Sustainability Chair, as well as LeeAnn Ryan from Housekeeping involved in incorporating the boxes into Beloit’s existing waste management routine, I would like IT to also be involved by creating an icon to put on the School Dude website.

This icon would serve a couple functions. First, it would help Lindsay Chapman see how many students are using the boxes. Also, it would get students used to seeing the logo or a symbol for the program. This would also hopefully encourage more people to use the boxes by making the process for getting them easier. It would also make the process easier for LeeAnn and the Housekeeping management when students request boxes through School Dude.

I know you mentioned using links, however, I hope an icon can be added preferably before the end of the semester so that the visual icon can act as a reminder for students, and a further sign of Beloit’s commitment to the program.

Thank you,
Rose Richard

**November 8th**

Hello,
My name is Dylan Hackler. I'm a student in Pablo Toral's Global Political Ecology class. My group is working on bringing more TerraCycling to Beloit College events. TerraCycling is a program that allows for material not normally recyclable, in this case chip bags, to be “upcycled,” meaning made into other, useful things, like tote bags or furniture.

After getting Lindsay Chapman, the Sustainability Chair, as well as LeeAnn Ryan from Housekeeping involved in incorporating the boxes into Beloit’s existing waste management routine, I would like IT to also be involved by creating an icon to put on the SchoolDude website.

Rose, my group partner, met with Scott a couple days ago about our activism project involving TerraCycle boxes. He mentioned using links on the SchoolDude website, however, I hope an icon can be added preferably before the end of the semester so that the visual icon can act as a reminder for students, and a further sign of Beloit's commitment to the program.

This icon would serve a couple functions. First, it would help Lindsay Chapman see how many students are using the boxes. Also, it would get students used to seeing the logo or a symbol for the program. This would also hopefully encourage more people to use the boxes by making the process for getting them easier. It would also make the process easier for LeeAnn and the Housekeeping management when students request boxes through SchoolDude.

Thank you,
Dylan Hackler

November 9th

(From Sarah Meadus in IT)

Hello again all,
I spoke to LeeAnn and I think there is a little bit of confusion surrounding what is needed. It sounds like LeeAnn and Rose have spoken and Rose needs to circle back around with LeeAnn. It doesn't sound like anything is needed in the Portal at this time. I would be responsible for any Portal additions so please let me know if that is something that is needed in the future. In the meantime, I'm going to step back and let Dylan/Rose work with LeeAnn. It sounds like LeeAnn knows what is going on. Thanks LeeAnn!!!!!!

November 11th

(To Sarah Meadus)

Hello,
I spoke to LeeAnn yesterday and I apologize on my part for the confusion. Dylan and I both were unaware of the event planning site being different from the regular school dude website. After getting the idea of adding an icon, I went first to IT to see if it was possible and should have instead gone to LeeAnn first. Thank you to both Scott and Sarah for entertaining the idea and participating in the learning process that this mishap turned out to be. :) 

Sincerely,
Rose Richard

November 17th

From Isobel Collier to Dylan Hackler

CONGRATULATIONS!!
Your Turtle Tank Proposal was fully funded this year for $167.00. And the judges have a proposition for you: One judge in particular was very interested in this idea, and offered to double it so you would receive $334.00, with the idea of spreading it to interest houses/more places in general. To collect funding, go to the SEAL offices whenever is convenient for you.

Thank you!
Izzy C.
Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness: Revolving Door Mechanism

Rosa Ennison, Meg Kowta, Shengyuan Lu, Samantha Schonberger, Natalie Steen, Aliza Tresser

8 December 2015
Problem

The Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness is an non-governmental organization based in Minneapolis, Minnesota. Founded in 1976, the Friends mission is “to protect, preserve and restore the wilderness character of the Boundary Waters Canoe Area Wilderness (BWCAW) and the Quetico-Superior Ecosystem.”23 The Friends work to educate the general public, mining company officials, legislators, and decision makers about issues impacting BWCAW, especially issues related to the mining industry.

We combined two original prompts related to industries interacting with the environmental review process to focus on the revolving door mechanism. The revolving door mechanism encompasses individuals transitioning from government jobs into positions in the mining industry, individuals transitioning jobs in the opposite direction from the mining industry to the government, and individuals shifting from jobs in the government to lobbying positions.24 The Friends asked for a report clearly detailing the revolving door idea supported with real world examples within the mining industry.

Goals

- Research about the topic of revolving door mechanism and environmental review process.
  
  Based on the assignment Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness gave to us, we divided up the work so that each person had their own research topic, including the environmental review process, the key actors of environmental review, the permitting process and the effect on mining companies, the definition of the revolving doors, the examples of revolving doors, and the legal perspective on the revolving door.

- Write the consulting report for Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness.
  
  Our plan was to finish the first draft before Thanksgiving. After that, we would send the draft to Pablo to get suggestions from him. Finally we would deliver our report to Paul Danicic, executive director of Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness, to get comments and questions from him.

- Write, submit, and present a funding proposal to Beloit Student Council Funding Board.

- Manage logistics.
  
  Book the hotel in Minneapolis for group members. Book the van through the SEAL office and security. Get packed lunches from Bon Appetit.

- Deliver our final report and presentation to Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness in Minneapolis.
  
  After we made our final modifications to our report, we would deliver our report and give a presentation to the Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness. We would answer their questions and we would take the chance to learn more about how an environmental NGO works.

---


**Strategies**

- Communicate often.
  In our project, there were many actors involved. We had six student group members, the Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness, and our professor and classmates in Global Political Ecology. In order to be successful we had to be in constant communication with each actor. While we attempted to meet in person weekly, one of the best ways to stay in communication was by email.

- Seek funding (ask for more than necessary) and make travel plans early.
  We made sure that our very first goals were to create a funding board proposal, reserve transportation from security, and find a presentation date that would work for all of the project actors. It was important for us to overshoot the amount of money we suspected may be necessary for travel and lodging so that we were certain we had enough funding to create a successful project. Making travel plans early was vital so that students and professors were able to communicate with other professors, groups, and jobs about their future absence.

- Delegate work but maintain cohesion.
  When researching, writing papers, and creating presentations, we split up responsibilities so that we could divide and conquer. However, it is also important that we read one another’s work to understand how they were all linked. We used Google Documents so that we could see the entire group’s progress at any given point throughout the semester.

- Ask the Friends many questions along the way, clarify any uncertainties.
  We sent emails to Paul at Friends of the Boundary Waters clarifying what he wanted us to accomplish, asking if it was okay to combine two projects into one, and reassuring if we were still set to come present on our planned date and time. This strategy helped us ensure that we were prepared to present exactly what they were looking for on the correct date and time.

- Create several drafts of the report and ask for feedback.
  We decided to create more than one draft and ask for feedback from both Paul and Pablo prior to presenting in order to make sure we were reaching our goals.

- Be willing to give and accept constructive criticism.
  Our group was able to have constructive conversations on how we were doing.

- Research more than the bare minimum to gain a thorough understanding of the big picture.
  All group members did heavy research surrounding our own topics as well as the other group member’s topic so that we could understand the problem in it’s entirety.
Achievements

- Researched the revolving door mechanism, environmental review, and the permitting process.
  
  Our first achievement for this project was finding definitions of the revolving door mechanism, environmental review, and the permitting process. Having a solid understanding of the underlying concepts was important because each idea is complicated and affected by many different actors and ideas. Researching what these ideas meant was also important because our assignment was to identify examples of the revolving door mechanism, and we needed to determine how the examples we found tied in with larger ideas of environmental policy and advocacy work. We determined that there are three different types of revolving door and found an example of how the environmental review process worked for PolyMet.

- Found ten examples of the revolving door mechanism.
  
  Finding specific examples of the revolving door mechanism was one of the most difficult parts of the project, but also one of the most important. In total, we found ten examples of individuals involved in the revolving door between government, the mining industry, and lobbying. First, we found examples in Minnesota at companies such as PolyMet and Twin Metals. After feedback from Paul at Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness we also found examples of the mechanism outside of Minnesota at companies such as Gogebic Taconite and Murray Energy.

  An important aspect of this achievement was organizing the data and determining which aspects of the information was most important. Most of our research for this section was done through government websites, LinkedIn profiles, and mining websites. We succeeded in tracing each individual’s career path and determining how they were an example of the revolving door mechanism.

- Proposal to funding board was approved.
  
  After preliminary research regarding costs for lodging and transportation for our trip to Minneapolis, a financially accessed trained team member filled out and submitted the funding board proposal and supplementary spreadsheet. We reached out to the Director of Funding Board to arrange a time to present our proposal. Funding Board was pleased with our goals, how we would bring the knowledge back to campus, and our ability to plan ahead by asking for the funds months in advance. After funds were approved, details were worked out with Director of Student Engagement and Leadership, Jen Walsh.

- Traveled to Minneapolis and presented to Friends of the Boundary Waters on our findings.
  
  This aspect of our project was successful for several reasons. First of all, we were able to report our findings to Paul Danicic, executive director and Tonia Kittelson, Northern Communities Director. We gave them a brief overview of the definition of the revolving door and how the environmental review and permitting process works. We also explained the career paths of the individuals involved in the revolving door and any mining projects they have been involved in. Finally, we provided information on the moral implications of the revolving door, specifically how it influences good governance.
and social corporate responsibility.

Second, this trip was successful because we learned more about how FOBW runs and how non-profit organizations in general operate. We were able to ask Paul and Tonia many questions during and after the presentation about the revolving door and how FOBW operates. Many of our questions were about how FOBW does community outreach and education, the other projects they have worked on, and how they were going to use the information on the revolving door in the future.

Challenges

- **Narrowing down the original question:**
  The original question was quite broad and we had a difficult time narrowing it down in order to find a specific area to focus in on. To resolve this, we emailed the Friends of the Boundary Waters in order to seek clarification as well as to identify a specific goal. As a result, we were successful in gaining a clear understanding of what exactly it was that they expected to hear from us as a group.

- **Looking for examples of lobbyists involved in the reverse revolving door:**
  During our research, we discovered that there were three different types of revolving door: Industry to Government, Government to Industry, and Government to Lobbying. It was very difficult to find examples of lobbyist that moved from Industry to government due to the legislation that is put in place to discourage this process. There is usually a two year waiting period that takes place before the revolving door can happen in this respect. So this posed as challenge when looking for examples that would be relevant to our research.

- **Finding time to meet as a group:**
  It was quite challenging to find meeting times that worked for all of us as our schedules clashed. We had initially set out to meet every Sunday, but this plan did not really take shape as there were often times where some of us were unavailable. In order to resolve this issue, we worked off of Google Documents and emailed each other often. We also commented on each other’s sections in order to provide feedback and to shape the research paper in a manner that would be presentable to the Friends of the Boundary Waters.

- **Hearing back from Friends of the Boundary Waters late and having to modify the document in a timely manner:**
  Our group communicated with the Friends of the Boundary Waters via email and sometimes did not hear back from them in a timely manner. For example, we submitted a copy of our final report to them the week that we were going over to Minneapolis to present and they requested that we add more out of state examples. For this reason, we had to do some last minute research and modify our research paper a little bit. It was difficult to find relevant out of state examples, however we managed to find one and add it to our research paper and presentation in time for the presentation on Monday morning.
Recommendations

- When working on a group project with a large number of people involved, it is important to communicate as often as possible, even if it’s only updates through email. A lot of times whole weeks went by when we didn’t communicate; make sure you check in with your group members very often.

- It is really helpful to set up a weekly meeting time. Don’t be so attached to having every person at every meeting; if you try to get everyone there, you will probably never meet and you will probably get behind schedule. You can get a lot done with part of the group, and you can update whoever couldn’t make it later.

- When you’re making a project with divided labor, it can be easy to only focus on your part of the work. Make sure the whole group is always up to date on the research that everyone is doing.

- Ask for clarification on the expectations the organization you are working for early on in the project. If you are at all unsure about what their expectations are, it can be easy to misinterpret the assignment.
Appendix A: Final Report

Influence of the Revolving Door Mechanism on Mining Companies

Authors: Rosa Ennison, Meg Kowta, Shengyuan Lu, Samantha Schoenberger, Natalie Steen, Aliza Tresser

25 November 2015

Abstract: This report explores the ways in which the “revolving door mechanism” influences mining companies and their ability to carry out projects in the Boundary Waters Wilderness. Our results indicate that multiple mining companies participate in the revolving door mechanism, including PolyMet, Twin Metals, and Gogebic Taconite. This report will summarize which employees have moved from the federal government to mining, from mining to government, and/or from government to lobbying. Finally, the moral implications of the revolving door will be examined, particularly the effect this mechanism has on good governance and corporate social responsibility. Our findings can be used to determine which mining companies have expert knowledge of the environmental review and permitting processes and how they use this knowledge to their advantage.
Table of Contents

Introduction.................................................................................................................................................. pages 1-4
  - Three Types of Revolving Door........................................................................................................ page 2
  - Environmental Review and Permitting.............................................................................................. pages 2-4
    - Diagram 1: EIS for PolyMet............................................................................................................. page 4
Revolving Door Case Studies.................................................................................................................... pages 4-9
  - Movement from Government to Lobbying........................................................................................ pages 4-8
    - Table 1: Registered Lobbyists in Association with PolyMet......................................................... page 5
  - Movement from Government to Mining............................................................................................ pages 7-8
  - Movement from Mining to Government............................................................................................ pages 8-9
Moral Implications of the Revolving Door........................................................................................... pages 9-10
Bibliography.................................................................................................................................................... pages 11-13
Introduction

The revolving door is the movement of employees between government positions such as legislation and regulation and industries that are affected by government decisions regarding environmental agencies. The typical revolving door case impacts the likelihood that an industry will pass environmental review while the reverse revolving door (explanation in “Three Types of Revolving Door” section) has great influence over the amount of industry oriented decisions that are made in legislation and regulation. Cases such as PolyMet and Gogebic Taconite demonstrate the importance of being aware of all versions of the revolving door. These cases, along with others, will be detailed in the following report. In addition, we will determine how mining companies use the revolving door to navigate environmental review, which is “a formal process for thoroughly investigating the environmental impacts of a proposed project’s impacts on air, water, land, and human health – before a project is started.” Once mining companies have passed environmental review they can also use the revolving door to acquire permits. “The permitting process is an integral part of regulations and regulatory compliance [and it aims to] protect [the] environment,” by assessing the potential risk of mining projects and modifying the projects so that they have less of a negative impact on the ecosystem. We will be especially mindful of the way economics, politics, ethics, and science all contribute to environmental damage caused by mining companies manipulating environmental review with the revolving door.

Three Types of the Revolving Door

According to a report written by the Revolving Door Working Group, there are generally three different types of revolving doors. The revolving door that is most commonly referred to in the political sphere is the situation in which former government employees then work in industries that are affected by the government agencies where they were previously employed - movement from government to industry. A second type of revolving door is the “reverse revolving door,” which is when an employee for an industry affected by government regulation and legislation starts working in a government position that regulates the industry in which they were recently employed - movement from industry to government. Lastly, the third type of revolving door explains the hiring of people who were once government employees for positions in lobbying - movement from government to lobbying.

Environmental Review and Permitting

The rise of the environmental movement in the 1960s and 1970s resulted in many new policies and legislation. In 1969, the U.S. National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) was passed into legislation. Environmental review, “a formal process for thoroughly investigating the environmental impacts of a proposed project’s impacts on air, water, land, and human health –

29 Ibid.
30 Ibid.
31 Ibid.
before a project is started,” is one of the results of NEPA32. Environmental review is a complex and lengthy process, involving many interconnected actors on the state and federal levels. It is important because it can help anticipate environmental problems resulting from the project, which can be costly or impossible to undo or restore, and find ways to “avoid or minimize them before the project is permitted and built.”33

It is misleading, however, to think that environmental review decides whether or not a project is permitted. While environmental review may indicate significant environmental impacts, it has no ability to enforce or decide environmentally protective measures34. Rather, it gathers information, helps identify problems, provides modifications to the plan, and helps “establish permit conditions that will protect our environment.”35 In the United States, environmental review takes the form of an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA). For large projects, this assessment results in a document called an Environmental Impact Statement (EIS). An EIS does not only consider resulting environmental issues of the proposed project; it also examines economic and social issues.

The permitting process goes hand in hand with the environmental review process as shown in Diagram 1 below. It is “an integral part of regulations and regulatory compliance. The Minnesota Pollution Control Agency (MPCA) works with Minnesota businesses, the Minnesota Legislature and federal officials to ensure that the permitting process helps protect Minnesota’s environment.”36 Without the required permits, mining companies cannot begin actual production and extraction. So, mining companies are pushed to be as precise and accurate as possible in the data selection process and they strive to create an EIS that is as detailed as possible. They also ensure that they comply with federal laws, are transparent with the locals, and that they submit all information in a timely manner in order for their project to be permitted.

Diagram 1: Environmental Review and Permitting for PolyMet37

---

33 Ibid.
37 “What Is the Environmental Review Process?” Minnesota Department of Natural Resources.
Revolving Door Case Studies

Movement from Government to Lobbying

Based on the open resource of Minnesota Campaign Finance and Public Disclosure Board, we can find all the registered lobbyists in Minnesota. All the lobbyists that are in association with PolyMet are listed in Table 1. These lobbyists work on the subjects including environment and mining, energy issues and certification of public utilities, as listed in Table 1. Lobbyists who are in favor of other mining companies also lobby for tax issues.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Registered Lobbyists</th>
<th>Registration Number</th>
<th>Registration Date</th>
<th>Termination Date</th>
<th>Designated Lobbyist</th>
<th>Subject Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cristine Almeida</td>
<td>9888</td>
<td>11/6/2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Environment-Mining</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gail T Kulick</td>
<td>2862</td>
<td>1/15/2013</td>
<td>8/30/2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad T Marriott</td>
<td>3248</td>
<td>11/12/2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Energy Issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Public Utilities-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Certificate of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colin Marsh</td>
<td>2577</td>
<td>11/6/2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Environment-Mining</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brad C Moore</td>
<td>2333</td>
<td>2/10/2011</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Mining</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Samargia</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>2/20/2009</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mining</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Looking at all the names, we can find that six from the table follow the mechanism of the revolving door. The following is an introduction to their careers.

*Cristine Almeida*

Cristine Almeida started her career as committee administrator for Wisconsin Assembly in 1988. She became committee administrator in Minnesota Senate in 1990. Then she left the Senate for more than 9 years, serving as a government relations associate and attorney. She returned to the Minnesota Senate, taking the job of chief of staff to senate majority leader, Dean E. Johnson for 22 months. She has been the CEO of Almeida Public Affairs, LLC since February, 2006. Then she started to work for Vote Yes MN, an NGO calling on people to vote yes on the Clean Water, Land and Legacy Amendment on the Election Day in 2008, which is a campaign that Almeida Public Affairs, LLC participated in. There is no information related to PolyMet on the website of Almeida Public Affairs, LLC. However, according to her tweets, she was at the PolyMet House hearing where the DNR gave a presentation.

---

38 Minnesota Campaign Finance and Public Disclosure Board, accessed on Oct. 2, 2015. Subject description of Gail T Kulick cannot be found because his job as registered lobbyist is terminated. Listed as last name in alphabetical order.
42 https://twitter.com/xtinealmeida/status/433316478851362816
Gail T Kulick

Gail T Kulick has been a consultant in Kulick Consulting, P.A. since 2012, covering fields such as legal service, advocacy and government relations. She values her experience in different positions, saying “my successful experience as an attorney, legislator, business owner and local community leader makes me a uniquely qualified advocate, negotiator and lobbyist.”

She has been running for the Minnesota House of Representative since 2004 and finally succeeded in 2008. But she failed in the election in 2010. One of the committee she was working in is Finance Subcommittee: Energy Finance and Policy Division. She describes her highlights as a Representative, which including “passed more bills than any other freshman legislator”, “used relationships with US Senators and Congressmen to obtain USDA backed loan to keep Milaca’s largest private employer in business,” and “maintained strong bipartisan relationships by gathering Republican co-authors on all of my bills.” According to her LinkedIn page, during her two years as a legislator, she also worked as attorney/owner of the Kulick Law Office, the board of directors for Mille Lacs Health System, examiner of titles and advisor of Mille Lacs County, the city Attorney of six cities in Minnesota, and was on the board of directors of Minnesota Children’s Museum.

From Gail T. Kulick’s case, we can see that she had a plan for her career. She had experience in multiple fields, which provides her with plentiful background knowledge. She didn’t quit her job in other positions while she was a legislator so that if she failed to be reelected, as she did in 2010, she could swiftly go back to her other positions. She is the owner of a law firm, which saves her effort and time when she wants to pursue her career as a lobbyist. She had a law firm early in her career, and then later became a registered lobbyist.

Chad T Marriott

Chad T Marriot is the Chairman, Board of Directors of Camp Fire Columbia and the Energy Development Attorney for Stoel Rives LLP. His past work in Minnesota including a 200MW wind project and “[represented a] coalition of large industrial users in ongoing 2013 Minnesota Power Integrated Resource Plan docket before the Minnesota Public Utilities Commission.”

Information about PolyMet cannot be found on his online resume. He has work experience as a law clerk in Environmental & Natural Resources Division, DOJ and as a legal intern in the House of Representatives in 2007 when he was still in law school.

---

47 Ibid.
50 Ibid.
Colin Marsh
Colin Marsh is also working for Almeida Public Affairs. He has been working for this company for nearly five years as a legislative specialist. He also has six-months working experience as a legislative assistant in Minnesota House of Representatives.52

Brad Moore
Brad Moore is the Executive Vice President of PolyMet since 2011. He was once in the government working in the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency, the Minnesota Department of Natural Resources and the Minnesota Department of Commerce.53 He can be seen as an example of government to lobbyist as well as government to mining company.

More information regarding Brad Moore can be found in the “Movement from Government to Mining” section later in the report.

Joe Samargia
Joe Samargia’s current job cannot be exactly identified. In two weakly edited LinkedIn profile pages, he has worked as a consultant for summit consulting services and lobbyist for PolyMet, though it’s not clear whether he is still working in this position.54 Samargia was president of Steelworkers Local Union #1938 from 1976 to 1983 and the Commissioner of the Minnesota Department of Jobs and Training from 1983 to 199055, advocating for the rights of workers since then.56 On October 28, 1995, he appeared before the House of Representatives Resources Committee in Minnesota to make his statement. One of his viewpoints was that “the BWCAW should be open to everyone again,” for reasons related to the worker protections for recreation time.57

From Joe Samargia’s case, we can see that his work experience as the Commissioner of the Minnesota Department of Jobs and Training supports his viewpoint as an advocator for workers. He believes that the wilderness should benefit the workers in the area.

Movement from Government to Mining
We discovered two Minnesotan mining companies, PolyMet Mining Corporation and Twin Metals Minnesota, that have hired former government regulators or legislators who use their knowledge and expertise to ease the companies through the review and permitting processes.

PolyMet sent a proposal to mine in the BWCAW in 2009, although the EPA found their proposal inadequate and rejected it.58 Since PolyMet is the farthest along in the environmental review and permitting process in the Boundary Waters, it is setting the precedent for other mining companies who want to drill in the area. Twin Metals is already in the midst of a mining project, although it is three miles outside of the federally protected BWCAW, and not as tightly

54 Joe Samargia, Linkedin. There are two linkedin pages with the same name relevant to the research. Both pages are accessed on Oct 4, 2015.
regulated. The company is already actively drilling, although it is still applying for permits for projects such as creating wells. There is concern that the company’s huge mining project will degrade the nearby BWCAW.59

As previously stated, in 2011 Polymet hired Brad Moore, a former commissioner for the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency under Tim Pawlenty. Before working for Tim Pawlenty, Moore worked for the DNR. Moore was hired to be a lobbyist for PolyMet, and “his existing knowledge of the project and the process [meant] that he [could] step in immediately to effectively help the environmental review and permitting process move forward to completion.”60 Before being hired at PolyMet, Moore worked as a senior advisor for Barr Engineering, where he advised several companies on how to effectively work through environmental review.61 This indicates that he has significant experience in both government and private industry and can use his knowledge to help PolyMet successfully move through environmental review.

Twin Metals also employs former government regulators. Bob McFarlin, once the head of the Minnesota Department of Transportation, now works as the vice president for public and governmental affairs at Twin Metals.62 McFarlin outlined Twin Metals’ desired work in the BWCAW with a journalist writing for Earth Journal. He explained that the company has already done exploratory drilling in the area and has applied for permits to drill for hundreds of water wells. He also explained that the company is proposing 90 to 95 drill pads, which are areas cleared of natural growth to provide room for drilling equipment. Finally, he said that Twin Metals has drafted an “operations plan,” which will be involved in the environmental review process that the company soon hopes to complete.63 McFarlin says, “everybody wants to get it right, and everybody’s an environmentalist in that process.”64 McFarlin is involved in presenting Twin Metals in a positive light to the public and he has made several statements about the company’s proposed work. He said “we believe our underground project provides some great environmental benefits, there’s a much smaller impact to surface for the whole mining operation, plus we have the ability to backfill and store more than half our mine tailings back underground into the mine.”65

Movement from Mining to Government

The revolving door idea theoretically can go in the other direction when employees at mining companies shift into government jobs. Certain laws exist to limit the possibility of the revolving door working in this direction.

In Wisconsin, Governor Scott Walker considered hiring Bob Seitz, a lobbyist and spokesman for Gogebic Taconite, for a position in Wisconsin’s Department of Natural Resources. Walker’s staff learned of a conflict to appoint Seitz to the DNR. The EPA has a law “that prohibits individuals who have worked for a company that is applying for or has received

59 Ibid.
61 Ibid.
63 Ibid.
64 Ibid.
65 Ibid.
air and/or water permits from working within the chain of command for the governing body of those permits for two years," as reported by Walker’s spokeswoman.66

Bob Seitz’s previous employer, Gogebic Taconite, made a name for itself in Wisconsin politics in 2011 after Walker was elected. While the company initially supported mining policy, they started lobbying for changes in mining regulations. Policy changes allowed Gogebic Taconite to funnel $700,000 into a fund to support Walker and fellow Republicans campaigns, the legality of which is still being questioned. Seitz also worked for the company when they were seeking permits from the DNR to open a four mile long iron mine in an area that proved to have a lot of wetlands. Even though the company closed its office closest to the project and ended actively seeking permits, a former DNR secretary still noted a problem with Seitz stating, “It would have been a terrible precedent to have a former representative of a mining company appointed to the DNR with chain of command oversight of the mine.”67

Another example of an employee moving from the mining industry to government is Richard Stickler. Stickler worked for 30 years in the mining industry at BethEnergy Mines, a section of Bethlehem Steel. From 1997 to 2003 Stickler worked for the Pennsylvania Bureau of Deep Mine Safety and oversaw mine rescue attempts, among other things.68 After this Stickler started working as the assistant secretary in the Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA) and created a new scoring system for identifying dangerous mines.69 Representatives in the Senate criticized mining accident rates under Stickler’s scoring system, saying that the system did not do enough to prevent accidents and allowed dangerous sites to continue operating.70 Stickler was heavily criticized for the Crandall Canyon Mine Accident where 6 miners were killed in 2007.71 In his official report to the MSHA he said that the safety precautions such as props, fences, and cables put in place by the MSHA were not enough to save the workers. Under the Mine Safety and Health Act the MSHA is required to inspect underground mines four times a year. The MSHA inspected the Crandall mine five times while it was open and issued a total of 73 citations to Murray Energy, the owner of the mine.72 These inspections are often not enough to prevent mining accidents because of low enforcement mechanisms that make sure mining companies are responding to citations from the MSHA. Despite this, Stickler is against further legislation surrounding mine safety regulation and enforcement. He is against a bill written by Representative George Miller of California that would increase mine safety regulations, saying the bill was inflexible and unrealistic, although he did not suggest any more appropriate changes.73

66 Patrick Marley, Lee Bergquist, “Top mining company official was in line for DNR post, records confirm,” Milwaukee Journal Sentinel, April 6, 2015.
67 Patrick Marley, Lee Bergquist, Milwaukee Journal Sentinel.
69 Ibid.
71 Ibid.
73 Frosch, July 26, 2008.
Moral Implications of the Revolving Door

The Friends of the Boundary Waters may benefit from looking at the revolving door concept from a moral perspective. When individuals shift positions between governmental agency and mining companies, the insider knowledge brought along may encourage more opportunities for backdoor deals or leniency of established requirements. The possibility of corruption and a lack of transparency in these interactions contradicts ideals of good governance. Examining expected practices of good governance may help when presenting and explaining the consequences of the revolving door to a larger audience.

The revolving door calls into question the moral standards associated with good governance. The definition of good governance varies greatly based on the context and what morals want to be upheld. The United Nations Commission on Human Rights included the ideas of transparency, responsibility, accountability, participation, and responsiveness to the needs of the people as key attributes of good governance. Good governance supports the human rights of the key actors in a community. Community members have a right to access information about projects that may impact their environment and health. Other businesses have the right to know the agreements made between a company and the government.

Good governance protects the key actors involved by supporting democratic institutions and anti-corruption. Democratic institutions create pathways for public participation in policy making. Keeping an open format where all can participate supports representation and equality. Anti-corruption relies on concepts like accountability, transparency, and participation. To prevent corruption, institutions must share information and integrate monitoring systems to hold people accountable.

The listed concepts connected to good governance also exist under the idea of corporate social responsibility (CSR). Like with good governance, the definition of CSR changed over time and still varies today in different countries, even between organizations. A 2007 survey in the United States revealed that Americans judge a corporation’s commitment to CSR based on its “engagement with the community, its treatment of its employees, and its response to environmental protection.” Americans expect corporations to monitor themselves and to act in a socially responsible way. Yet, as of 2008, one quarter of the corporations in the United States did not prioritize CSR despite consumers’ interest in those practices. US corporations tended to implement CSR when there were financial justifications and benefits. Corporations tended to only release the amount of information they were legally required to release about CSR activities, demonstrating a resistance to transparency.

However, if a corporation fails to live up to expectations, Americans believe the government must step in and hold the corporation accountable for their actions. Unfortunately, multiple governmental organizations tasked with overseeing and reviewing CSR creates confusion around encouraging and enforcing CSR practices. Another layer of confusion is added by the US’s lack of a clear definition of what activities are expected of a corporation practicing CSR.

---

77 Ibid.
78 Ibid.
CSR. The possible role of the government in overseeing CSR, means mining companies again benefit from hiring past government employees, depending on whether that employees previous government job dealt with CSR management.

The public’s expectations of corporations to include CSR within their business plans extends to mining companies. Based on the public’s interest in corporations taking note of their impact on the environment, mining companies that acknowledge and attempt to mitigate environmental impacts may have better public relations which could help to eliminate community resistance in areas where corporations are seeking permits. Demanding transparency during the permitting process, a key concept in both good governance and CSR, helps prevent concerns of corruption surrounding the revolving door mechanism.

---

79 Ibid.
Bibliography


"Bradley H Moore: Executive Profile." Bloomberg Business: PolyMet Mining Corp.
Che, Yeon-Koo. “Revolving Doors and the Optimal Tolerance for Agency Collusion.”

"Developing the NorthMet Copper, Nickel Mining Project." PolyMet.


"Issues: Sulfide Mining." Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness.


United States v. Del Toro, 513 F.2d 656 (2d Cir. 1975), Justia.
"What Is the Environmental Review Process?" Minnesota Department of Natural Resources.
Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources. “Mining Information Sheet: Local Decision in Met
Appendix B: Email Exchange

September 17th, 2015
I am emailing to introduce you to Aliza Tresser. She is the student who will serve as the contact person for the group that will be working with you this semester. Aliza will follow up with an introductory message and might ask you a few questions to get the clearest idea of your goals for this project.
Thanks for your willingness to work with us on this project.
Pablo Toral
Beloit College

Sounds good Pablo. Looking forward to working with her.
Adios!

September 21st, 2015
Hello Paul,
I am Aliza Tresser, and I will be working with you regarding the group of Beloit College students interning with Friends of the Boundary Waters. I am a second year student, majoring in Environmental Studies. The other members of the group are Meg Kowta, a second year student, Natalie Steen, a senior majoring in Health and Society, Rosa Ennison, a second year student majoring in International Relations and minoring in French, Shengyuan Lu, an exchange student majoring in Environmental Science, and Samantha Schonberger, a senior who is double majoring in International Political Economy and Environmental Geology.

We have a few questions that we are hoping you can answer.
First, we need to find a date that we can come and present our research. The date that works best for us is Monday, December 7th. Would this work for you? If this doesn’t work we could probably go on the previous Friday, but I might not be able to go that day.
Second, the assignment description provided by Friends says that they would provide us with some examples of the revolving door model regarding mining corporations and environmental agencies. We are hoping that we can still get some examples, so that we have a clearer idea of what exactly you are looking for.
Third, we are hoping that we can get some general clarification on the assignment. What kind of resources do you suggest we use? What can we do to make our project successful?
Do you have any other general tips that will help us conduct research that will be of use to you?
I am looking forward to working with you.
Thank you for your time,
Aliza Tresser

Aliza,

Nice to hear from you. Sounds like you have a great group working on this project. I will put you guys down for the morning of Monday, December 7th ("A date which will live in infamy.") I assume 9-11 as you have done before.
Below in red is some more information on what we are calling the industrial/Regulatory environmental revolving door. This is specific to Minnesota but I should think your team's comparisons to other similar situations around the country would be helpful. Attached is a report from a student I found a while back that may help, I don't know.

As for resources to use - let me get some more input on this question in order to work some minds more excellent than my own. But I would suggest court cases involving collusion between industry and government for a start. I have an environmental lawyer who may have some specific cases to dissect. Anything mining would be relevant. Also, Glencore/Xstrata's international dealings and troubles in any country may be a start - one of your previous groups did some work on this I believe several years ago. This would be looking for the examples specific to regulator issues.

This is only a start, I hope to have some good fodder for you likely after a certain meeting on Wednesday afternoon.

Thanks,

The process entangles experts in a web of associations. The DNR supervises the environmental review, but does not do the work.

Here's how the PolyMet environmental review is working:
PolyMet tells DNR that they will enter environmental review stage
DNR hires contractor to develop the EIS (in this case, ERM is the contractor)
PolyMet pays DNR for the cost of ERM preparing the document
PolyMet submits plans to ERM for the EIS, ERM works with company closely
ERM hires subcontractors to do specific work (e.g. water quality studies, reviewing the engineering of tailings basin, etc.) Some of these subcontractors are Barr Engineering, Knight Piesold, etc.
ERM completes document with co-lead (DNR, USFS, Army Corps of Engineers) guidance

Here's why the people in the process are not independent: there's a revolving door between regulators, industry, pro-industry advocates, and contractors
Regulators leave positions to work for the mining companies: Brad Moore (MPCA Commish --> Barr Engineering --> PolyMet VP), Bob McFarlin (MnDOT, others --> Twin Metals), Bill Brice (DNR Lands and Minerals --> Franconia Minerals), Peder Larson (MPCA --> Twin Metals)

Regulators leave positions to work for contractors: Marty Vadis (DNR Lands and Minerals chief --> IDEA Drilling), Larry Kramka (DNR Lands and Minerals Chief --> Houston Engineering and now working on PolyMet as part of that job)
Electeds leave office to lobby for mining companies (e.g. Doug Johnson)
Also, there are actions that undermine independence, such as IRRRB and DEED lending money and buying stock in mining companies that are still in environmental review, providing an economic incentive to push them forward.
September 25th, 2015
Hello everyone,
Let’s try and meet sometime this weekend.
We should all look at and revise the action plan, since there is an extended deadline, and somewhat changed instructions. Natalie, did you take notes on the instructions he gave in class the other day?
We need to look over the email that Paul sent us, and make sure that we are all on the same page regarding what our task is.
And lastly, we need to talk about our specify goals and the division of labor, so that we can all be prepared to write our research papers next week.
Please ‘reply all’ so that we can work on finding a time to meet together. I am busy from 10-4 on sunday and from 4:20-5:20 isn tomorrow.
Thanks,
Aliza

September 30th, 2015
Hey team!
Since I reorganized the google docs, Aliza brought to my attention that it would be helpful to know where I moved things to. Nothing was deleted, all of it was just moved. Google shows me that all the documents have been shared with all of you, but if that is not the case please let me know and I will try to re-share documents.
Following is an outline of what's currently in the folder:
1. Action Plan*: The formal written up version of our action plan that we turned in and the more broken up division of tasks we decided upon at our last meeting.
2. Action Plan Notes*: Original description of 2 projects, notes from the syllabus for what was required in the action plan, brainstorming about action plan content and timeline, Contact Information in a table
3. Email Exchange: Emails sent up to this point
4. Research Updates: Place for each of us to update about how our research is going.
5. Trip Expenses: Links and prices for hotels - so it's all in one place.
6. Acronyms
* I separated the notes from the formal write-up of the plan because when I work I have the notes on one side of my screen and the plan on the other so I can see both at once instead of having to scroll up and down within one document. If this strategy does not work for others, we can rearrange the info.
Let me know if you have questions! I’ll respond to other email chains with my thoughts about lodging questions and the grade on our action plan.
Best,
Samantha Schonberger

October 1st
Hi Paul,
Thank you so much for the information. There is still a little bit of confusion regarding what our final goal is.
Originally, you gave us two separate assignments, one involving the revolving-door
model, especially in relation to mining, and the other on large corporations' manipulation of environmental regulation. Based on the previous email, we are unsure whether or not we should only focus on mining and the revolving-door model. We thought that we could also give examples of non-mining corporations' manipulation.

We also are not sure whether or not you would only like us to find national examples, or if we could include international examples.

Currently, our labor is divided as following: one person researching the environmental review process, another the permitting process, one defining the revolving door, and two more finding examples of the revolving door. Do you think that this reflects the desired outcome of our project?

Let me know what you think,
Aliza

October 1st, 2015
Hi team!
Given Pablo's feedback, I am concerned about my research paper topic. Since the paper is worth 25% of our grade, I want to make sure I am working on something useful and relevant. I would be interested in looking up a couple court cases involving collusion between industry (hopefully a mining company) and government and assessing the impact of the collusion. I think more than one of us could write a paper along this topic as long as we were not analyzing the same court cases. More papers looking at this means more examples to include in our final project.

I'll try to make it to the meeting, but if I can't, please let me know how the discussion with Pablo went this afternoon and if there is a more useful paper topic I could research than the one I just proposed above.

Thanks!
Sam Schonberger

I understand that. We are stuck between FOBW and Pablo and don't know what to do next. We just talked to Pablo. The first thing he suggested us to do is to send FOBW an e-mail again to clarify our assignment.

And, yes! Sharing examples is really important!
Shengyuan

I think the focus of the meeting tonight should be making sure we are focusing on the correct things for our individual research papers, so we can incorporate your research into the revised topics!
Natalie

Sam - we've revised the research topics to focus much more on the revolving door model. I put the specifics on the bottom of the research updates google doc under "New Topics". We decided the research you proposed earlier sounds helpful! We also drafted a clarification email to Friends, as I'm sure you saw.

Unfortunately, sounds like Pablo is pretty set on the grade we got for the action plan.
Natalie
October 2nd
Sorry for any confusion. I do that sometimes cause I'm forgetful. What was our original conversation as I think focusing on one would be best eh? Mining and the revolving door with national examples. Thx.
Paul

Thanks for copying me in your email to the FBWW. Your division of labor is a lot clearer now. The environmental review process could be considered a part of the permitting process. Think about that as you conduct your research and when you work on your final report.
Looking forward to reading your papers.
Pablo

October 3rd, 2015
Hi!
I went through the open information of registered lobbyists who are "in association with PolyMet". I don't understand if it is a positive or negative association. I found an example of a lady called Cristine Almeida who is currently the CEO of a public affair company named after herself. According to the list, she is "in association with PolyMet", but she has joined campaigns like VOTE FOR MN which is a pro-environment campaign. And there's no information about PolyMet on the website of her company. I went through her tweets just now, but I can't read it. There are few tweets has #polymet. I hope they are useful for you.
Full house at PolyMet House hearing. DNR presenting on financial assurance reqs and permit to mine. Thus far a quiet and respectful crowd.
These tweets will date back to Feb, 2014.
Hopefully this piece of information is useful and this is a lot of job to go over all the lobbyists who are "in association with PolyMet" and understand their viewpoint.
Shengyuan

October 8th, 2015
Hi everyone,
I just wanted to check in with the group and suggest some plans to move forward with the project.
1st Let's create a shared document; everyone can copy and paste their research papers. We can each make comments and general suggestions to each other, and once we get feedback from Pablo on them we can share that as well.
That way, we are up to date on the research that everyone else has done.
2nd Let's work on revising editing the action plan over break.
We can create a new document with a revised version. We can stick with the initial division of labor on that. Each person will update/edit their parts with research. also, if you have any research from your paper that is relevant to other parts of the action plan, please share that!
I can type up the notes I took on what he wants for this, so that we make sure we cover all
of our bases and are all on the same page.

3rd. I suggest we start working on a meeting time for the weeks after break. By that meeting we should all be caught up on ALL of the research and we all should have worked on revision of the action plan. We can then work on fine tuning the action plan and creating a framework based on our research for our first draft, which according to our timeline is to be finished by that Thursday as well.

Please ‘reply all’ if you have any comments or suggestions to these plans.

Thanks,

Aliza

October 21st, 2015

Hi Team,

WE GOT THE MONEY! Sorry to let you know we could present tonight last minute, but it went really well and Funding Board approved our proposal! They were impressed we were getting this done so early in the semester. Now we have to go to the SEAL office aka Jen Walsh to finalize procedures for how to access the funds/get reimbursed for things. Minneapolis, here we come!

Samantha Schonberger

November 1st, 2015

Hey guys,

I think that we should try and meet sometime this week to discuss strategies for writing our final document. Please make sure you read everyone’s papers and come up with a few ideas regarding organization of the document, what should be included, what other research needs to be done, etc.

Sam suggested setting up a regular weekly meeting time. What do you guys think? What times would work for you guys to meet this week?

Aliza

November 15th, 2015

I don’t think meeting today would be the most productive use of time. At this point, we need to finalize the first draft and turn that in to Pablo. The delay is my fault, but partly cause I agreed to do more than I have time for.

If someone else could help research and draft the moral section/conclusion, I think we'll be able to get it turned in tonight. I did not write about this directly in my paper, I just got a comment from Pablo that said some moral concepts would be helpful to reference to make our report/paper more relevant to our client/reader.

I will write the "Mining to Government" section this afternoon. I listed the moral concepts Pablo identified in the google doc. Please let me know if others can help with this section and you're ok not meeting. Thanks!

Samantha Schonberger

November 18th, 2015

Hey guys!

We really need to get this first draft done soon! I worked on it for a few hours today,
editing and cleaning, with the help of Shengyuan and Rosa. I also identified some resources to help write the morality section. Would anybody have time to write it tonight? Even if each person contributed a paragraph it would be helpful. I think the focus should be on good governance, and we can use the elements of good governance for further support. I am hoping we can get this first draft in tonight or tomorrow. I also think that the conclusion doesn’t necessarily have to be separate from the morality section, unless you guys think we need to do some summary in the conclusion.

Aliza

one more thing- Brad Moore is referenced in two sections- i believe in the sections written by Shengyuan and Natalie. Can you guys discuss how you want to address this issue with each other, and make the necessary changes. If he does fall under two different types of revolving door it is fine, but it shouldn’t sound like we are introducing him for the first time when we’re not.

November 19th, 2015

Hi team,
I added in some paragraphs on good governance. I will add more on transparency if Pablo thinks the morality section is worthwhile or if you guys think it would be useful. I really don't know what further suggestions we could suggest. I think we should send in this version of the draft to Pablo tonight by 10pm. Any final edits, ideas for a conclusion, or thoughts about sending it in tonight?
Thanks.  
Samantha Schonberger

Yup, sounds good to me.
I added in everyone’s bibliographies from their papers and am organizing editing it now
the last thing is that the table needs to be edited to look better. Since word and google docs are somewhat incompatible I suggest that we permanently keep the doc on google drive and transfer it to a pdf for the final product.
Aliza

November 20th, 2015

Hey all!
An update, I just shared the google doc for our First Draft with Pablo. If anyone is uncomfortable with this, please let me know.
Thanks
Samantha Schonberger

November 22nd, 2015

I will not be able to make it to a meeting this afternoon. However, we should all read through Pablo's comments in the email he sent out and divide up who will make what changes.
Since we want to finish this before Thanksgiving, I think it's reasonable to try to reply with what you will do by the end of today.
Thanks!
November 25, 2015
Morality section looks great! I’m done editing and formatting. Shengyuan is just going to add a couple citations after 2:35 and then we can send it to Pablo and Friends.
Thanks everyone
Natalie

November 26th
Hi Paul,
Our research group was hoping that you could look over the research document that we have created for FOBW and give us some feedback on it before we present to you on December 7th. Do you have any clarifying questions? Is there any additional research you believe that we need to do in order to have an affective report?
Please let us know by Monday or Tuesday of next week so that we have time to adjust our document if necessary.
Looking forward to meeting you soon. Have a great holiday!
Aliza Tresser
Beloit College Class of 2017!

December 3rd, 2015
Sorry this has taken me awhile, we have been rather busy with the FEIS release.
Looks good so far. If you have any other examples of this taking place in other states, maybe with results from the projects, that would be great to know.
Thanks and see you Monday.
Paul

Dear Aliza,
Thanks for sharing the feedback from Paul Danicic. The good news is that they liked your report and we know they are expecting us on Monday. The bad news is that they are giving us a new assignment that we only have a few days to complete. I would suggest that we try to find examples from Wisconsin, since the issues in the northern part of the state are similar. To keep it small and doable given our time constraints, we could focus on the Penokee Hills mine project. It might be a good idea to look up some lobbyists who were involved in that project. Please let me know if you feel the team can divide up the work to pull it off before we go on Sunday.
Thanks,
Pablo

December 3rd, 2015
Hey all,
I can do some research on the Penokee Hills mine for the presentation Monday. Would one other person be willing to help me?
Also, if everyone could start adding stuff to the presentation Meg shared we probably don’t need to meet until this weekend.
Thanks!
Natalie

I finished my slides and checked out the bob seitz one as well. Natalie, we can decide today how we want to present that together.
I'm going to pick up the food for tonight from commons in a bit and I can print a copy of the report too if needed.
Meg

I printed five copies, so we should be all set.
Alizaallic Mining Projects.” (April 1997).
Case Studies Outlining the Context of Current Development Projects in Guatemala

Benjamin Scheel
Gabriel Quetell
Fabiola Candela Hernandez
Riku Takahashi
Problem: Why are we studying this?
Several development projects in Latin America could have a negative impact on the communities surrounding them. This is especially true for indigenous people as many communities feel like they are not being listened to by large corporations and thus feel like they do not have a say over their own land. The corporations on the other hand argue they provide much needed jobs and stimulate economic growth in the region. This report seeks to provide details on two case studies, in terms of the background of the situation, looking at the company profile, explaining corporate structure and internal workings, and the funding sources of the companies.

Goals:
- Provide the International Mayan League with a 30 page report (written in English) detailing two case studies of the following companies: (1) Gold Corp’s Marlin mine in San Marcos and (2) Hidro Santa Cruz’s hydroelectric project(s) in Santa Cruz de Barillas
- Cover the following information as major headings in each paper: background, company profile, corporate structure, and funding streams for the companies or subsidiaries that own(ed) the Marlin Mine and Canbalam projects
- A map of Guatemala detailing what projects are currently going on, their location, and other relevant geographic features

Strategy:
- We divided the project up amongst our group members,
- Periodically communicated with the employer over skype or email,
- Regular updates from the group to the class and weekly meetings,
- Utilized Spanish language skill of group members to gather information provided by Latin American media and companies.

What we learned from class:
- Gideon’s Paradox- Immediate and tangible risks will receive proper actions. Without tangible evidence, given groups will not take action soon enough. Without proper investigation, the corporations would not take steps in order to correct situations that needed attention. Given that mining effects are not immediate, the aftermath later pollutes the waterways, yet without outside investigation and noted changes, the call for a halt in the mining process is too late. A real world example of this is that the mine was only operational for 10 years and is scheduled to shut down in 2015. Damage has been done and there could be lasting effects causing harm to those of the region who have to live with the effects for a lifetime.
- Future Discounting- Prioritizing today’s needs over tomorrow’s needs/wants. The corporation of Hidro Santa Cruz will gain economic profit in the short term from generating electricity through building a dam. However the long term needs of the people living in the area are being ignored as they are not benefitting from the electricity being produced and are experiencing social tensions as a result of Hidro Santa Cruz’s presence.
- Foregrounding- Setting the agenda via civil society. The people of San Marcos, Guatemala and the Maya Mam indigenous people brought to light the wrongdoings by Goldcorp and its personnel via blogs, protests, and The International Mayan League, an outreach organization. This nonprofit organization then contracted a group of interns that
composed a document to be handed out during a human rights panel. Given that the
government was pressured by the people, yet took no further action, suggested that the
people of this region needed to make the case with the civil society to act as an outside
pressure on the Guatemalan government.

- **Percentage Principle** - Similar to Cost Benefit Analysis. The purpose is to inform the
  people of ‘costs’ and ‘benefits.’ The Hidro Santa Cruz project highlighted the costs of the
  land rights infringement, while the benefits entailed the production of electricity and
  wealth for the privately owned Spanish company. The cost was that the corporation did
  not advise and follow the proper procedure for acquiring land according to local land
  laws in Huehuetenango. Hidro Santa Cruz chose to manipulate the Guatemalan law by
  establishing hydro-electric projects. In turn, the corporation invalidated the Community
  Consultations of the people of Huehuetenango. The hydroelectric project later produced
  natural and cheaper energy sources, which later began to power the region.

**Challenges:**
- **Lack of information:** one of the biggest challenges is inadequacy of information to write
  reports about development projects because these environmental projects were not highly
  publicized by media and companies. Private companies can choose not to make
  information public, and as long as they are not required to do so by law there is little that
  can be done to obtain that information. This information can include internal policies,
  policies for indigenous people’s rights, company feuds, and future directions the
  company will take.

- **Communication with the employer:** through this report project, we needed to contact
  periodically with the employer by emails and skype to confirm how the our reports were
  proceeding and if we were following the direction. Because she was busy for other work,
  it was difficult to get response regularly from her.

- **Doing as separate projects:** This project evolved to two smaller reports by two different
  groups so it became challenging to keep the same peace. In addition to this, we divided
  into two groups, which one group is consisted by persons majoring political science and
  the other who major anthropology is in another group so both groups have different
  perspectives on each project.

**Accomplishments:**
- Our main goal was to write two case study reports that would provide the International
  Mayan League more context on current development projects in Guatemala. Overall, we
  are pleased with our reports, on Goldcorp’s Marlin Mine in San Marcos, and Hidro Santa
  Cruz’s hydroelectric projects in Huehuetenango. We know that the information will not
  only benefit the non-profit organization, it will also be used in a handbook that will
  become a part of a document presented in a future consultation in Mexico.

- We successfully met the majority of the objectives that we outlined in our action plans.
  Our team was very efficient and cooperated well, meeting weekly amongst our sub-
  groups and as a team. Moreover, we set aside time to debrief with Juanita to go over
feedback from the first two drafts. When we realized that there were some minor setbacks due to unexpected events, we made sure to provide our supervisor with a progress report in order to establish transparent lines of communication.

- As interns, we all gained much knowledge about the disruptive activities of mining and hydroelectric power industries in Guatemala. Although we tried to be impartial, when doing our investigations, we learned that these transnational corporations work very discreetly and there are various discrepancies in timelines as described in other reports detailing when their activities commenced or ceased. It was very important for Juanita that we address the relevance of the Declaration of Indigenous Peoples Rights and land rights of these communities, and to the best of our abilities we tried providing the International Mayan League with an accurate and throughout framework that their team can then take apart for their needs.

- Moreover, each sub-group had to manage a different task. The Gold Corp team had to manage a project that had at least a decade worth of data. Their excellent charts distilled a vast amount of information into easily understood visuals. The Hidro Santa Cruz team had to rely on incoming resources from Juanita because it was hard to come by reliable sources. Although most of the packets pertinent to the activities if Hidro Santa Cruz were written in Spanish, it was a great undertaking for this subgroup to interpret these readings.

- Juanita is a very knowledge woman and it was a really great opportunity for us to learn more about her as an activist. Engaging with Juanita made us more aware of the human right violations occurring in this region. Her assignment taught us how to investigate the tensions created between these companies and the indigenous peoples.

**Holy Diamond:**

**Politics:**
The political component has large influence on development projects. Usually, government offer to extractive companies for these large scale development project after a assembly deliberated. In the case of Guatemala, the Ministry of Energy and Mining permitted a construction license to Hidro Santa Cruz, subsidiary of Hidralia Energia.

**Ethics:**
Ethical questions of whether or not Goldcorp or Hidro Santa Cruz should or should not operate in given locations are beside the point of human rights violations. The focus of how the corporations have obtained land right permits, after the communities voiced the undesired presence of either corporation. The ethical component of these two projects also revolves around the morality of extractive industries and whether or not it is ethical for people to use the earth in this way or to honor it in the tradition of the indigenous people.

**Economics:**
The economics component had two parts to it, one was the jobs and economic growth that corporations said they were going to bring to the area, the other was the economic cost of pollution, social cost, and other environmental damage caused by extractive industries and other corporations. Both sides have valid claims, and our challenge was to present those claims
accurately. At the same time we had to evaluate those claims, see how they would conflict, and which one would pose the least economic cost. All choices have costs associated with them; if indigenous communities choose not to use their land for their traditions and customs but to give it to extractive industries the cost is their culture and their tradition. If they choose to keep their culture and tradition they could lose out on jobs and economic opportunities. Both of these assume that all the proper measures were performed legally, which was evaluated in our report.

Science:
It is important to get the science right when it comes to extractive industries and others who are willing to change nature for economic profit. Mines and the surrounding areas could have stopped operating years ago but still could be considered dangerous areas for they could be full of heavy metals and other contaminants. There are dangers such as contaminants leaking into nearby rivers contaminating the ecosystem and having a hugely negative impact on the environment and biodiversity. Moreover if we are polluting the environment and the animals that live in it, we are polluting ourselves as our drinking water as well as agricultural crops are all obtained from nature and contamination of the water could have devastating consequences for the people depending on clean water sources for drinking, cooking, agriculture, and many more activities.

Advice for future:
- **Start Early:** Working hard in the beginning will allow the group to do less as the project continues throughout the semester. The project is continuous and there are always changes and improvements to be made to the drafts, therefore it is best to get done as much as possible early on. If you could start and finish early, you would have more time to make the project improved and better.
- **Have multiple drafts:** As the organization you are working for has specific expectations, it is important to adjust the report based on what they want you to do. With each draft there are changes that help narrow down the focus of the project as well as improve the project in certain area.
- **Establish weekly meetings:** It is important to meet as a group as often as possible so that everyone knows who does what and is kept up to date on the progress of the group. Meeting often also allows the group to adjust quickly to challenges that might come up and thus not be caught off guard. By having weekly meeting, members in the group can have more time to share the opinions and make the project better.
- **Communicate with your employer:** Communication is very important, among your group members as well as with your employer. Notifying your employer about the group’s progress and asking for clarification is important for aligning the expectations of your employer and the work you are submitting.
- **Not accomplishing all goals is okay:** One aspect to realize is that, given this is an internship, there are tasks that the group might not get to because we do not have enough time and/or sufficient information. **This is not an excuse to not do the work.** However, if you need an extra day or two in order to make sure the next draft is as good as it can get, there is no shame in asking for that time.

Success
- This project would have been more successful if we had found the information for our investigations closer to the very beginning. Initially, we were confused about our task. It
was unclear if we were charged with finding information about the companies or the projects themselves. After skyping with Juanita and revisiting our action plan, we had a clearer idea of how to move forward but in the process we lost valuable time.

- After our first draft, Juanita provided the Hidro Santa Cruz team with a handful of extensive reports written in Spanish, however, none of them had any quantitative information that made it into our final report. This report is less complete than desired but given the information that we could find, our efforts refocused to provide the most accurate information on the sections that we could answer.

As long as there is an interest in case studies that highlight the tension over development projects, this project will be sustainable. We were only able to accomplish two of the four projects Juanita had in mind. For the future, if the International Mayan League wanted to work with Dr. Toral’s class again, another group could take on the remaining two projects that were initially a part of this assignment. Another suggestion could be that students interested in the modern languages apply their skills to make translations of these reports so that the information can be disseminated widely which would include places outside of Latin America.

### Appendix A Goldcrop

*This table details the main committees of Goldcorp*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Committee</th>
<th>Responsibility/Duty of Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

93
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Functions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Governance and Nominating committee     | · is responsible for nominating new members to the board of directors, facilitating ongoing director education, providing new directors with education and orientation programs  
   · the board evaluates itself on a yearly basis  
   · it also considers resignation of a director [1] |
| Compensation Committee                  | · deal with human resources and compensation  
   · ensures Goldcorp has a executive compensation plan  
   · recommends changes of company goals and CEO compensation to the board[2] |
| Audit Committee                         | · helps the board fulfill responsibilities in relation to internal control and financial reporting  
   · Has oversight over Goldcorp’s financial statements, Goldcorp’s compliance with legal and regulatory requirements  
   · Sets standards of conducting business for everyone working for Goldcorp  
   · Is responsible for Goldcorp’s enterprise risk management process[3] |
| Sustainability, Environment, Health & Safety Committee | · Review and monitor environmental, health, and sustainable issues an policies on behalf of the board of directors  
   · Responsible for rolling out of SEMS in 2014  
   · Consist of 2-5 directors[4] |
| Ethics Committee                        | · Reviews charges of fraud, corruption, and bribery  
   · Helps employees in dealing with situations where there is a conflict of interest  
   · Precautionary principle  
   · Reviews corrective action suggestions by the management [5] |

[1] From the terms of service for the Governance and Nominating Committee, December 4th 2014 Accessed October 5th 2015
Appendix B Hidro Santa Cruz

Excerpt from section 1.1  Events On and After May 1, 2012

Following a turnover of politicians in the municipality in 2012, the company introduced heavy machinery in Santa Cruz Barillas. On May 30, 2012, in a massive effort of solidarity, thousands...
signed a declaration addressed to the mayor and city council of Santa Cruz Barillas. August 27, 2013 Saul Mendez Aurelio Munoz and Antonio Velasquez Rogelio Lopez, community authorities in the defense of natural resources and human rights, were arrested on their way to the hearing of case 92/2012[1]. They were detained illegally and imprisoned for eight months after unjust accusations of involvement in the events that occurred on May 1st, and statements linking them to the lynching that occurred in 2010 and 2011. Since these events have transpired, Saul and Rogelio have been set free. Still in 2012, former Guatemalan President Otto Perez Molina had been expected to meet with representatives of the Sociedad Civil de Barillas after announcing a dialogue table on September 19th, where the topic of discussion would be hydroelectric projects that could potentially be installed in the northern region of Huehuetenango.[2] Within the first six months in office, the Molina administration approved 68 new mining licenses, with 734 pending, and 47 exclusive hydroelectric licenses already in existence or processing. Despite leaders from various communities showing up, the meeting never occurred, and no official notification confirming or cancelling this event was ever sent out by his office.[3]

Because of those events in the community, tension between the local people and Hidro Santa Cruz have continued rising. The criminalization of leaders has impacted the community and families have devoted themselves to gathering the means to travel to the prisons located more than 400 miles away to see their imprisoned spouses.[4]

[2] Ibid.  
[3] Ibid.  
Dear [Name],

I am writing to confirm that one of your Beloit College students is currently working on the prompt you submitted with respect to your work with the International Mayan League and indigenous nations in Guatemala. Firstly, we wanted to briefly introduce ourselves, our breadth of skillsets and academic training, so that we can highlight a few of the strengths going into the report we will submit to you before the end of the semester. Secondly, we want to know the parameters of this assignment so that we provide you and the community you are servicing with a useful project.

Our team is composed of a combination of majors/concentrations in political science, international relations, cultural anthropology, and biology (evolution, behavior, ecology). Three of our members are bilingual/intermediate proficient Spanish speakers. Moreover, our members have studied abroad in Quito (Ecuador), conducted independent research among rural indigenous populations in Cusco (Peru), and completed a project for a non-profit organization in Belize. Additionally, many of us have engaged in projects with the local Latino population here in the [City] community. All our members are very capable of conducting research and make presentations in English (and some other languages), but if you require we submit our reports and final project to you in Spanish, we can absolutely do that too.

At this moment, we have reviewed the prompt and are outlining an action plan in the next two days to move us forward. We would like to know (1) what is our task/ focus, (2) what kind of report/ product you expect from this group, (3) any preliminary deadlines, (4) dates we can get in contact to provide a progress report, and (5) the best way to contact/ receive feedback from you. We are well aware that changes may occur within the next three weeks once you have collected your own fieldwork and we will build some flexibility into our schedules and adjust accordingly.

Before your departure, if you are available, we would like to invite you to a Skype call to get to know one another briefly. Please feel free to contact me (preferably at [phone number]) or my cell phone [cell phone number] for my fellow teammates, whom are also ccced on this email.

Best,

I am so pleased to meet you all, you sound like a wonderful group of students with a great set of skills, experience, and interest! Thank for such a thorough email, and for all your questions. I do want to clarify that I understand Fabiola is the team lead, but I wanted to welcome the entire team in this first email as we begin to work with one another.

"At this moment, we have reviewed the prompt and are outlining an action plan in the next two days to move us forward. We would like to know (1) what is our task/ focus, (2) what kind of report/ product you expect from this group, (3) any preliminary deadlines, (4) dates we can get in contact to provide a progress report, and (5) the best way to contact/ receive feedback from you. We are well aware that changes may occur within the next three weeks once you have collected your own fieldwork and we will build some flexibility into our schedules and adjust accordingly."

To respond to the above paragraph, I am still working on the outline for the document, and so I will have that to you tomorrow. This will include deadlines, amount expected per sections, best way to communicate moving forward, etc. I accept your invitation for a skype call as that would be helpful for me to. What would work for your group? I am available on Monday anytime after 11 am EST and Tuesday morning. My skype is juanitamarisol.

As an organization, we are excited to have your assistance to produce quality and beneficial reports for project affected communities. I look forward to working with you and also helping you to gain additional experience and understanding of these issues.

Warm regards,
Gentlemen,

Please confirm the times that I have sent you all over Facebook. It is urgent that I confirm that really soon. Also, please read the case study outline before we meet with [Redacted] over Skype. It has the instructions and deadlines that we are expected to follow for this project. I quickly skimmed it over and we have less than a month to pull our research together for the draft. She was very thorough and attached some resources to it. I would look into seeing if we can get help from the Spanish department along the way when we are making revisions. We need to start outlining a strategy to address this so if you have thoughts about it, preferences about what you want to do, or questions - please start sharing them ASAP with the group so that we can continue to be on the same page.

Thank you. See you all later!

Date: Sat, Sep 19, 2015 at 5:14 PM
Subject: Case Study outline timeline and instructions

Thank you for your patience with waiting for the information. I hope that this provides enough guidance and work to get you all started next week. When would be a good time to meet with the team? As indicated, I will not be able to meet Monday morning, but can meet Monday afternoon or Tuesday anytime. It would be wonderful to meet with everyone, but I know schedules can be pretty tricky. If meeting with the entire team is not an option, I would love to meet with you as the team lead.

Let me know. Enjoy your weekend.
kind regards,

[Redacted]

Dear friends and colleagues:

Last year the International Mayan League/USA began a process of transition and restructuring. The Mayan League is the legacy of Maya leaders and allies from the sanctuary movement who came together in the 1990s because they wanted to ensure that the history and the situation of Guatemala was not forgotten. The Mayan League has worked for many years at the grassroots level and in recent years, we decided to refocus our work on our collective rights related to our lands, territories, and environment.

Many of our elders often say it is better to walk slowly and take steady and firm steps than to be hasty and fall. We followed that philosophy and in the last year we were busy rebuilding our core programs, raising funds for our work, and strengthening our partnerships both in the United States and Guatemala. Our journey over the last several months has been met with successes and challenges, but both have provided tremendous lessons and opportunities.

Today, I am so pleased to announce that we are launching the International Mayan League Website, WWW.MAYANLEAGUE.ORG. We are happy to share with all of you, who we are, our programs, and our work going forward in 2015!

We as a Maya organization focused on the rights of our peoples and the rights of Mother Earth are deeply concerned for the safety of our leaders and elders and the health of our environment. Just since the beginning of September three prominent leaders have been killed in Guatemala due to their advocacy related to development projects. Every day the violence toward the men and women defending the rights of our peoples and our territories intensifies. Many of us have friends and family members who are intimidated and harassed for their advocacy. The escalating levels of human rights violations, impunity, and environmental degradation cannot continue. For things to change, we need to be part of the solution.

We invite you to visit our website and learn more about our work, projects, and priorities. We look forward to hearing from you and working together for our future generations.

September 24, 2015
LAJUJ CHEF
Washington, D.C.
Dear all,

Sending along some initial document. Also, please visit some of these sites as well.

http://www.centralmercadito.com
http://www.enricoysamartes.com/imagenes.html GREAT MAP SOURCE. Please use this in the case studies. If you find more current maps, then please go ahead and use those. I will have limited internet access while gone, so I hope you get the google drive folder I just sent along.

Saludos Cordiales,
Getting organized for POL 255 Activism project

Sep 27

Hi Jason,

I apologize for not getting the folder set up like I had mentioned. I will do this after class. I had my seminar retreat and got back yesterday feeling extremely sick. I've started to set up the folder and I will start uploading the documents I sent you.

Also, how are we going to tackle the action plan assignment. We need to turn that in tomorrow or Tuesday at 8am? I cannot remember, I'm a bit dizzy from the medication that I am on.

Anyways, please look at the folder and start phasing in the research that you think will be relevant.

Thank you!

POL 255 Activism Project

Sep 27

I'm pretty sure he said Tuesday at 8am.

Sep 27

I thought the action plan was the other groups only, is that not the case?

Sep 27

He simply wants to know how we will be working on our project.

1) Working with 
2) How are we organizing the work
3) What time scale we will be working on
4) Any obstacles that we may encounter
5) Measurable goals, that is how will we know where we are (gaging progress)
6) Expectations

Something along these lines

Action plan

Sep 27

For the action plan that is due tomorrow, would you like it to be about the holy diamond or rather the criteria below?

1) Working with 
2) How are we organizing the work
3) What time scale we will be working on
4) Any obstacles that we may encounter
5) Measurable goals, that is how will we know where we are (gaging progress)
6) Expectations

I am a little confused as to what the objective of the action plan is

Sep 27

Since you are not doing a project on campus, you should do the action plan that will help you meet the expectations.

Thanks,

Sep 28

Ben could you please reply with the email that Pablo sent you telling us specifically what he is looking for. I checked with the group doing the boundary walls and the way they are splitting their project is based on the four corners of the diamond + an introduction. Of course we need an introduction but since we have two projects I don't see why it is so. I think there are too many within our group. Then just do the diamond for each project since we should not assume that both are going to look the same. The diamond breakdown is:

1) More person for Project 1: Martín Man - San Martin, Guatemala
2) More person for Project 2: Hites Santa Cruz - Huisuenango, Guatemala

I would suggest that you work on Project 1 because down the line if there is translating that needs to occur, you will already be familiar with that project and could focus on working through the translations for that project.

Let me know what you think we need to do on the ASAP.

Sep 28

Take your time and knock out the parts that I have already taken an interest in. I am feeling a little out of sorts today, what do you think? How should we get about this.
Can you please submit via Moodle?

Do not make your assignment too difficult. It is clearly divided into sections and that makes grading it easy. You have a clear instruction of labor and a clear set of deadlines. There should help you pace yourself well as the semester goes along. You have done a good job documenting everything on the background of your first and some important principles and legal documents that undermine the work. Excellent! Make sure you keep thinking in terms of the first and second drafts you write to be able to write strong arguments. The A4 documents, for example, serve as part of the second drafts of the draft.

In terms of the research paper that is due on Monday, I recommend that rather than writing one or two of the sections of the report that you intend to write, you try writing a short report that will include most of those sections. With that background, you can then develop it further. I am interested in having you start with a good overall structure. I think it will not be an easy task to raise a big concern. You have no reference or citations to acknowledge the source of the information that you used. This is a big problem. It is a violation of academic work. The college has a policy of failing assignments that fail to provide references. Since I know you will not make the mistake again, I am not going to升降级.

Grade D

I did not realize that the action plan needed to include the citations too because I thought that it was more of an internal check in. I take full responsibility for that careless mistake and have attached the version that includes citations and includes references. A few of the documents referenced were later added and I went back to Moodle to try and find more information with respect to publication dates and authors.

If it is possible, could you please reconsider rejecting this version of our action plan with the references. I understand what your concerns are, however. I was truly not my intent to violate school policies. I simply overlooked a very important aspect of this assignment.

Please let me know if you are unable to view this document properly. I am sending this from my phone since I don’t have access to a functional computer.

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1gYx2a9nLY65Bc5jFrk4PGa9n9ASggSjJ/view

Thanks for your email. Every time you use information generated by other authors you need to acknowledge, regardless of the nature of the document. It is a matter of academic honesty.

There will be plenty of opportunities this semester to bring the group up.

See you in class.

POLS 255: Future Dates to look out for.

Hey guys and girls,

I included the dates for the upcoming two weeks. Here are the dates:

Dates:

October 12th, Monday → Expect feedback from mentor.
October 15th, Thursday @ 12:00 p.m. → Submit updated Action Plan #2, updated portion in Google Doc, to be compiled for submission to mentor.
October 16th, Friday @ 8:00 a.m. → Submit draft to Action Plan #2.
October 19th, Monday, Monday → Expect updates/feedback from mentor.
October 21st, Wednesday @ 10:00 p.m. → Meet and compile Action Plan #2.
October 22nd, Thursday @ 8:00 a.m. → Action Plan #2 due.

***Varies by what mentor provides us with feedback and updates on project.

Cheers,
Dear,

I hope that by now you have had a chance to relax after returning from Guatemala. Have you fully healed?

Here are a few things on our end that we would like feedback/update on:

1. Attached below are the first drafts of Projects#1 & #2 that are due to you.

2. The second "Action Plan" assignment for the course is coming up soon. Our team will definitely like to expand on what we already have based on the group research that we have done. I would appreciate a few editing suggestions before I submit the drafts. It is due on the 15th of November.

We look forward to hearing from you soon!

Best,

[Redacted]

Hey guys,

I put together our draft, I've attached it below. I know some parts are kind of redundant but laying it out by its sections will help us see where we can take some things out. If ours end up looking different, like having different formats that will be ok because we can say that within our group we are working at different paces or something. I don't know, I usually did stuff now so this email may not make much sense. Anyways, please send me yours too so that I can send that along to [Redacted] today.

hearing at the commission visit site for English


1. 22 de Octubre 2015, 4-5PM
   Derechos Humanos y Justicia Transicional en Guatemala

2. 22 de Octubre 2015, 5-15PM
   Denuncias sobre criminalización de defensores y defensoras de derechos humanos y operadores de justicia en Guatemala

3. 22 de Octubre 2015, 6:30-7:15PM
   Situación de derechos humanos de los pueblos indígenas en el contexto de las actividades de agroindustrias de palma aceitera en Guatemala

"Recuerda que puedes seguir la transmisión en vivo de la audiencia a través de www.cidh.org y la cobertura en vivo a través de la cuenta en Twitter @CIDH y con el hashtag #CIDH AUDIENCIAS"

Comisión Interamericana de Derechos Humanos (Página) 15 hrs.

Hoy inician las audiencias de nuestro 156 Periodo de Sesiones!

Esta es el calendario de las audiencias que estaremos celebrando hoy lunes en el transcurso del día.

Recuerda que puedes seguir la transmisión en vivo de las audiencias a través de www.cidh.org y la cobertura en vivo a través de nuestra cuenta en Twitter @CIDH y con el hashtag #CIDH AUDIENCIAS.
Moving Forward w/ the Action Plan

Goals
Objectives
The Client
Research (general info, company profile, corporate gov, funding)

Give examples of our research in each area
Project 1: Marlin Mine

Project 2: Hydroelectric dam

Project 1 improvements suggested for [redacted]
Project 2 improvements suggested by [redacted]

Conclusion (General assessment) and goals
Improve draft (how)
Translate into Spanish

POLS 255 Feedback on action plan 2

Great job!

I am attaching your second draft of the action plan. You will find my comments at the end.

Fwd: Marlin Mine

Here are the Marlin mine edits. I have gone and fixed some things like grammar and tense, but I think more can be done. This should be pretty straightforward once there is another check from the students. overarching themes were similar to the Hydro Paper.

A) Placement of content and relevance
B) Tone, and factual versus opinion
C) Sources and citation
D) Grammar

I strengthened the pieces on shareholders, funding streams, when shareholders held their meetings, any use of these spaces by indigenous people, and how the mine operates.

I think there is enough here to tighten up the writing in the next couple of days.

The edits may seem like many. However, as with the other document, it is a good first draft and now we can just work on tightening the document.

Thank you to all for all your hard work and have a wonderful Saturday!
Good morning gentlemen,

I'm having some health issues this morning but I wanted to make a couple notes of a few things that happened over the weekend. Firstly, we received a lot of comments and suggestions from [redacted] on what to move move forward with in our second draft. It's a little later than ideal but let's keep working towards making this a better draft now. Secondly, for the Hidro Santa Cruz group, I had to go through and read the UN and country reports to fill in more information about the current status of the project and materials that will help us better explain the holy diamond. For Martin Mine, let me know if you need me to get in contact with [redacted] about that to find more relevant information. She may have some news after her trip to Guatemala.

Thirdly, I tried getting in touch with Nick from First People's Revitalization last night, to ask about the funding streams and financial matters that we were lacking, but he wanted to back track a bit on that and wants to skype/ do an email trail to fully break apart and make those questions for Nick more targeted so that we are being respectful of his time. I don't think I will be able to skype today, I can barely talk or move around so my hope is that I can keep responding to his over email to get that sorted because we need that info ASAP. Good luck in class today!

P.S. She still hasn't followed up on the mapping resources so I will try to ask her more about that just so that we can reflect on how manageable her expectations for these maps really are.

Thank you again for all your work and I look forward to being in touch.

Warm regards

On Thu, Nov 19, 2015 at 3:33 AM

Dear [redacted]

I did a check-in with the other members and we have a few setbacks. Both [redacted] and [redacted] have been feeling unwell so on our end, our draft needs a bit of filling in and piecing together after we have had a chance to work through answering all your comments. We need some time to catch up. As for next week, they request some time too to finish answering your comments [redacted] but they have made more progress on the mapping. This week has been packed with many assignments, so we ask for a grace period until the end of Saturday to organize ourselves and finish up our drafts.

We apologize for the inconvenience and hope you can understand we are trying to put in the time to address your feedback and make these drafts better.

Best,

Fabiola

On Tue, Nov 17, 2015 at 8:37 AM

Dear [redacted]

I hope you have not been feeling well. A group check-in would be really good!! This is a second draft, so I think things are fine and on track. If you have questions as you finish up for Wednesday, please just send them along via email to me. I know that the information is hard to get, even if you speak the Language. Thanks for checking with the others to see where they are are.

Telara

Excuse me for not replying sooner, I've been experiencing really poor health the last two weeks now that it is getting much colder in Wisconsin. I looked through the documents you send for Hidro Santa Cruz and as far as I can tell we are unable to provide really elaborate information about the way the project is being funded although we do know where some of the finances are coming from according to one of the articles you sent me. I will check in with the gentleman on this team to see if Martin Mine needs anything else to refine their information. Now that I have these documents I think I will be able to distill and refine some of the information that follows the format of the example you provided. If we are to turn into you a draft by Wednesday, maybe it would be beneficial to de brief sometime before the end of the week, since trying to do that tomorrow may be really unrealistic for everyone's schedules. I will look into seeing if the other group has any questions but at least for Hidro Santa Cruz, I am fairly certain that the information you provided can be helpful although it's just been time consuming since a few of us are not too confident with reading in Spanish but we are working through that slowly.

Let me know your thoughts, if a skype session looks reasonable sometime soon.
I am very sorry to hear about your health. This evening I am not available. I will just let Nick know that everyone is working on edits and you have been ill, no problem. Let's touch base soon though because the document will need some of this information. Perhaps we can touch base late afternoon tomorrow.

Busy tonight.

On Tuesday, November 10, 2015 at 4:01 PM, [REDACTED] wrote:

Hello, I will be on the last six days and just starting to feel better. I'll look into the questions a bit more when I have a minute to look through them. I am playing a bit of catch up with coursework but I will get back to you tonight. Would you be available to Skype with me if necessary?

On Tuesday, November 10, 2015 at 9:25 PM, [REDACTED] wrote:

I hope you are having a good Thursday. I am just touching base about the questions. I am also sending along a report that just came out. I thought we could all take a look at this document to help us in the restructuring of the papers that are in draft right now. I think it gives a good road-map of what someone else did related to a project. I look forward to being in touch and I hope you are feeling better.

Abrazos,

Nov 23

I hope you are well. I am just touching base as I still am waiting for the Marlin Mine paper. Could you send those today? From this second draft, I will pull together the questions that I will send along to Nick - don't worry about those questions. I appreciate all the work you are doing for these two reports.

Thank you again for all your time and effort on this research!

Abrazos,

Nov 23

I will send the second draft of the Marlin Mine document today. I have edited the majority of the document, yet I am stuck on a certain issue. I will email separately to follow up.

Nov 23

Great! I will wait for your your separate email to see how to best assist.

Warm regards,
Hi [Name],

Please let me know how does this sound, did I cover all the details wrapping our work?

Dear [Name],

After reconvening, our team realizes that the remainder of our time would be best applied gathering the information necessary to answer all the sections asked of us for the individual case studies. We believe that instead of rushing to produce a Spanish version of the work we have drafted thus far, it would be more beneficial to you and your organization that we focus our efforts to create a final report that is more thorough. We may not possess the appropriate language to convey the most accurate meaning required of these documents. However, having a strong draft written in English will allow your team the flexibility to make the most out of the translation and prevent the loss of context.

As we finishing, of course, the presentation shared with our classmates will be a week from today, December 8th. Consequently, our final draft will be submitted to you shortly thereafter. Moving forward, our sub-groups are meeting this week to refine our research and review the material that was not covered in the first and second drafts. While we begin the wrap-up process, we would appreciate any input you have concerning our previous drafts.

Hope to hear from you soon!

Prep [Name]

After reconvening, our team realizes that the remainder of our time would be best applied gathering the information necessary to answer all the sections asked of us for the individual case studies. We believe that instead of rushing to produce a Spanish version of the work we have drafted thus far, it would be more beneficial to you and your organization that we focus our efforts to create a final report that is more thorough. We may not possess the appropriate language to convey the most accurate meaning required of these documents. However, having a strong draft written in English will allow your team the flexibility to make the most out of the translation and prevent the loss of context.

Currently we are a week away from finishing, of course. The presentations shared with our classmates occur December 8th. Consequently, our final draft will be submitted to you shortly thereafter. Moving forward, our sub-groups are meeting this week to refine our research and review the material that was not covered in the first and second drafts. While we begin the wrap-up process, we would appreciate any input you have concerning our previous drafts.

Hope to hear from you soon!

Thank you for writing and for your work progress report for the group. I am in the process of reviewing your papers and will provide you those comments by tomorrow evening. Regarding your plan, I think that is sound as we can take care of the translation before our workshop. I cannot believe you all will be done in one week, time goes by so fast! I will be available by skype or phone, and less so on email for the rest of the week. Thank you again and I look forward to being in touch soon.

Saludos a todos y todas, and happy December!
Dear [Redacted],

Oh no! I hope all your documents are retrievable or safely backed up.

Absolutely no problem. We will keep working with what we have through the weekend. Our team will be regrouping on Sunday to finalize what we have so if we could get those documents by the morning then we may still have some time to make a few corrections in the evening.

On Thu, Dec 3, 2015 at 2:13 PM, [Redacted] wrote:

As an update my computer just crashed and I can’t get to any documents therefore I will not get them to you today as promised. I am sorry for this delay. I will get them back to you as soon as I can.

Warm regards,

Hi!

Thanks for sharing your report for the International Mayan League with me. I now had a chance to read it and provide some feedback. I am really impressed by the diversity of topics that you covered, the multiplicity of sources and the great job you did providing references for your sources. Excellent work on those grounds. I have a few suggestions to help you strengthen your report. None of them require that you make radical changes to your existing sections. Rather, I recommend that you integrate the sections well together and that you do a bit more research on a number of areas to strengthen your arguments.

- Make sure your transitions are smooth. Right now you are jumping from one section to the next and sometimes the bump is not logical. You need to make sure that each section flows clearly from the previous one. For example, in section 1 you start by providing some information on the current mine and then jump back five hundred years to tell the arrival of the Spanish. What is that about? What does that have to do with the current project? Unless you help your reader understand why those sections are included, it will not flow logically and the reader will get sidetracked. I understand that you addressed the sections you were told. But you can’t have a choppy writing style or your report will not be effective. Make sure you clean up those transitions. Your client can later do whatever they want with the report and the information, but you need to do a good job writing it.

- Your client is challenging some of your statements, such as those on the binding character of declarations sponsored by the UN. Declarations are soft law, not hard law. Binding international law is only that which has been signed by Guatemala and ratified by the national legislature, turning it into law. Sometimes the Inter-American Court of Human Rights will hear cases coming out of a country in the Americas on indigenous rights. The rulings of the Court are not binding but are almost always observed by member countries. If you do not find evidence of existing binding law on indigenous rights, you can’t say that there is. Having said that, the Constitution of Guatemala was amended in the 1990s after the end of the armed conflict to grant important rights to indigenous groups. That might be a good source for you to look. I am not necessarily suggesting that you read the entire constitution but you can find the key sections on indigenous rights or you can also look up essays on indigenous rights and Guatemala law thought J-Stor. Make sure your search includes law journals.

- Avoid sweeping generalizations such as “corporations sometimes kill”. Well... that is too general. You can rephrase your conclusions about the corporation that you are studying so that you are more accurate.

- Make your report more analytical and less descriptive. The key to write a good report is to find the information your client needs and interpret it for them. Make sure that every section reads like an actual paper in which you have a major thesis and conclusions. For example, chapter III on corporate governance provides a very detailed description but it does not tell us whether this structure has resulted in effective engagement with indigenous peoples. You need to assess the evidence. It might be a good idea to review how well this structure reflects Guatemalan or Canadian law and how it impacts the提取 of natural resources in areas populated by indigenous groups in each country? Canadian law requires the creation of “comanagement boards” staffed by aboriginal groups to review the mining requests. Is this the case in Guatemala? Is this reflected in the corporate governance structure that you find?

- Your section on “funding streams” has a lot of data but you are not communicating it as effectively as you can. Remember that numbers are hard to remember and some people are scared of them. You need to try to walk your reader carefully through this. Create a table or a graph to show the numbers in terms of both loans, equity, profits and dividends. You also need to be clear on what the numbers indicate. For example, a firm can raise money through a number of strategies. One of them is through loans, such as the one by the World Bank. When a firm gets a loan, it must repay the loan plus a given interest. Equity is another way to raise funds. This means that someone (normally a corporation) buys stock in a firm and a share in the profit. They can do this through a contract with the other owners or in the stock exchange if the firm is listed. Buying equity does not mean you get the money back or interest. It means that you get a share of the dividends equivalent to your share of equity. You also discuss profits. This is the revenue the firm generates from the sale of its goods or services minus the cost of production. Profits are not necessarily going back to the owners. Part of the profits are used to pay back the loans and the interest on these loans and that is normally included in the costs. Whatever is left over is then distributed proportionally among those who hold equity/stocks through dividends. Whether the money stays in Guatemala or leaves depends on where those who hold the equity or the title to the loans are located. Your client will like to know that. Make sure that you create a table in which you include data on loans, equity, profits and dividends to make the finances as clear as possible.

- You are missing two critical sections, introduction and conclusion. Take the introduction to describe the project that your client gave you and the goal set. Highlight its relevance to them, to the stakeholders in Guatemala and to yourselves as students. Then discuss the structure of the report and advance your main conclusions.

The conclusion should remind your reader what your main findings are and should also provide some recommendations, including recommendations for action but also in terms of information that you believe they might need but might have neglected to ask you to find.

I hope you find my suggestions useful. Please feel free to stop by or email me back if you have questions.

Looking forward to reading your final draft. I wish you good luck with the final version and with your presentation for [Redacted].
Thank you for all the revisions on your second draft. It is a solid and well-done job! I have gone ahead and provided some minor edits on wording. I hope that on the section related to the UN Declaration that it is clearer. Yes, you are correct, it is not a binding document, however, it reflects already agreed upon customary and international law. I placed some wording in there and a citation for that wording.

Indigenous peoples are using the Declaration in addition to the ILO 169, relevant domestic frameworks, the Universal Declaration on Human Right and other case law to fight for their rights. This Declaration though non-binding is a critical step that has been taken by countries to acknowledge that we exist as distinct peoples and that we have specific needs and rights, therefore it is important that the Declaration be framed in that manner.

I am going to send now a generic list of questions for both papers related to the shareholder side and see if we can get any additional leads from you all, and if not then I will reach out to

Thank you again for this second draft!
Warm regards,

---

Thank you for the clarification and all of your efforts. We shall address these points in the upcoming days for the final version of the document.

Best,

---

Dear team,
Thank you again for the papers. I am attaching additional questions that would help beef up the papers and guide us to some advocacy plans for January. This pertains mostly to shareholders and profit loss, in addition to some more questions about some of the current policies for the companies and their annual meetings. I know you are meeting this evening, might we find an additional time for a quick check-in in the next few days? If this does not work for your schedule, just let me know and we can go back and forth via email.

Thank you again,
Warm regards,

---

Hi!
I noticed a few comments and think that you will find most of the information she needs in the firms’ annual reports. These are normally available on their website through the department of investor relations. If you can’t find it on the Guatemalan website, you might have to try the website for the Canadian parent.

Looking forward to your final report,

---

Hello,

Thanks for letting us know! We’ll work on incorporating that info ASAP. The Friends of the Boundary Waters is this weekend isn’t it - hope everything is going swell.
For documenting the emails, do we only include the email with [redacted] mentioned or is it all email regarding the project?

Like between Gabriel and I.

Thank you for the clarification.

You need to include all email exchanges used for the project.

Thanks,
As I mentioned, I would email you with a follow on section that I am curious about. I included an argument, but I think it was problematic. I will include the research that I have found that supports one of my arguments, but a comment suggested that my research was incorrect.

It is highlighted at the end of section two. I would appreciate it if you and your team could help me understand the text and possibly help modify the language to have a more accurate description of what is occurring.

Best,

[Redacted]

Nov 23

Great! I will wait for your corporate email to see how to best assist.

Warm regards,

[Redacted]

Nov 23

I am not sure how I missed your email about your questions. I do...

Hi,

My apologies for taking so long with getting this to you. I have included the second draft of the Martin Mike project. I left two comments that I would like clarified, in order to further assist. Once again, I apologize for the tardiness.

Best,

[Redacted]

Nov 24

Hi,

My apologies for taking so long with getting this to you. I have included the second draft of the Martin Mike project. I left two comments that I would like clarified, in order to further assist. Once again, I apologize for the tardiness.

Best,

[Redacted]

Nov 24

[Image of Martin Mike in San Francisco, California]

Hi,

I am continuously reviewing this second draft. Thank you! I will look at your comments/questions and plan to work on these over the weekend. Thanks again for all your work.

Have a wonderful holiday weekend.

[Redacted]

Nov 24

Thank you!

[Redacted]

Nov 24
Bibliography:


Goldcorp 2014 Sustainability report, accessed October 5th 2015


I. INTRODUCTION
According to the Guatemalan Commission of Historical Clarification, outbreaks of armed conflict coincide with institutions that promote the structural injustices, political marginalization, racism, and the increasingly exclusionary and undemocratic processes.\textsuperscript{80} In particular, racism, which characterized 20th century Guatemala, largely polarized society by reaffirming these antiquated ideas of class status along racial identities of the Ladinos (mestizos or individuals of mixed ancestry) and indigenous peoples.\textsuperscript{81}

Signing of the Peace Accords on December 29, 1996, brought an end of thirty-six years of internal instability (civil war 1960-1996).\textsuperscript{82} However, the process of achieving peace has been sluggish and punctuated by the tension between indigenous groups and military or paramilitary forces historically serving the government.\textsuperscript{83} Moreover, committees established for the clarification of incidences specific to human rights violations and acts of violence have struggled to document victims’ stories as part of the official peace process.\textsuperscript{84} There has been little indication that any legislative or judicial reform has brought justice to the communities destroyed as part of the heinous crimes of the 1980s. In particular, Mayan civilians continue to be at great risk within their own communities.

Indigenous communities represent the multiethnic, multilingual, and multicultural history within Guatemala. The majority, approximately 15 million inhabitants, are of Mayan descent and reside in the rural departments north and west of Guatemala City.\textsuperscript{85} There are

\textsuperscript{80} Minority Rights Group International 2008
\textsuperscript{81} Grandin 2000.
\textsuperscript{82} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{83} Minority Rights Group International 2008
\textsuperscript{84} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{85} Warren 1998.
23 Mayan languages spoken. In addition to Spanish, the official languages there are five Amerindian languages also recognized by the state. Consequently, the corresponding acts of collective violence against the Maya (i.e. massacres of political leaders and disappearances) have inflicted long-lasting trauma onto these communities.

These traumatic histories and the victimization of Mayan people have shaped the subsequent generation’s capacity to reaffirm its cultural identity. In order to combat the dimensions of symbolic terror, activism to raise awareness of a Pan-Mayan identity has successfully mobilized indigenous groups to be recognized as a unified community or as “a people”. Secondly, this movement reimagined the government recognizes regions clustering the Maya by their dialects because their presence is more fluid than the state’s administrative divisions illustrate. Thirdly, the movement sought to reclaim its cultural distinctiveness.

The collective Mayan body continues to seek formal recognition of their right to self-determination and the restoration of their lands [redistributed after the collapse of the Mayan empire and prior to the arrival of the Spaniards]. The unequal distribution of land ownership has increased the number of uprisings and ensuing indiscriminant repression mostly afflicting rural communities. With 65% arable land, the population holds only 2% of it. Discrepancies in land ownership continue to foster tensions between indigenous communities and other actors.

Dispute over land rights have transpired in Huehuetenango in Guatemala between the Q’anj’obal people and the company Hidro Santa Cruz over the construction of hydroelectric

---

86 Grandin 2000.
88 Ibid.
projects along the Q’an B’alam River. Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. is the Guatemalan subsidiary, owned by Spanish enterprises Ecoener – Hidralia Energia, involved in the development of hydroelectric projects and mining activities along the Q’am Balam River.

II. GEOGRAPHIC LOCATION

In October 2005, shortly after Hurricane Katrina, the tropical storm “Stan” reeked havoc across parts of southern Mexico and Central America. The UN Economic Commission reported that the aggregate damage caused by torrential rains, earthquakes, and volcanic eruptions were close to a billion US dollars. In Guatemala, the damages conjured were closer to $100 million. In particular, the central highland regions were greatly overwhelmed by the intersection of these catastrophic activities, the impoverished

---

89 Guatemala Human Rights Commission 2015
90 Gelder & Wilde 2015.
91 CDM Project Design Doc 2006
populations residing in those zones, and polarizing social inequalities. These features of Guatemala’s structural deficiencies were observed in the department of Huehuetenango.

Huehuetenango was one of the most affected areas during the civil war. Several sources describe the extermination campaigns, incidences of harassment and assault, and destruction that forced hundreds of community members to flee into the mountains north of the department. In the Poverty and Inequality Map in Guatemala (2005), Huehuetenango belongs to the “Poverty Belt” because 90% of its municipalities are below the general poverty level. Since 2006, the government’s Poverty Reduction Strategy plans have designated this department on the short list of high priorities for the implementation of food and nutritional insecurity programs. General measurements of the wealth gap describe Huehuetenango as one of three departments with the highest counts of poverty and extreme poverty below. In 2005, the municipality of Barillas had a greater general poverty rate than the average of the department at 86.10%. According to other official records, the region where Canbalam I was built is extremely impoverished.

III. PROJECT DESIGN DETAILS

According to the Ministry of Energy and Mines Guatemala C.A., the concessions for Canbalam I were registered as the Environmental License No. 497-2011/DIGARN of Evaluation, Control and Environmental Monitoring categories B2 and given final authorization between June 13, 2011 and June 12, 2012. It is located along the Q’an

---

92 CDM Project Design Doc 2006
93 Ibid.
94 Figueroa 2012.
B’alam River, to the southeast of the county seat in Santa Cruz de Barillas, department of Huehuetenango in the Republic of Guatemala.

In accordance with 4/CMP, Annex II, Appendix B, the project, Canbalam I, is considered a (i) “renewable energy project” and categorized as a small-scale hydroelectric project by the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM). The 4.96 MW Pelton Turbine within its power station generates electricity for the National Interconnected System. This project contributes to Guatemala’s growing efforts to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and invest in clean energy production as an alternative to fossil fuel power plants. The implementation of the project were expected to yield the following results:

- Contribute to the regions sustainable development by improving the stream of electricity available for residential and commercial activities hence;
- Provide short and long-term job opportunities to locals throughout periods of construction and operation;
- Clean water that may be used for irrigation purposes;
- Protect the surrounding forestry resources from local use.

Canbalam I hydroelectric project was expected to displace 26,843 tons of CO2 emissions annually in the first 7-year crediting period. According to information provided by Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. the waters would be repurposed and funneled through pipes. The physical characteristics of the project’s construction involved the following:

- A feeder dam (2.5 m height);

---

95 CDM Project Design Doc 2006.
96 Ibid.
• A washout channel (1.0 m width) with a drainpipe (1.3 m height and 3% slope) located to the stirrup that empties the dam and its sediments;
• A horizontal flow grit chamber (4 m wide by 15 m long) at the intake which will channel water towards the derivation pipeline and prevent irreparable damage to the turbine;
• A powerhouse with an imported vertical shaft Pelton turbine to the left of the river (20 x 10.5 m^2) generates 4.96 MW;
• A transmission line (4.91km) connecting the electric substation within the powerhouse to the Barillas Substation.

IV. TIMELINE DETAILS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Main Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25th January 2010</td>
<td>Stakeholders meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23rd February 2010</td>
<td>Contract for CDM services signed with INCLAM CO2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13th May 2010</td>
<td>Environmental Impact Evaluation and Environmental Management Plan for Hydroelectric positive resolution by MARN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13th May 2010</td>
<td>Hydroelectric Environmental License by MARN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14th June 2010</td>
<td>Approval from MEM (Ministry Of Energy and Mines)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9th July 2010</td>
<td>INCLAM CO2 signed with DOE (AENOR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27th July 2010</td>
<td>PDD completed by INCLAM CO2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd August 2010</td>
<td>Environmental Impact Evaluation and Environmental Management Plan for transmission Line and substation Environmental License by MARN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19th August 2010</td>
<td>Public comments period started at validation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20th September 2010</td>
<td>Validation Visit with AENOR and INCLAM CO2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21st September 2010</td>
<td>Transmission line and substation Environmental License by MARN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22nd September 2010</td>
<td>ONDL-MARN Information meeting of the Project as CDM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19th October 2010</td>
<td>* Turn Key contract signed = Project Starting Date</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Taken as Project’s Starting date

The history of the concessions granted to Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. is summarized above. Documentation provided for Project 7736 to the UNFCCC reveals a general description of
Canbalam I project activities, as well as details that precede the implementation and application of the project.\textsuperscript{97} However, it does not cite the unusual activities prior to 2010.

At the end of 2008 the population living on the banks of the Q’an B’alam River noted the presence of persons who were not neighbors of the municipality of Barillas. They performed river flow measurements and surveyed the surrounding land located in the El Paraje Poza Verde community.\textsuperscript{98} During these investigations, community members noted sustained damage to their crops of maize, beans, and citrus fruit trees. Moreover, no state authorities informed or clarified the activities of these strangers on privately held lands. After these events, the Spanish company Ecoener-Hidralia, (through its Guatemalan subsidiary Hidro Santa Cruz Sociedad Anonomia) returned to construct Canbalam I.\textsuperscript{99} Generally, tensions between the public and the company over the construction of the hydroelectric project resulted because of the lack in transparency of official information and the deficiency of the company to acquire the appropriate licensure.\textsuperscript{100}

The people, held community consultations through the Law of the Councils of Urban and Rural Development (COCODE), as stipulated in Article 16, to deepen their knowledge of the company’s actions.\textsuperscript{101} Additionally, they requested meetings with the municipal mayor and other local authorities. Together they sought explanations from the State responsible for authorizing the activities that occurred within the municipality. Instead of receiving information about Canbalam I community leaders received threatening messages on their

\textsuperscript{97} CDM Project Design Doc 2006
\textsuperscript{98} Hegoa Institute of Guatemala 2012.
\textsuperscript{99} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{100} Figueroa 2012.
\textsuperscript{101} Ibid.
cellphones if they either opposed to sell their lands or questioned the company Hidro Santa Cruz S.A.\textsuperscript{102}

In 2009, community leaders informed municipal authorities that strangers returned to take measurements of the river flow and land, destroying crops once more in the process.\textsuperscript{103} They received no support from state institutions such as the Ministry of Energy and Mines and the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources, explaining the happenings in Santa Cruz Barillas. Alternatively, the town of Barillas organized themselves to engage in the appropriate dialogue with the company Hidro Santa Cruz S.A., as a means to solicit information directly. The company deemed the application as “coercion, intimidation, and illegal detention”.\textsuperscript{104} Lawsuit 211/2009 was presented to the Public Ministry of Santa Eulalia, Huehuetenango, identified complaints against seven community members: Abigail Mendez, Saul Méndez, Mauro Mendez, Maria Lopez, Rony Juarez, Pablo Antonio Pablo, and Ruben Herrera.\textsuperscript{105}

By February 2010, anonymous intimidation calls to indigenous leaders increased and armed individuals appeared along the properties owned by Hidro Santa Cruz S.A.\textsuperscript{106} Abigail Mendez, Saul Méndez, Mauro Mendez, Maria Lopez, Rony Juarez, Pablo Antonio Pablo, and Ruben Herrera, presented to the Auxiliary Department of Huehuetenango –PDH-a complaint expressing concern for their lives.\textsuperscript{107} At the end of 2010, the company dropped

\tiny{\textsuperscript{102} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{103} Hegoa Institute of Guatemala 2012.  
\textsuperscript{104} De Leon 2013.  
\textsuperscript{105} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{106} Hegoa Institute of Guatemala 2012.  
\textsuperscript{107} Gelder & Wilde 2015.
all but one change, against Ruben Herrera, a coordinating member of the People’s Assembly in Huehuetenango.

In June 2010, strangers permanently settled in Barillas, conducted widespread measurements without receiving proper consent from the affected communities or landowners.\(^{108}\) Community members reorganized themselves in El Moxon to speak about expelling those unknown individuals from their territories because of their unsolicited and disruptive presence. In August 2010, the legal representative of Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. met with the Poza Verde community for negotiations. The company proposed to remove the complaint filed against the community leaders in exchange for the land rights transferred over to the company to construct the hydroelectric project *Canbalam I*. Additionally, these communities would receive royalties.\(^{109}\)

In a formal community referendum in 2007, residents voted overwhelmingly to oppose mining and exploitation of natural resources in Santa Cruz Barillas.\(^{110}\) The people opted to not negotiate with the company and highlighted the significance of the Community Consultations of Good Faith (Consultations).\(^{111}\) The community of Santa Cruz Barillas held a Consultation to raise awareness of their concerns regarding the licenses given by the Ministry of Energy and Mines to exploitive industries in the Q’anj’obal territory.\(^{112}\) The Consultations are an ancestral decision making process that is an expression of the right of self-determination by which to exercise their rights to make collective decisions over their

\(^{108}\) Guatemala Human Rights Commission 2015
\(^{109}\) Figueroa 2012.
\(^{110}\) Ibid.
\(^{111}\) Guatemala Human Rights Commission 2015.
\(^{112}\) Jolom Konob 2013.
lands, territories, and natural resources.\textsuperscript{113} The Consultations are recognized under Article 26 of the Constitution and internationally in Convention No. 169 on Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the International Labor Organization (ILO) and the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.

On February 15th, 2011, Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. offered an annual compensation of 185,000 Quetzals, where funs would be transferred to a community account.\textsuperscript{114} Within the first fifteen days of approving a license for the company's activities, the first installment would be deposited and the remaining funds would be submitted each trimester over forty years.

Contradictory to the statements provided in February, an investigation conducted in March 2011, proved that Hidro Santa Cruz had started construction for Canbalam I before securing the appropriate environmental license from the Ministry of Environmental and Natural Resources. Consequently in April, the Municipal Council of Santa Cruz Barillas used its autonomy to deny Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. the construction of projects along the Q'an B'alam riverbank.\textsuperscript{115} Moreover, this occurred because the company did not have the appropriate license, nor had it conducted any environmental assessments or proposed risk mitigation strategies. It is important to note that they had been operating without one before receiving proper authorization.

On August 18, 2011, the company received its license after filing an injunction against the municipality of Barillas.\textsuperscript{116} The Extraordinary Court of Amparo resolved the

\textsuperscript{113} Cano & Schuster 2015.
\textsuperscript{114} Figueroa 2012.
\textsuperscript{115} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{116} Ibid.
issue, citing that the municipality did not have the right to withhold certain rights to Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. because it did not have explicit building regulations.

V. RELATIONS BETWEEN THE COMMUNITY AND HIDRO SANTA CRUZ S.A.

Currently, these lands are either privately owned by community members or part of local conservation efforts. According to a study conducted by the International Commission on Tropical Biology and Natural Resources, the region is home to a number of rare amphibians and insect species. The actions that transpire on the Q'an B'alam River affect and alter the cosmic relationship and spirituality of the Maya Q'anj'obal people of the Cuchumatan Mountains; who regard the river and its three waterfalls as sacred. The Q'anjob'al also call it the Sacred Golden Tiger. Many meditate, and go to thank their Creator for the abundance of their resources. It was rumored that neighbors took down parts of the fencing obstructing access to the Q'an B'alam shrine sometime during the month of November (2011).

The river waters have traditionally served several utilitarian purposes. Previously, people washed their clothing in the river, brought their domestic animals to drink, and used the water to irrigate their crops. The Q'anj'obal grow staple crops such as on milpa plots according to swidden agricultural techniques due to the lack of accessible farming lands, hence it is detrimental to their quality of life when these practice are disrupted.

---

117 Gelder & Wilde 2015.
118 Jolom Konob 2013.
119 Ibid.
120 Figueroa 2012.
121 Ibid.
122 Alford-Jones 2013.
After Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. proceeded to set up barbed and mesh wire around its purchased terrain, the company hindered people’s abilities to continue these activities. Many were intimidated and harassed by the company’s security guards who constantly loaded and unloaded their weapons, and sent warning shots into the abyss to frighten travelers.\(^{123}\) Community members traversing these passages have had a difficult time reaching their own crop-growing lands, entering forest areas or accessing waters because Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. controls major streams from the Q’an B’alam River. Within the land purchased by the company, there is a local road built by the community leading to various communities and accessed by peoples of all ages and genders. However, because of the increasing presence of armed personnel, it is very risky to traverse this path.

Following the intense Guatemalan election campaigns of 2011, tensions amongst the populace and Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. increased. Presidential candidates were rumored parading in company vehicles, accompanied by armed forces.\(^{124}\) The presence of mass pilings of weaponry also greatly unnerved the people. At one point, hundred of community members forced the company security guards to withdraw from the municipality and deliver their weapons. The latter were then verified as ‘legally attained’ with the State. Thirteen firearms were delivered and transported to community city halls; meanwhile the security guards that safeguarded these objects were removed.\(^{125}\)

On April 13, 2012 a bomb detonated near the second warehouse building by Hidro Santa Cruz in the community of Poza Verde.\(^{126}\) Presumably, a dog had made contact with

\(^{123}\) Gelder & Wilde 2015.  
^{124}\) Figueroa 2012.  
^{125}\) Figueroa 2012.  
^{126}\) Hegoa Institute of Guatemala 2012.
the artifact placed in the driveway of the warehouse. Neighbors later identified more bombs throughout the perimeter of the grounds owned by Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. The Justice of the Peace responsible for conducting an ocular investigation did not attend their petitions. By the end of the week, the company guards had removed those bombs most likely. Nevertheless, after soliciting an intervention from the municipality, the Justice filed with the Public Ministry of Santa Eulalia. On April 2012, evidence from the inspection recognized the tentative risks posed by these undetonated explosives to the people and domestic animals.127

**VI. EVENTS ON AND AFTER MAY 1**

On May 1, 2012, armed gunmen, likely employed by Hidro Santa Cruz, attacked three community leaders who protested against the dam project.128 One of the three was killed and the others injured seriously. Andres Francisco Miguel was killed, and Pablo Antonio Pablo and Esteban Bernabe were seriously injured. These men had either been approached by the company to sell their land and refused or been enthralled by legal persecution on behalf of the Hidro Santa Cruz.129 Although the suspects were captured, the local court acquitted them of the charges.130

The government declared a State of Siege, ordering policemen and military officials to conduct rounds and gather a list of “suspicious” individuals involved in the murder.131

The May 2012 Evidence found in the case of Mr. Andres Francisco linked two of Hidro

---

127 Ibid.
128 Figueroa 2012.
129 Hegoa Institute of Guatemala 2012.
130 Le Conseil Des Canadiens 2012.
131 Ibid.
Santa Cruz employees to the homicide, including their head of security as the assassins. Nevertheless, during that period, social protests against Hidro Santa Cruz were criminalized. The State of Emergency did not resolve any conflicts; moreover it instilled terror in the general population of Santa Cruz Barillas. The government lifted the State of Seige, but not before diffusing threatening messages across local television and criminalizing some of the leaders. The government continued to ignore any and all forms of the indigenous people's peaceful protests and petitions.

Following a turnover of politicians in the municipality in 2012, the company introduced heavy machinery in Santa Cruz Barillas. On May 30, 2012, in a massive effort of solidarity, thousands signed a declaration addressed to the mayor and city council of Santa Cruz Barillas. August 27, 2013 Saul Mendez Aurelio Munoz and Antonio Velasquez Rogelio Lopez, community authorities in the defense of natural resources and human rights, were arrested on their way to the hearing of case 92/2012. They were detained illegally and imprisoned for eight months after unjust accusations linking them to the events that occurred on May 1st, and the lynching that occurred in 2010 and 2011. Since these events have transpired, Saul and Rogelio have been set free.

Still in 2012, former Guatemalan President Otto Perez Molina had been expected to meet with representatives of the Sociedad Civil de Barillas after announcing a dialogue table on September 19th, where the topic of discussion would be hydroelectric projects that could potentially be installed in the northern region of Huehuetenango. Within the

---

132 Community Press Km.169.2012.
133 Ibid.
134 Figueroa 2012.
135 Juanita’s citation
136 Ibid.
first six months in office, the Molina administration approved 68 new mining licenses, with 734 pending, and 47 exclusive hydroelectric licenses already in existence or processing. Despite leaders from various communities showing up, the meeting never occurred, and no official notification confirming or cancelling this event was ever sent out by his office.\textsuperscript{137}

Because of those events in the community, tensions between the local people and Hidro Santa Cruz have continued to rise. The criminalization of indigenous leaders has also impacted the community. The families of those imprisoned have devoted themselves to gathering the means to travel to the prisons located more than 400 miles away to see their incarcerated spouses.\textsuperscript{138}

According to the “Urgent Critique” (2012) provided by the Mayan West Village Council (CPO), the indigenous people demand the following to quickly resolve the overarching conflict between the Q’anjob’al and the company Hidro Santa Cruz S.A:\textsuperscript{139}

- The immediate suspension and operation licenses for the hydroelectric dam built on the Q’am B’alam river;
- The company’s withdrawal from the area and an investigation identifying the company’s responsibilities after the May 1st, 2012 in Santa Cruz Barillas;
- The formation of a high-level commission, with participation from civil society to investigate and assign responsibility for the events that took after the incident;
- Government-provided protection and security for the people of Santa Cruz barillas, instead of having their constitutional rights suspended (again)

\textsuperscript{137}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{138}NISGUA 2015.
\textsuperscript{139}Mayan West Village Council 2012.
VII. COMPANY PROFILE & FINANCES

Luis Castro Valdivia, his brothers David and Javier, are the proprietors of Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. Hidro Santa Cruz, has taken the lead in dam construction along the Q'am B'alam River since 2011.¹⁴⁰ Ecoener S.L. and Hidralia Energía, both of which are privately held Spanish-owned companies, are the parent companies of Hidro Santa Cruz S.A.

Ecoener S.L formed during the merger between Ecoener and Luis de Valdivia S.L. Since 2012, it holds a majority stake (85%) in the company and Hidralia Energía Ingenieros Consultores SL owns the remaining (15%) of the company.¹⁴¹ Established in 2006 by David Castro Valdivia and Ramón Pedrosa, Hidralia Energía specializes in maintaining small to medium sized renewable energy harnessing and other civil engineering projects, for private clients and public institutions throughout Europe and Latin America.¹⁴² Many of Hidralia Energía’s employees obtain at least a master degree as specialists in various fields in Spanish universities and form the majority of highly qualified engineers engaged in these project.¹⁴³

At the end of December 2012, Ecoener owned in total assets $39.7 million U.S. dollars. In addition to this, Hidralia Energía Ingenieros Consultores owned total assets of $85.1 million dollars at the end of December 2013. Moreover, the World Bank also contributes to the Q'am B’alam River dam projects. The World Bank is one of the biggest lenders for these companies and the Inter-American Infrastructure Finance Corporation (CIFI), which is US-
based private sector lender funded in part by the World Bank, loaned more than $8 million dollars for the dam construction of Hidro Santa Cruz. Same as CIFI, Norfund, a Norwegian state-owned Investment Fund for Developing Countries, also invested about 4.74 million US dollars for Hidro Santa Cruz in 2011 in loans.

Hidralia Energía explained to the Q’anjob’al people of Barillas that their projects would affect the environment but they did not show evidence of having conducted these studies. In addition to this, the Guatemalan government issued a license to Hidralia Energía, despite the fact that Hidralia Energía and the government failed to obtain a consensus from the local people. Moreover, the way that Hidralia Energía carried out its agenda against Q’am B’alam people is in violation of applicable human rights constructed in international and national law, as outlined in the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the International Labor Standards of the International Labor Organization (ILO), the ILO Convention 169 on Indigenous Peoples, the American Convention on Human Rights, and in the Constitution of the Republic of Guatemala. Currently, Hidralia Energía doesn’t have any policy, which is related to human rights.

VIII. OTHER PROJECTS

Although Hidro Santa Cruz is a local company in Guatemala and has not launched any other huge project, Hidralia Energía, which is a parent company of Hidro Santa Cruz, has

---

144 Cultural Survival 2015.
145 Gelder & Wilde 2015.
146 Alford-Jones 2013.
147 Declaration Hearing of the Permanent Peoples Tribunal Geneva 2014.
conducted construction project in at least 10 other countries. Hidralia Energía is registered in the Spanish business registry with Hidralia Energía Ingenieros Consultores.\textsuperscript{148} Hidralia Energía has worked with European and Latin-American private clients, such as public institutions in Latin America and Spain and various multinational institutions. Its activity base is in Latin America and it has a main office in Guatemala. Most of its projects are located in Guatemala, Ecuador, Spain, and Costa Rica.\textsuperscript{149}

In Spain where the headquarters of Hidralia Energía is located in, it has been whispered a dubious history. David Castro Valdivia had been charged with bribery and corruption surrounding the authorization of licenses for 16 dams.\textsuperscript{150} Hidralia Energía is suspected to have gained contacts for constructions by utilizing bribery, intimidation, and violence in the other countries where it has a presence.

\textbf{IX. FUNDING STREAMS}

Multilateral development institutions such as the International Monetary Fund and the United Nations Development Programme financially support Hidro Santa Cruz S.A. These institutions regard the renewable energy market as an enormous opportunity for developing countries to become more economically secure. According to their mandate, their investment is driven by the expectation that developing countries will become participants in the global initiative towards adopting clean development mechanisms (CDM) as outlined in the Kyoto Protocol.\textsuperscript{151}

\textsuperscript{148} Gelder & Wilde 2015.
\textsuperscript{149} Hidralia Energia 2015.
\textsuperscript{150} Precedo 2007.
\textsuperscript{151} People’s Assembly in Defense of Territory in Huehuetenango 2014.
• IFC, International Finance Corporation, is a member of World Bank group and one of the world's largest international sources of financing for private sector investment in developing countries with a mandate to reduce poverty and improve people's lives. They finance and provide advice for private sector ventures and projects in developing countries in partnership with private investors and, through its advisory work, help governments create conditions that stimulate the flow of both domestic and foreign private savings and investment\textsuperscript{152}. In 2008, IFC provided 20 million USD in loans and 10 million USD in equity to the CIFI\textsuperscript{153}.

• CIFI is a regional financial institution for long-term funding of medium-sized infrastructure projects in Latin America and the Caribbean\textsuperscript{154}. Incorporated in Panama. In 2010, CIFI’s total funding plan for Hidro Santa Cruz consisted of a long term loan of up to € 6.2 million (8.2 million USD), and a mezzanine facility of up to € 1.9 million (2.5 million USD)\textsuperscript{155}. CIFI classified the dam as Category B, which is recognized not at high risk, as the potential environmental and social impacts and risks are limited, and committed to conform to the IFC’s Performance Standards on indigenous peoples, environmental and social impacts, and land acquisition\textsuperscript{156}.

• Norfund, the state-owned Norwegian Investment Fund for Developing Countries, invests in the establishment and development of profitable and sustainable

\textsuperscript{152} IFC 2015.
\textsuperscript{153} "THE SUFFERING OF OTHERS The human cost of the International Finance Corporation’s lending through financial intermediaries." April 2015.
\textsuperscript{154} CIFI 2015.
\textsuperscript{155} Gelder, Willem van, Jan and Joeri de Wilde. 2015.
\textsuperscript{156} "THE SUFFERING OF OTHERS The human cost of the International Finance Corporation’s lending through financial intermediaries." April 2015.
enterprises in developing countries with the objective of alleviating poverty\textsuperscript{157}. It has made a direct investment in Hidro Santa Cruz by providing 39.2 million USD in loans and mezzanine in 2011.\textsuperscript{158} Norfund has 9\% of equity stake in CIFI and has lent to CIFI 35 million USD\textsuperscript{159}.

- IMF is an organization created in 1945, and is now comprised of 188 countries\textsuperscript{160}. Its main responsibility is to ensure international financial stability, sustainable economic growth, monetary cooperation between countries occurs, and reduce poverty. Resources are available to its member countries that experience difficulties making payments or need financial/technical assistance.

- World Bank is charged with two goals: (1) to end poverty within a generation and (2) boost shared prosperity\textsuperscript{161}. It is composed of five institutions, one of which is the International Finance Corporation (IFC). The IFC is the single largest global development institution focused on mobilizing capital through the private sector and provides advisory services to these businesses and governments in developing countries.

\textsuperscript{157} Norfund 2015.
\textsuperscript{158} Norfund 2014
\textsuperscript{159} Norfund 2015.
\textsuperscript{160} Communications Department 2015.
\textsuperscript{161} The World Bank Group 2014.
WORK CITED

Literature Citation


http://www.eolss.net/sample-chapters/c20/e6-142-tpe-04.pdf


http://cdm.unfccc.int/filestorage/a/u/9KN2JD3YIX4S75QFOQ6PGRMTHBA1V.pdf/PDD%20Canbalam%20I%20Hydroelectric%20Project%20V2.pdf?t=aWV8bnphM2pufDComrMAiKmhbYNigrRr_v2


http://www.eolss.net/sample-chapters/c20/e6-142-tpe-04.pdf

http://nisgua.blogspot.ca/2012/05/urgent-communique.html


http://www.norfund.no/central-america/hidro-santa-cruz-article345-310.html


Konob, Jolom. “La municipalidad de Santa Eulalia y el movimiento social, que está conformado por las diversas organizaciones de la sociedad civil, tales como autoridades comunitarias, iglesias, líderes, lideresas, y la población en general, por este medio ante la opinión pública,” (April 2013). Accessed October 5, 2015.


“Lo peor de ser preso político es que nos olviden- fuera hidro santa cruz, en nuestro territorio.” Asamblea de los pueblos en defensa del territorio de Huehuetenango.” September 2014.


http://www.refworld.org/docid/49749d163c.html


http://nisgua.blogspot.com/2015/05/community-leader-from-barillas.html


**Visual Citations**


---

Hydroelectric Project in Huehutenango, Guatemala

Benjamin Scheel, Gabriel Quetell
1998 Marlin mine is discovered by Exploradora de Guatemala S.A.¹

2000 Francisco Gold purchases Exploradora de Guatemala ¹

2002 a second study identified 1.4 million ounces of gold in the San Marcos Region.²

2003 Glamis Gold merges with Francisco Gold¹

2005 Marlin mine was prepared and ready to excavate.²

2006 Goldcorp acquires Glamis for $21.3 Billion.²

2007 Exploradora de Guatemala has 100% ownership of Marlin mine but Goldcorp remains the parent company³

2008 Marlin mine was shut down.⁴

¹Appendix A Marlin project timeline 1996-2009, accessed October 3rd 2015
⁴2007 Annual report Goldcorp, accessed October 3rd 2015
I. Project Background and Context

The Marlin Mine in San Marcos, Guatemala is a gold mine that is owned by Montana Exploradora S.A., whose headquarters are in Guatemala City, Guatemala. Montana Exploradora de Guatemala is a subsidiary company of Goldcorp, a Canadian corporation based in Vancouver, B.C. Canada. The beginning of this project dates back to 1998, at a time when many saw Guatemala as rich in metals, particularly gold and silver. These metals attracted investors and eventually Montana Exploradora sought to explore the land, which led to obtaining mining and exploration licenses in 1998 called "derecho de exploración." In 2002, a second study was done in order to confirm their uncertainties regarding the possibilities for gold in the region. The study later identified that there would be roughly 1.4 million ounces of gold in San Marcos region, which is worth roughly $1.4 billion (based on $1,090.35 per ounce of gold). In early-mid 2004, construction began to prepare the land for excavation, and shortly after, in late 2005 their mine was prepared and was ready to be excavated. Shortly after the set-up completion, the mine opened and began production that same year. According to the McGill Research Group, the Marlin Mine is supposed to be active until the end of 2015.

168 Only Gold; Price of Gold over 200 years. 2015.
In 1998 Marlin mine was created by Exploradora de Guatemala S.A., and later purchased by Francisco Gold in 2000. Glamis Gold merged with Francisco Gold in 2003 and thus had the rights to the mine.\textsuperscript{171} In 2006 Goldcorp acquired Glamis for 21.3 billion dollars, giving them ownership of Marlin mine.\textsuperscript{172} Since 2007 Marlin mine is owned by Exploradora de Guatemala S.A. but Goldcorp is still the parent company and has 100\% ownership.\textsuperscript{173} Goldcorp itself is a Canadian company with its headquarters in Vancouver, British Columbia. It currently has four mines in Canada, three Mines in Mexico, and four in Central and South America. It was incorporated March 31\textsuperscript{st} 1994.\textsuperscript{174}

The newly elected president of Guatemala, Jimmy Morales, promises to curb corruption and increase transparency. He however is backed by the National Convergence Front (FCN) a conservative party with ties to the military. Some members are linked to war crimes committed in the three decade long civil war. There has been violence and repression against environmental activists such as Rigoberto Lima Choc, an indigenous activist who was assassinated on September 18\textsuperscript{th} 2015. Alex Rynoso an environmental activist who organized against Tahoe Resources, a silver mine survived his second assassination attempt, the first one killing his daughter Topacio Reyes. Overall people are worrying that Morales won’t bring about change but will simply give the old government a new face.\textsuperscript{175} However, Morales has said that he won’t put top military officials in any

\textsuperscript{171} Appendix A Marlin project timeline 1996-2009, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{172} Goldcorp and Glamis Agree to US$21.3 Billion Combination Creating the World’s Premier Gold mining Company, 21 August 2006, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{173} 2007 Annual report Goldcorp, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{174} Goldcorp, investor Q&A, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{175} A military-backed comedian will be Guatemala’s next President. Activists aren’t laughing, published November 2\textsuperscript{nd} 2015 accessed November 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015
cabinet positions except defense. Time will tell if the new president will manage to turn things around or if he becomes part of the old system.

In early Guatemalan history, the lands owned by the Maya Shortly before the arrival of the Spanish, the Maya of this region divided their indigenous community into small kingdoms. In 1524, Pedro de Alvarado arrived to present day Guatemala, with less than 500 Spanish Conquistadors, looking to take over new territory. De Alvarado led the conquistadors and Mexican natives to the territory, then made an ally with the Kaqchiquel, an indigenous people of Guatemala. De Alvarado and his men slowly began warring against small Maya kingdoms. It was much later when the Kaqchiquel noticed that De Alvarado was abusing their people and they later turned on him. The aftermath of these wars were destructive to the region, after the demise of the two larger Maya kingdoms, the smaller kingdoms in the surrounding areas were later destroyed. Much of these conflicts occurred over the fight for land, and natural resources. The Spanish were drawn to Guatemala because of their diverse highlands and lowlands, which made it a great environment to exploit their agricultural strengths.

The arrival of the Spanish began a process of conflict in the Americas affecting the Maya and other indigenous peoples. Many Maya leaders today find similarities to the activities of Goldcorp and other multinationals that are also disposing indigenous peoples of their lands, territories and natural resources. The Spanish sought to explore new lands, while exploiting the precious and valuable resources found on this land for profit. Similarly, Goldcorp has identified that San Marcos, Guatemala has significant potential for profit,

---

176 Guatemalan president-elect Jimmy Morales vows to curb military’s influence published October 27th 2015, accessed November 6th 2015
specifically with precious metals such as gold and silver. These metals has been proven to be an important endeavor for the Canadian corporation and their success.

San Marcos is a department located in the western highland of the country and has a total region size of 3,791 km$^2$. In 1994, the population was approximately 645,418. The present day population has increased to 1,121,600. In a span of twenty years the population in this region has almost doubled.$^{178}$ With a constant population growth rate of 2% over the past 20 years and a consistent 4-5 births per woman for the same amount of time, Guatemala has since increased its population size significantly, and is projected to continue growing.$^{179}$ The cool highlands that exist in this region are filled with mountain-like terrain that is ideal for the growth of coffee, sugar, bananas, and other produce. This terrain is beneficial to breed livestock such as cattle, chickens, pigs, and sheep. In addition to this region's agricultural resources, it is also the hub for precious metals such as gold and silver. In total, Guatemala exports about $10.09 billion (2012) and trades with the United States, El Salvador, Honduras, Mexico, China, and South Korea and Canada.$^{180}$

Out of 22 indigenous peoples in Guatemala, two have faced disproportionate impacts with the Marlin Mine. The Mam and Sipakapense peoples are affected by the mine in multiple ways, direct and indirect violence, land disputes, and water contamination issues. In the case of Deodora Hernandez, a 58-year old female who was brutally assaulted at her home due to her opposition to sell her land to the mine.$^{182}$ In addition to violence, the

---


$^{181}$ The Observatory of Economic Complexity; Guatemala. 2015.

people in these communities were also forced to relocate and pushed into undesirable land for periods at a time. 183 Lastly, as rock has been excavated, it is stored in another location, often times the rock is treated with chemicals in order to extract the desired metals and minerals. While the rocks settle together, so do the chemicals, which begin to form large ponds of chemical/water solutions. These solutions then carry into other rivers and water ways, which contaminates the indigenous peoples’ source of water, without them even knowing about it.184 The Right to Health, a Substantive right, ensures that every human being has the opportunity to live a healthy lifestyle, free of environmental pollution.185 The contamination of the Guatemalan waterways is a direct violation of this right, which demonstrates that the Mayan-Mam and Sipacaca communities have experienced human rights violations in Guatemala.

183 Ibid.
184 Ibid.
II. Company Profile

The company headquarters is based in Guatemala City, Guatemala, and is a subsidiary company for Goldcorp. This corporation is based out of Canada, and is a company which exploits the metals of Guatemala, in this case mainly gold and silver, in San Marcos. Goldcorp established this chapter of their business in 2005, when it started production of the valued metals. The funds for this project are from Canada to its subsidiary Montana Exploradora in Guatemala, S.A., which cleared the land agreed upon equipment, and labor costs. The company chose to use the open pit form of excavation, which is a typical and traditional form of mining, while at the same rate causes harm to the surrounding environment and peoples.

San Marcos is a department that is divided into municipalities and in this case there are two municipalities, San Miguel Ixtahuacán and Sipacapa. The majority of the people in these areas are Maya-Mam one of the largest Maya nations in Guatemala. Even though 50% of Guatemala’s population is indigenous, indigenous peoples "...are not sufficiently recognized" and "they [indigenous peoples] do not have power." Granted, a significant amount of Guatemalans are indigenous peoples, and "the UN Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP/Declaration) establishes minimum standards to protect the individual and collective rights of indigenous peoples." Though the UN Declaration "is not a legally-binding instrument," it reflects much of what is already part of customary and


There is little transparency of Goldcorp's sustainability efforts in protecting indigenous people's rights in this region. Specifically, Goldcorp focuses on documenting the planning process of community development, rather than documenting the implementation and effectiveness of creating lasting outcomes. In Goldcorp's sustainability report and its mission, it states "The mineral operations bring economic, educational, and developmental opportunities to conserve the harmonious environment along with their neighbors." In the remainder of the report, it highlights the monetary resources and the logistical details that go into the planning processes of this communal sustainability project. There is little evidence, to support that the company has made significant strides towards sustainability in the communities directly affected by mining. Although Goldcorp demonstrates a plan in place to tackle sustainability efforts, Goldcorp has yet to release their results of these projects.

In June 2010, a video report from Al Jazeera documented a farmer and a livestock herder who was attacked by two men working for Grupo Golan, Montana Exploradora's privately contracted security firm. Two men approached her at her place of residence, when one shot her in the face as a form of intimidation and manner to remove the woman from the land. Although she did survive, she has now lost sight in one eye and hearing in

---

190 Ibid. MICLA.
One ear.¹⁹¹ The matters have been dealt with, but the general reasons for these types of threats remain as such. Some corporations will kill, in order to obtain its end goal, in this case, valuable metals versus human life and the environment. Although this was not the first incident, and is surely not the last, events like this tend to have an impact on the community members, who have expressed their grievances towards the miners in San Marcos, Guatemala.

In February 2004, an immediate response was taken against the construction of the Marlin Mine. Shortly after, a regional mayor from Solola announced that he did not sign off on the authorization of mining to take place in the given area, where a 42-day long blockade was formed by an indigenous Sipakapense group. At the end of this blockade, the nation's soldiers and police officers were brought in to seize the blockade and permit the company’s trucks entrance into the mines, when the protectors of the nation ended up opening fire on civilians protesting the operation of the mine.¹⁹² Another grievance made towards the mine, as a result of the killing of a 23 year-old bus driver by two off-duty security guards. These incidents were only two reported incidents in March 2005.¹⁹³ Many reports and grievances against the mining company were followed up by death threats, which were taken very seriously due to prior attacks against the people.

III. Corporate Governance

Every employee of Goldcorp is given the Code of Conduct, which outlines the basic structure of how Goldcorp operates and additional information about political

¹⁹² Ibid. Marlin Mine, Guatemala.
contributions, what to do in case of a conflict of interest, a section on responsible mining, and a section on its policies on ethics and corruption.\textsuperscript{194}

The two main management bodies in Goldcorp are the Management itself and the Board along with the many committees that report to the board.\textsuperscript{195} The management consists of 17 people that have vast amounts of experience in mining sustainability and their area of expertise. Of the 17 people, almost all were men; there were only three women on management. The word sustainability was mentioned a total of 10 times in their job descriptions and it was always in relation to mining sustainability rather than sustainability of the environment.\textsuperscript{196} No one was listed as having knowledge on or being an expert on indigenous peoples or their culture and language. No one on the management team had listed having experience with social performance although several had worked in communications in previous companies. None of them were on a board or committee regarding indigenous peoples yet they collectively were on five committees and bodies regarding mining.

The most notable people were Jerry Danni and Brent Bergeron. Jerry Danni, VP responsible for sustainability and has lead the SEMS program and has 30 years of experience specifically with environmental and sustainability as well as international mining industry under his belt.\textsuperscript{197} Brent Bergeron has extensive experience in government, public relations, and communication. He is also responsible for communicating with governments and other stakeholders. Additionally, he is a member of the Mining Code of Conduct; Goldcorp, October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015

\textsuperscript{194} Code of Conduct; Goldcorp, October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{195} Goldcorp management accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{196} Goldcorp management, October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
\textsuperscript{197} Goldcorp management October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015
Association of Canada, the Executive Steering Committee for the Responsible Gold Standard Initiative at the World Gold Council, MinAlliance and several others.\textsuperscript{198}

The Board was made up of people with similar expertise to those in management. Three out of the eleven people were women. Ten out of 11 were members of the Institute of Corporate Directors a nonprofit based in Canada that helps get senior executives on board of profit and non-profit organizations\textsuperscript{199}. Ten out of the eleven were also on the National Association of Corporate Directors (NACD).\textsuperscript{200} The National Association of Corporate Directors “is the recognized authority focused on advancing exemplary board leadership and establishing leading boardroom practices.”\textsuperscript{201}

There are several independent committees that report directly to the board. The Board of directors is the executive management team of Goldcorp; it operates through its board members as well as through the many committees that report to it with recommendations in their specific areas of expertise. The committees are outlined in the table 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Committee</th>
<th>Responsibility/Duty of Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Governance and Nominating committee        | • is responsible for nominating new members to the board of directors, facilitating ongoing director education, providing new directors with education and orientation programs  
• the board evaluates itself on a yearly basis  
• it also considers resignation of a director\textsuperscript{202} |

\textsuperscript{198} Goldcorp management, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015  
\textsuperscript{199} ICD’s about page, accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015  
\textsuperscript{200} Gold Corp Board, accessed October 3\textsuperscript{rd} 2015  
\textsuperscript{201} NACD’s about page, accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015.  
\textsuperscript{202} From the terms of service for the Governance and Nominating Committee, December 4\textsuperscript{th} 2014 Accessed x October 5\textsuperscript{th} 201
### Compensation Committee
- deal with human resources and compensation
- ensures Goldcorp has a executive compensation plan
- recommends changes of company goals and CEO compensation to the board<sup>203</sup>

### Audit Committee
- helps the board fulfill responsibilities in relation to internal control and financial reporting
- Has oversight over Goldcorp's financial statements, Goldcorp's compliance with legal and regulatory requirements
- Sets standards of conducting business for everyone working for Goldcorp
- Is responsible for Goldcorp's enterprise risk management process<sup>204</sup>

### Sustainability, Environment, Health & Safety Committee
- Review and monitor environmental, health, and sustainable issues an policies on behalf of the board of directors
- Responsible for rolling out of SEMS in 2014
- Consist of 2-5 directors<sup>205</sup>

### Ethics Committee
- Reviews charges of fraud, corruption, and bribery
- Helps employees in dealing with situations where there is a conflict of interest
- Precautionary principle
- Reviews corrective action suggestions by the management<sup>206</sup>

The company’s take on the precautionary principle was stated in the 2014 sustainability report under the ethics committee.<sup>207</sup> Goldcorp takes a risk-based approach to business development. New projects undergo a public impact assessment identifying

---

<sup>203</sup> From the terms of Reference for the Compensation committee January 27<sup>th</sup> 2015 Accessed October 5<sup>th</sup> 2015

<sup>204</sup> From the terms of Reference for the Audit Committee ratified by the board on July 30<sup>th</sup> 2014. Accessed October 5<sup>th</sup> 2015

<sup>205</sup> From the terms of reference for the sustainability, Environment, Health and Safety Committee, February 18, 2015. Accessed October 5<sup>th</sup> 2015

<sup>206</sup> From the 2014 Sustainability report under Strategy and Governance : Business ethics and complaints June 24<sup>th</sup> 2014 Accessed October5<sup>th</sup> 2015

<sup>207</sup> 2014 sustainability report, accessed October 5<sup>th</sup> 2015
proposed project outline; potential impacts, modifications and controls are identified.

Goldcorp is committed to engaging with potentially affected communities but does not give specifics on actions it will take to fulfill that promise.\textsuperscript{208}

Montana Exploradora S.A. has had 100\% ownership of the mine since 2007 but Goldcorp still has the final say.\textsuperscript{209} According to Germial de industrias extractivas, Montana Explorada’s mission is to build sustainable value for the communities, the country, and all Guatemalans through the responsible extraction of gold and silver.\textsuperscript{210} The mine offers the best opportunities in the quality of life of its neighboring communities for people’s health, education, infrastructure and protection of the environment. It also helps promote projects that will help the community nearby.\textsuperscript{211} Montana Explorada has been trying to appeal to the community by donating $10 million dollars to the Fundacion de Niños Quemados (Foundation of burned children). With the help of companies like Montana Explotadora…it is possible to attend pediatric burn cases according to Dieter Nottebohm president of the foundation.\textsuperscript{212} While giving money to organizations is a good way of showing community support, actually helping people, showing them that you care, and putting in the time and effort to do so is a much better way of supporting the community.

IV. Funding Streams

\textsuperscript{208} 2014 sustainability report, accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015
\textsuperscript{209} 2007 Annual report Goldcorp. Accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015
\textsuperscript{210} Germial de industrias extractivas, accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015
\textsuperscript{211} Germial de industrias extractivas accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015
\textsuperscript{212} Goldcorp Montana Exploradora dona US $10m Mil dólares a la Fundación para niños quemados September 8\textsuperscript{th} 2015. Accessed October 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015.
Marlin mine employs more than 2000 people, more than 50% of whom are from Guatemala. The mine received $45 million from the International Finance Corporation, the private sector branch of the World Bank when constructing the Marlin mine. In produced $607 million in 2011 and only 5% went to the local population. The mine has made about 3 billion in its lifetime, and from 2007-2011 it paid 113.6 million in taxes. Between 2006-2009, Marlin mine made $346.1 million in earnings and has paid $51.93 million in taxes to Guatemala while the total revenue flow to local communities was 46.09 million. Marlin mine made $367 million in 2014 and $447 million in 2013.

Goldcorp’s biggest shareholders were almost exclusively investment firms. There are several banks that invested in Goldcorp including the Royal Bank of Canada, Schweizerishe Nationalbank, and Toronto-Dominion Bank. There do not appear to be any direct investments by governments but some of the banks are national banks such as the Schweizerishe Nationalbank. Some of them did not have environmental projects. The most notable ones that did were Vanguard Total Intl Stock Index Inv which as an entire page and program dedicated to saving water, energy and conserve the environment, and the Royal Bank of Canada with their blue water project. Goldcorp’s biggest shareholders as well as their percent of total shares are listed in table 3 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>% of total Shares</th>
<th>Type of company</th>
<th>Environmental proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Market Vectors Gold Miners ETF</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>Investment management</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

215 Marlin Mine, Guatemala MICLA accessed October 13th 2015
217 Goldcorp 2014 annual report accessed October 13th 2015
218 Yahoo finance, accessed October 10th 2015
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funds Top 5 shareholders of Goldcorp GG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arnold &amp; S. Bleichroeder Advisers, LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Eck Associates Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Royal Bank of Canada</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

219 FEIM's homepage accessed October 10th 2015  
220 Franklin Templeton Investments homepage accessed October 10th 2015  
221 Franklin Templeton Investments about page accessed October 10th 2015  
222 Artisan partners home page accessed October 10th 2015  
224 Investor Vanguard homepage accessed October 10th 2015  
225 Vanguard’s view: social concerns and investing page accessed October 10th 2015  
226 conserving resources page accessed October 10th 2015  
227 the data for the top 5 fund shareholders of Goldcorp were gathered from Morningstar.com  
228 Business Wire, accessed October 13th 2015  
229 Van Eck Global main page accessed October 13th 2015  
230 Royal bank of Canada website accessed October 13th 2015  
231 Royal bank of Canada environment page accessed October 13th 2015
Employees also get several benefits by working for Goldcorp such as buying stocks in the company. When someone buys stocks they own part of that company and can push the company to go in certain directions. If the influence is large enough, if you own enough stocks, the company will likely comply. In Goldcorp’s case, the benefits for employees are listed in table 5 below. Table 6 lists some of the benefits that some of the highest-ranking officers receive these benefits include but are not limited to shares of the company as well as performance bonuses.

Table 5: Employee benefit plan (stocks, shares, performance based pay)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Type of Plan</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Canada and United States  | Employee stock purchase plan, depending on job level | • Anyone who is an employee of Goldcorp or a subsidiary of Goldcorp can purchase stocks \[236\]  
• The Chief Executive Officer has to purchase stocks worth at least four times his base salary  
• All other Named Executive Officers (NEOs) must purchase shares at least twice his base salary \[237\] | • People working at Goldcorp could in theory change company policy or direction  
• The company can terminate your participation in the stock option plan so if employees would go against company profits |

232 Franklin Templeton Investments homepage accessed October 10th 2015  
233 Artisan partners home page accessed October 10th 2015  
236 Goldcorp Employee share purchase plan for U.S. Employees  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Plan Type</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Mexico, Guatemala, Chile, Argentina | Long-term Incentive plan | - Participation is voluntary, employees can contribute up to 6% of their earnings which is matched by 50% by the company.  
- "Ensures that each of the executive officers works towards increasing Goldcorp's share performance."  
- The Chief Executive Officer and all NEOs receive a multiplier on their base salary made up of 1/3 Performance Share Units (PSU), 1/3 stock options, 1/3 Restricted Share Units (RSU).  
- These could potentially change with the performance of the company and the performance of the individual officers.  
- "Ensures that each of the executive officers works towards increasing Goldcorp's share performance."  
- The Chief Executive Officer and all NEOs receive a multiplier on their base salary made up of 1/3 Performance Share Units (PSU), 1/3 stock options, 1/3 Restricted Share Units (RSU).  
- These could potentially change with the performance of the company and the performance of the individual officers.  
- The purpose of RSU's is to align the interests of shareholders, employees, and management by giving them an economic incentive to work towards the same goal (making Goldcorp more profitable).  
- Stock options means that people can buy more than one share from one company or can buy stocks from more than one company.  
- Performance Shares seek to reward managers and for increasing the value of shares making shareholders more rich.  
- The amount of performance shares each executive officer gets is determined by the compensation committee. |
|                  |                           | It would most likely only hurt them and not make a dent in Goldcorp's policies.                                                                                                                          | 238 2012 Management information Circular p.67 March 20th 2012, accessed November 5th 2015  
240 Tradimo, what is the difference between stocks and shares, accessed November 5th 2015  

The meeting was held at the Northern College of Applied Arts & Technology, Porcupine Campus
Table 6: Top executive compensation 2011:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Compensation</th>
<th>Charles A. Jeannes</th>
<th>Lindsay A. Hall</th>
<th>Steve P. Reid</th>
<th>Timo S. Jauristo</th>
<th>David L. Deisley</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RSU (in dollar amount)</td>
<td>2,726,940</td>
<td>1,289,099</td>
<td>1,437,841</td>
<td>991,614</td>
<td>1,448,507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSU (in dollar amount)</td>
<td>3,281,040</td>
<td>1,545,952</td>
<td>1,724,345</td>
<td>1,189,218</td>
<td>1,248,700</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The company holds annual meetings for shareholders in either April or May every year, the location changes from year to year. The dates, location, and year are listed in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>April 30th 2015</td>
<td>Sheraton Centre Toronto Hotel, 123 Queen Street West, Toronto, ON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 1st 2014</td>
<td>Hyatt Regency Hotel, 655 Burrard St Vancouver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2nd 2013</td>
<td>Trump International Hotel &amp; Tower Toronto, 325 Bay Street, Toronto, ON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2nd 2012</td>
<td>Northern College of Applied Arts &amp; Technology, Porcupine Campus 4715 Highway 101 East South Porcupine, ON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 18th 2011</td>
<td>Vancouver²⁴³</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Given that the people making the decisions are receiving such a huge benefit from running the company the way it is right now, it seems unlikely that they would be willing to change. Other employees could potentially cause a change but as their influence in the company raises so does their income if no major change occurs giving them an economic incentive not to initiate change. People can also be taken off the stock purchase plan, meaning they would lose their stocks and money if the company decided to do this. Putting pressure on a large Corporation through employees will likely get the employees fired and thus they will be much more hurt than the company. As most of the investors of Goldcorp are not located in Latin America but in the U.S, it has been difficult to determine if there have been interactions among shareholders and impacted communities as that information would not have to be public. I was not able to find anything significant in interactions amongst shareholders and impacted communities.
Literature Cited:

A military-backed comedian will be Guatemala’s next President. Activists aren’t laughing, published November 2\textsuperscript{nd} 2015 accessed November 5\textsuperscript{th} 2015


About the ICD." Institute of Corporate Directors -. Web. 5 Oct. 2015.

About NACD." - NACD. Web. 5 Oct. 2015.


https://about.vanguard.com/community-involvement/conserving-resources/.


From the terms of Reference for the Audit Committee ratified by the board on July 30th 2014. Accessed October 5th 2015


From the terms of service for the Governance and Nominating Committee, December 4th 2014 Accessed x October 5th 2015


Germial de industrias extractivas, accessed October 5th 2015


Goldcorp 2014 annual report accessed October 13th 2015

Gold Corp Board, accessed October 3rd 2015


Goldcorp, investor Q&A, accessed October 3rd 2015


Goldcorp management accessed October 3rd 2015


ICD’s about page, accessed October 5th 2015


Lindsay Bigda. A military-backed comedian will be Guatemala's next president. Activists aren’t laughing. The nation.com November 2nd 2015


NACD’s about page, accessed October 5th 2015.


Only Gold; Price of Gold over 200 years. 2015.


The Observatory of Economic Complexity; Guatemala. 2015.


Goldcorp 2014 Sustainability report, accessed October 5th 2015